BOOK REVIEWS

Edna R. Russmann: The Representation of the King in the XXVth Dynasty. Monographies Reine Élisabeth 3. Fondation Égyptologique Reine Élisabeth and The Brooklyn Museum, 1974. 74 pp., 26 figs. on 10 pls. U.S. $ 13.00.

This is an outstanding monograph, as might be expected indeed from the author's previous articles in *The Brooklyn Museum Annual*. Essentially it is a catalogue of the known three-dimensional representations of kings of the twenty-fifth dynasty (none of Kashta or Piy has as yet been identified, nor any of Tanwetamani), but in the event it constitutes an important iconographic study, of vital interest to every scholar concerned with the problems of royal regalia and its intended significance.

The catalogue entries as such occupy about half the book (pp. 45–72), and one of the two introductory sections (pp. 11–24) is a stylistic analysis based upon these. Here one may note in particular the material of the frit head in Boston (p. 52 no. 25 and fig. 22), the dating of the fragmentary faience piece, Cairo CG 760 (p. 53 no. 28 and fig. 23; cf. p. 14, n. 5), and the useful discussion of two other sculptures that have been wrongly attributed in the past — München ÄS 4859 (p. 13, pp. 45–6 no. 2 and fig. 2) and Cairo CG 42010 (p. 14, p. 45 no. 1 and fig. 4; cf. p. 36). That the former is Shabako, with the same features originally as the Louvre head (p. 46 no. 3 and fig. 3) cannot surely be questioned: Müller's fifth dynasty sun-god was never intrinsically probable, and Russmann's arguments, outlined already in *BMA*, X (1968–9), p. 93, are persuasive enough. In the case of the latter (cf. Leclant, *Recherches sur les monuments thébains*, p. 119), the reasons for recognising it as a usurpation are clearly stated, but with some ambiguity over the altered uraeus, which is described in the catalogue entry (p. 45) as 'double (obscuring earlier single?), later converted to single'. In fact, it appears that a fairly broad single uraeus was simply re-cut into two when the statue was taken over for Shabako. As to the king for whom it was made originally I have no firm suggestion to offer, though the mid eighteenth dynasty is a *terminus ante quem non*, and a Ramessid date (mid twentieth dynasty) seems on the whole more probable.

The second part of the introductory discussion (pp. 25–44) deals with the various features of the king's costume and personal ornament, outlining the background of each in considerable detail. The characteristic ram's head amulet, the headdress consisting of four tall plumes, and the use of the solar disc are each treated in context, and there is little to add — except that the last goes back beyond Ramesses II, with whom Uphill believes the royal usage to have begun. Thutmose IV is in fact shown wearing it on an ivory ornament excavated at el-Amarna and now in Berlin (no. 21685; cf. [Kaiser], *Äg. Museum Berlin*, no. 590), and the connection is also implied in some writings of the prenomen of Amenhotpe III. Of more immediate importance, perhaps, is the documentation of the close-fitting Nubian skull-cap, and of the double uraeus (analysed in a forthcoming article). The cap — which seems in one sense to rival the blue crown — is fully described, with the observation that it was always golden in colour, and earlier instances of a similar headdress are then considered, including (p. 30) two fairly explicit representations of thirteenth dynasty date, which may be the oldest known, since the Ashmolean stela (1893.175) showing Senwosret I is probably not contemporary. Apart from these, the first clearly established examples of such a cap are the several cases from the Amarna period, which I have noted elsewhere (*Acta Or.*, XXXV (1973), p. 10, n. 33), but which Russmann omits, perhaps because they are worn by queens. On the other hand, the double uraeus is queenly in origin, as she herself amply demonstrates (p. 39), having disposed effectively of the canopic receptacle heads of Amenhotpe II and Horemheb, the colossus of Ramesses II, and other irrelevant cases alleged from two-dimensional representation. Two unidentified heads of Amarna date are, however, accepted as being Akhenaten, partly, no doubt, because the author was unaware (cf. p. 38, n. 1 and p. 42, n. 2) that the double uraeus is frequently worn by Nefertiti during the earlier part of Akhenaten's reign, and that the heads may therefore as well be she.

These odd lacunae in what is in other respects an excellent survey of the material are a reflection not on the author but on the sources available to her, in that Amarna iconography is as yet insufficiently monitored. It may be no mere coincidence that the close-fitting cap, the double uraeus, the solar disc, and possibly also, though in a different form, the headdress of plumes, were of marked significance both in Amarna contexts and in the Kushite period. Aside from any suggestion of Nubian influence during the closing decades of the eighteenth dynasty, there is considerable evidence that Akhenaten and others were greatly concerned with the theory of solar kingship, believing both that the king, like the sun in his daily aspect, had three hypostases, and that the king was himself a solar hypostasis, properly at a filial level — while in the case of the Kushite kings there is a suggestion of self-identification with the young Horus and other 'juvenile' gods (pp. 42–3). It is just one of the many merits of this enlightening study that it provides a basis for further research into topics of this kind, and one must register gratitude to the author for her exemplary presentation.

J. R. Harris.

R. du Mesnil du Buisson: Nouvelles études sur les dieux et les mythes de Canaan. XXIII et 274 p., avec 133 fig. et 19 pl. (Etudes prélimin. aux religions orient. dans l'Empire romain, t. 33), E. J. Brill, Leide 1973.

L'auteur souligne dans l'Avant-Propos que ce livre doit être considéré comme la suite du volume 14 de la même série, paru sous le titre «Etudes sur les dieux phéniciens hérités par l'empire romain»; si, dans le titre de ce nouveau livre, l'expression «Canaan» est substitutée à celle de «Phéniciens», c'est parce que l'auteur nous renvoie à l'interprétation qu'il avait donnée dans son œuvre en 1970: les deux dénominations sont équivalentes tant du point de vue ethnique que du point de vue de l'histoire religieuse. Mais toutefois, la raison de la préférence de «Canaan», c'est que l'expression recouvre aussi Ras Shamra-Ugarit. Or, comme il ressort de la lecture du livre, les recherches sont basées pour une grande part sur des textes et des découvertes iconographiques provenant d'Ugarit.

Tout comme le livre de 1970 déjà cité, ce livre consiste en une série d'études isolées. La première «Les chemins de l'Occident et la descente vers le Monde inférieur» (p. 1–31) traite de la représentation cosmographique au Proche-Orient du séjour des morts et de la source universelle, ainsi que de la situation dans le cosmos, de la terre, du soleil et des étoiles par rapport au séjour des morts et de la source universelle. L'étude est plus particulièrement centrée sur la Babylonie, Canaan et l'Egypte. L'auteur y traite le thème qui y occupe une place prédominante, tant dans le reste du livre que dans «Etudes sur les dieux phéniciens etc.»: la représentation, dans la mythologie cananéo-phénicienne, de l'étoile du matin et de l'étoile du soir, respectivement 'Aṯtar et 'Aṯtart; c'est à l'aurore et au début du jour que disparaît 'Aṯtar, l'étoile du matin, tandis que le soir, le jour est attaqué par la victorieuse étoile du soir, 'Aṯtart, époux de l'étoile du matin. L'auteur retrouve ce motif reproduit de façon différente dans l'iconographie proche-orientale, de la Perse au nord-est de Babylone en passant par les Hittites et les Hourrites jusqu'à la région cananéo-phénicienne.

La deuxième étude est la réédition, augmentée et revue, de l'article de l'auteur paru dans la «Rev. de l'Hist. des Religions», 164, 1963, p. 133–163, sous le titre: «Origine et évolution du panthéon de Tyr». Cette étude, de par sa nature et son contenu, est parallèle à celle du panthéon de Byblos que l'on grouve dans «Etudes sur les dieux phéniciens», p. 56 ss.

L'étude suivante «Les livres de Thot et l'enseignement de la philosophie hermétique dans le temple de Tyr aux époques hellénistique et romaine», traite de différents noms de dieux dans les textes de Philon de Byblos. Il semble quelque peu étonnant que l'auteur ne cite pas le travail effectué par O. Eissfeldt sur ces problèmes dans «Taautos und Sanchunjaton» (1952).

«L'origine orientale des Dioscures Shaḥar et Shalim» (p. 80–166) est la plus grande étude du livre. L'auteur y étaie l'identité, déjà soulignée par Th. H. Gaster, Journ. of the Americ. Soc., 66, 1946, entre les dieux Shaḥar — Shalim et les Dioscures que l'on trouve dans le texte ugaritique «La naissance des dieux gracieux et beaux». R. du Mesnil du Buisson avance l'hypothèse que la scène de l'action, dans ce texte ugaritique, a été le Temple aux obélisques à Byblos. Cependant, ce qui rend cette étude si précieuse, c'est moins cette hypothèse que l'examen de la riche documentation iconographique concernant Shaḥar-Shalim et les Dioscures.

Dans l'étude suivante «Les ivoires du Palais royal de Ras Shamra du Musée de Damas» (p. 167–200) l'auteur veut établir une relation entre Byblos et Ugarit à l'aide du relief en ivoire trouvé dans ce dernier lieu en 1952. L'un des personnages importants de ce panneau est identifié à un roi de Byblos, adorateur de Hathor, la Ba'alat égyptienne de Byblos; l'autre panneau représenterait des membres de la dynastie ugaritique adorant Hathor, représentée en train d'allaiter deux garçons. L'auteur a tendance à identifier ces deux derniers à Shaḥar-Shalim.

L'étude suivante «Le mythe de la planète Vénus dans des bronzes du Luristan» traite à nouveau le thème précédemment cité: le combat entre l'étoile du matin et l'étoile du soir, et le jour. C'est le même thème que l'on retrouve dans la dernière étude du livre, p. 241–250: «Note sur un sceau de Shaushshatar, roi du Mitani, vers 1450 av. J.-C.»

L'avant-dernière étude est consacrée au dieu phénicien Ṣid (Sardus Pater) et à Babi, le serpent du Paradis connu de l'Egypte, étude effectuée sur la base de nouvelles découvertes puniques provenant de Antas en Sardaigne. Les textes puniques en provenant établissent une relation entre Ṣid et le nom באבי ou בבי, tout comme sur un anneau trouvé au même endroit se trouve l'inscription latine: Sid(ia) Babi, sous le dessin d'un serpent.

Les thèmes du livre sont très vastes et, pour cette seule raison, il semble inévitable de trouver des domaines où l'argumentation de l'auteur manque de bases solides; cela vaut pour l'emploi de textes ugaritiques où, parfois, la traduction de l'auteur ou bien est douteuse ou bien ne représente qu' une seule possibilité parmi plusieurs autres. Par exemple, la traduction p. 20–21 de I AB, col. IV, 25 s., où le mot «'nt» pourrait tout aussi bien être traduit par «sources». La traduction p. 83–84 de «dgy rbt aṯrt ym» dans II AB, col. II, 31, où l'auteur prend «dgy» comme épithète de Aṯirat semble tout à fait incomprise. Le rapport établi avec le texte V AB, F, 10–11 prouverait certainement que «dgy» est ici parallèle au serviteur d'Aṯirat, Qdš w Amrr, donc épithète du serviteur. Il nous semble aussi un peu audacieux d'essayer de mettre en relation (p. 107) Shaḥar — Shalim et l'Orient du ciel sur la seule base du texte BH, I, 7–8, texte très fragmentaire.

Du nouveau livre de R. du Mesnil du Buisson, on peut dire, en résumé, que, si l'on prend en considération les thèmes des études, il s'accorde bien à son prédécesseur dans la série; les deux ouvrages sont particulièrement bien documentés, tant du point de vue littérature que du point de vue de leur riche documentation iconographique.

O. Hvidberg-Hansen, Université d'Aarhus.

Lars Johanson: Aspekt im Türkischen. Vorstudien zu einer Beschreibung des Türkeitürkischen Aspektsystem. Acta Universitatis Upsaliensis, Studia Turcica Upsaliensia 1, Uppsala 1971, 334 pp.

To begin with, the reviewer feels it his duty to say that he is writing about a book, which he did not quite understand. The reason for this may consist in the characteristics of the work as well as in the reviewer's intellectual insufficiency. The work by Lars Johanson presents plenty of data concerning the temporal units, and a systematic interpretation especially of their semantic level. It summarizes and criticizes opinions of and attitudes to the problem of aspect found in general as well as in turkological literature. The work is mainly concerned with the finite verbal forms, though many interesting observations of the nominal forms of the verbs are presented, too. The author's effort is directed toward systematization on the basis of the opposition of semantic features. In this review we will try to reproduce the author's main ideas without any pretension at completeness. In the complicated structure of the work digressions could be found, anticipating our remarks or directed against such simplifying presentations. A comprehensive and useful interpretation of the author's ideas is presented in Even Hovdhaugen's review of the book (Norwegian Journal of Linguistics, vol. 26, num. 1/1972, p. 99–108).

The following four ideas, proper to the semantics of the described forms, are directly connected with the aspect: The A-idea, called "Intraterminalität", expresses an action without regard to its initial and final point. This feature is characteristic of the suffixes *iyordu, irdi, mekteydi* in opposition to *di.*

The B-idea is "Prägnanz", which means the maximal concentration on action, on its maximum of intensity. It characterizes the suffixes *iyor(du)* and *mektey(di)*, while *irdi* is rather neutral in this respect.

The C-idea, "Postterminalität", is an expression of that point of an action which has already passed over. The point may lie in different phases of the action with regard to the type of the verb. This feature characterizes the suffix *miş*, (having, according to the author, no inferential meaning, this being present in *imiş*, only) in opposition to *di.*

The D-idea, "Diagnostizierung" is defined as neutralization of the A-idea. The feature is characteristic, e.g., of the suffix *miştir* in opposition to *miş*.

These ideas characterize the entire set of "temporal" suffixes. They are combined with their temporal meanings. The tunc-idea is defined as an exclusion of actuality ("Abschaltung des Aktuellen"), as a temporal or in another way definable abstraction from the nearest reality. The reason for the introduction of the tunc notion is the different modal usage of the past forms. As the opposition to tunc, the nunc-idea is introduced. The tunc-idea includes two aspects: a historical one, not taking into account actions following the action described, and a diagnostical one, expressing a relation to a point following the action. Consequently, the suffixes *iyor, ir mekte(dir)* are nunc, *iyordu, irdi, mekteydi* are tunc. As a part of *iyordu*, the *di* expresses anteriority in relation to the present time; as a part of *mişti* the same suffix expresses the relation to the past. The suffix *di* is an expression of the diagnostical idea in relation to the presence, while *diydi* is an expression of the historical aspect.

The "temporal" suffixes and their meanings are related by the author with the semantics of the verbal stems in the following way: An assumption of "finaltransformative" lexemes (Tf) is formulated. They express actions the realization of which cannot be regarded as completed until these actions have reached a certain final point or an evolutional climax. Nf is a category of the non-Tf lexemes. To obtain two classes of verbal lexemes, the following formula is presented, where x is the lexeme tested:

"x-di mi ?"	"Did he x?"
"Evet, x-di, ve hâlâ x-iyor."	"Yes, he did x, and he is also now x-ing."

The lexemes which cannot be substituted into this formula without a quantitative change of the meaning ("Umdeutung") form class I (e.g. *getir-* "to bring", *öl-* "to die"). Class II is formed by lexemes which are substitutable without any limiting valuation ("Bestimmung"), (e.g. *duy-* "to feel, to hear", *yürü-* "to go"). The quantitative change of the meaning (ser) and the limiting valuation (lim) transform the categories according to the following schemes:

$$\text{Class I} \rightarrow \text{ser} < \begin{matrix} - \rightarrow \text{Tf} \\ + \rightarrow \text{Nf} \end{matrix}$$

$$\text{Class II} \rightarrow \text{lim} < \begin{matrix} + \rightarrow \text{Tf} \\ - \rightarrow \text{Nf} \end{matrix}$$

The further analysis of the aspectual oppositions is based on these categories. For example, a verbal form characterized by the symbol Tf/a (where *a* is the feature defined by A-idea) expresses an action tending to its climax or final point, while Tf/non-a indicates a form expressing an action, the climax of which has already been reached. The set of combinations of the defined categories covers the semantic level of the Turkish verb.

While the ideas A, B, C and D as well as the temporal characterization correspond to the intuitive evaluation of the presented examples, and their definitions in terms of oppositions seem to be formally correct on a level sufficiently high for contemporary semantics, the same can hardly be said about the above-mentioned classification of the verbal lexemes. Each introduction of a semantic category into theory which is defined intuitively is a mere norm of language correctness rather than a description.

Why, for example, the verb *öl-* cannot be used in a context given by the quoted formula without the quantitative "Umdeutung"? Let us suppose that this utterance has been made by a doctor and that the subject of the utterance is a patient who has clinically died. The reviewer apologizes for this sort of argument, but there seems to be no fact admitting an unambiguous a priori introduction of the semantic classes and categories defined semantically. The criticism leads, then, to seeking contextual situations, in which everything originally proclaimed to be impossible or unlogical appears possible and logical. Such classes and the objectivity of their existence is usually proved with the help of the terms of semantic compatibility and incompatibility, but there is no reason for linguists to take "round squares" and "green ideas" as nonsense and to reduce the set of all possible utterances in such a way.

The author's standpoint of not applying the principles of one language system to another one is doubtlessly to be welcomed. For a turkologist, whose mother tongue is a Slavonic language — in this case Czech — and who was convinced that the Turkish verbal system had no systematic aspectual features, it was extremely interesting to become acquainted with the author's results. As has been pointed out above, these results are convincing, and it is evident that the Turkish aspect has little in common with the Slavonic aspects ("vidy").

What is then to be understood under the notion of aspect? In the reviewed book it is characterized as a feature of the units being the means of a subjective representation of objective phenomena (e.g. on p. 109). Not as a linguist, but as a mere informant the reviewer is inclined to say that this characterization does not fit the Czech aspectual system. Thus the range of validity of some of the author's polemics with certain other authors becomes narrower. The characterization itself, regardless of its validity for different language systems, seems to be too vague.

Our remarks, which are rather vague and presented in a subjective way, are not intended to decrease the value of Johanson's work that is full of extremely useful interpretations and which represents a serious attempt at formalisation on the semantic level. What seems to be a real problem of the work reviewed, is a systematization in the presentation of the matter. This is, however, not easy, but it is inevitable, if the author does not wish to evoke in his reader's mind a sort of inferiority.

Prague L. Hřebíček.

Agâh Sırrı Levend: Türk Edebiyatı Tarihi [The History of Turkish Literature]. I. Cilt, Giriş [Introduction]. XXIV + 666 pp. Türk Tarih Kurumu Yayınlarından, VIII. Seri, Sa. 18, Ankara 1973.

This is the first volume of a monumental work which when completed will undoubtedly be one of the most important in the field of Turkology. Six volumes are planned and, in addition, an anthology of four volumes, all written in Turkish. The style of writing presents the reader with no easy task with its "encyclopedia" of facts, names and details.

Judging from the first volume, this work will become indispensable to serious students of Turkish literary history. The need for such a contribution has been felt for a long time.

A. S. Levend is one of the leading scholars of Turkish literature, especially of its classical Islamic phase, with his deep understanding of its spirit, imagery, allusions and language. His volumes dealing with the classical literature, a subject currently neglected by others, will constitute the most attractive part of his work for many readers. He has been active in the field of Turkish literary and philological studies since the 1920's, has collected an immense amount of material, published many books and articles, and has had a long pedagogical experience. All this was a prelude to this now-in-preparation voluminous study.

The author discusses some of the difficulties inherent in writing a history of Turkish literature. One of them is determining its scope. If the literary historian wants to cover the entire development of Turkic literatures, he has to deal with a long period of time, a vast geographical area, many national and political entities, and various cultures with differing scriptures and literary languages. On the other hand, it is generally inadequate to trace the history of only one of the present national literatures in isolation from the entire development. Levend chose to start with a broad scope (the old Turkic civilizations), gradually narrowing it mainly to the Ottoman Empire and to modern Turkey to the 1960's including, in part, the Azeri and Chaghatai areas. His work will not only deal with literary history but also cultural history in a broad sense. He will not overlook the folk literature as prior historians tended to do. He will also include the development of different Turkic literary languages of the older period.

In the case of the Ottoman culture it is difficult to establish the boundaries of its national literature. The author accepts the usual language criterion, nevertheless regarding the works of those Turks using Arabic and Persian as also being contributions to the Turkish culture.

Among other problems dealt with are: determining the main tasks of Turkish literary history with its specific aspects concerning, for example, originality, translation and imitation (viewed differently by the Eastern tradition than viewed today); dividing Turkic literary development into periods (the author's main divisions being pre-Islamic, Islamic, and that of Western influence); and showing the stratifications of the old societies and their reflections in the literature. A classification of the Turkic languages is also provided.

The second part of the book gives a description of the genres of the classical literature and names the scripts that represent those genres.

The third part surveys the Arabic and Persian literatures and their genres, most useful considering the importance of these literatures for understanding the Islamic Turkic literatures.

The fourth and most comprehensive part of the volume enumerates and details the sources for the studies of classical Turkish literature and, in part, the periods following after that. The sources for the ancient period and additional sources for more recent periods will be given later when those periods are discussed. We find here the result of an intensive life-long effort to collect materials, particularly on the classical literature. It is an elaborate and unique account of the original records regarding the writers and their works. The most important are the "tezkire", something like biographical dictionaries about the poets from both the Ottoman and Chaghatai areas. Many "tezkire" are given with detailed listings of the poets included. Registered are bibliographical accounts of persons in special groups including Sultans, Grand Viziers, Şeyhulislams, caligraphs, musicians, scholars, important persons coming from the palace school (Enderun) and from the provinces of the Ottoman Empire, and prominent members of the dervish orders and the "saints" (evliya). This registry has significance for literary studies since many of the persons referred to were also engaged in writing. Attention is given to the Ottoman chronicles (tarih) as sources for studying the history of literature. Further listed are, from the later period, library catalogs, biographical, bibliographical, literary historical and encyclopedic works.

The reader finds a wealth of information even in the footnotes and in the many bibliographies throughout the book and a comprehensive index at the end. In accordance with present Turkish usage names and terms from the Ottoman period are written in the modern orthography, but the texts as well as the names of Arabs and Persians are written in transcription. Consistent with his philological efforts, Levend throughout avoids using non-Turkish words (except for the terminology).

In addition to the vast amount of knowledge presented, this first volume is valuable in preparing the reader for the volumes to come. Completion of this scholarly work will be a landmark in Turkology.

Jitka Zamrazilová-Weltman.

Talât Sait Halman (Sp. Ed.): Turkey: From Empire to Nation. Review of National Literature (Series Ed.: Anne Paolucci), Vol. IV, No. 1, Spring 1973, 142 pp. St. John's University, New York 1973.

This issue of *Review of National Literature,* a periodical for literary and comparative study, was prepared for the 50 years' anniversary of the Turkish Republic in 1923. Editor Talât S. Halman expresses the aim of this compilation of essays by specialists on Turkish literature as follows:

"This special issue of the *Review of National Literatures* does not follow an essentially historical approach, for its object is to present the Turkish literary legacy in the way most apt to reveal its vitality for English-speaking teachers and literary scholars." (p. 29). He states further that some of the included articles focus primarily on genres (Metin And: "Origins and Early Development of the Turkish Theater", p. 53–64; Bedia Turgay-Ahmad: "Modern Turkish Theater", p. 65–81), some on themes (Süheyla Artemel: " 'Turkish' Imagery in Elizabethan Drama", p. 82–98; İlhan Başgöz: "Love Themes in Turkish Folk Poetry", p. 99–114), while the rest "serve to provide perspectives of Turkish literary culture as a whole, from diverse more or less specialized vantage points, for the nonspecialist readers of the *Review*" (Kathleen Burrill: "Modern Turkish Literature", p. 13–26; Talât S. Halman: "The Ancient and Ottoman Legacy", p. 27–52, John R. Walsh: "Turkey: Bibliographical spectrum", p. 115–132; and Richard C. Clark: "Review Article: Is Ottoman Literature Turkish Literature?" p. 133–142).

Among other things, Prof. M. And's informative, concentrated article shows how ancient Greek and other old-Anatolian traditions suprisingly continue to live in contemporary Turkish peasant plays. Mrs. B. Turgay-Ahmad brings the reader up to date on recent developments in the Turkish theater. Though S. Artemel's essay does not belong to the field of Turkish literary history, it helps fulfil the publication's aim. Prof. İ. Başgöz gives a general survey of Turkish folk literature in addition to his well presented central theme of love in Turkish folk poetry.

The other, more general, essays overlap each other to some degree, although Prof. K. Burrill focuses on the modern period while Prof. J. R. Walsh and Prof. T. S. Halman emphasize the older periods. Prof. Halman's essay is noteworthy for its emphasis on the underlying continuity running throughout the historical development of Turkish culture, finding it mostly in the unique processes of creative syntheses of multi-cultural elements. Prof. R. C. Clark's contribution discusses various viewpoints regarding Ottoman literature.

This issue of the *Review* undoubtedly performs a worthwhile service to the popularization of Turkish literature for the Western literary public.

Jitka Zamrazilová-Weltman.

Bengt Knutsson: Studies in the text and language of three Syriac-Arabic versions of the Book of Judicum with special reference to the Middle Arabic elements. Introduction, linguistic notes, texts. Leiden 1974. LVI, 332 S. (Diss. Lund).

Mit diesen Studien der arabischen Bibel führt Verf. eine schwedische Tradition weiter, nach O. Löfgren's *Studien zu den arabischen Danielübersetzungen* (1936) und B. Levin's *Die griechisch-arabische Evangelienübersetzung* (1938), welche beide in der vorliegenden Arbeit oft zitiert werden.

Das Buch besteht aus drei Abschnitten: (1) Verzeichnis und Beschreibungen der arabischen Hss. zum arabischen Buch der Richter; (2) die sprachlichen Besonderheiten der Hss.; (3) eine Edition der Texte von drei Versionen des arabischen Richterbuches und einer 1671 gedruckten Edition.

Aus dem sorgfältig zusammengestellten Verzeichnis von 22 Hss. geht hervor, dass eine Kairiner Hs. dem Verf. unzugänglich war, und dass von den übrigen Hss. zwei auf LXX und die restlichen auf Peš. zurückgehen. Keine bisher unbekannten Hss. sind angetroffen worden, aber das Verzeichnis in G. Graf's *Geschichte der christlichen arabischen Literatur* wurde mit drei von Graf übersehenen Hss. ergänzt, und es gelang dem Verf., die Lakune in einer Pariser Hs. mit einem Fragment aus Kopenhagen auszufüllen. Die Beschreibungen der Hss. sind ausführlich und geben auch Anfang und Schluss wieder. Einige unverständliche Schreibungen im Text wären lieber mit Punkten ersetzt und das Schriftbild in eine Fussnote verwiesen worden. Für eins dieser Wörter, S. 21 Fn. 5, wäre es vielleicht möglich, eine Lesung vorzuschlagen: *wa-l-ma'âna* (Hs. A schreibt mit *madda*), das mit syr. *mânâ* „Ausrüstung" (Geräte, Waffe, Kleidung), pers. *mâna* „Haushaltsausrüstung" und arab. *ma'ûna* zusammengestellt werden könnte, als Parallel zu dem bekennten Koranwort *rizq*, was hier mit *faḍl*, Gottes Freigebigkeit, gut passen würde.

Die Zusammengehörigkeit der verschiedenen Hss. wird summarisch und unübersichtlich erörtert — man vermisst ein Stemma. Für die Verteilung der Hss. auf drei Versionen werden wenig Belege angeführt, statt dessen wird auf eine später zu erscheinende Arbeit verwiesen.

Der grösste Abschnitt behandelt die Sprache der arabischen Hss. Die Sprache wird „Mittelarabisch" genannt, dieser Ausdruck aber recht uneinheitlich benutzt. Einmal ist von „mittelarabischen Texten" die Rede, welche eine „Mischung des klassischen Arabisch und des Dialekts" darstellen (S. XI), ein anderes Mal aber handelt es sich um mittelarabische Züge, die man aus Texten sammelt, die nun „in einer Mischung von klassischem Arabisch und Mittelarabisch" geschrieben sind (S. 43). Also ist Mittelarabisch = Dialekt, und man kann nicht von „Schriftstücken, die auf mittelarabisch abgefasst sind" reden.

Warum werden nun diese dialektalen Züge „mittelarabisch" genannt? Verf. benügt sich (S. 41 f., Fn. 6) damit, die Argumente in J. Blau's *Grammar of Christian Arabic* zu zitieren. Blau hatte offensichtlich das Gefühl, diese Benennung sei nicht ganz gelungen, und wollte sie folgendermassen verteidigen:

(1) Mittelarabisch gebe es in der Regel in literarischen Texten von kultureller Bedeutung — modernes Arabisch sei kein literarisches Medium und ohne kulturelle Bedeutung. Aber mit dieser Definition wären z. B. Saᶜîd ᶜAqls Gedichte, eine Reihe von ägyptischen Theaterstücken und die ganze maltesische Literatur mittelarabisch, und wozu gehörte die Zağal-Dichtung von Ibn Quzmân under anderen?

(2) Das Mittelarabische sei nur in gewissen Zügen in den Texten erhalten — die modernen Dialekte seien uns ganz zugänglich. Hätten wir also das Glück, einen Text aufzufinden, der ganz auf mittelarabisch ohne jede klassische Züge geschrieben wäre und uns ein vollständiges Bild des Mittelarabischen gebe — dann hörte das Mittelarabische auf, mittelarabisch zu sein. Oder umgekehrt: isolierte arabische Dialekte, welche aussterben, ohne näher untersucht zu sein, würden mittelarabisch werden?

(3) Mittelarabische Dialekte seien analytisch, wie die modernen Dialekte — die Beduinendialekte wären synthetisch. Das wäre eher ein Argument für eine gemeinsame Bezeichnung für mittelarabische und moderne Dialekte und eine besondere Bezeichnung für die synthetischen Beduinendialekte. Nun wissen wir aber nicht, ob die Beduinendialekte synthetisch waren. Verf. behauptet das, auch S. 40 f., offensichtlich nach Fück und Blau aber ohne Argumente und ohne Hinweise auf die Diskussion,

in welcher gegen diese These angeführt wurde, dass die arabischen Philologen, wenn sie die Beduinen befragten, ihre Dichtersprache, nicht ihre Umgangssprache hören wollten und uns auch nur jene bewahrt haben (J. Blau, JSS 8/1 1963:42–51, ders., *Emergence and linguistic background of Judaeo-Arabic*, Oxford 1965, 3, 8; ders., *On pseudo-corrections in some Semitic languages*, Jerusalem 1970, 56 f.; dagegen H. Wehr, ZDMG 102/1952:183 f., F. Rosenthal, Orientalia 22/1953:309 f., A. Spitaler, BiOr 10/1953:146, B. Lewin, Oriens 7/1954:131 f.; W. Diem, ZDMG 123/1973:227–237, zeigt wie der nabatäische Dialekt schon im ersten Jahrhundert v. Chr. das Kasussystem aufgegeben hat, und zieht den Schluss, dass diese Entwicklung schon vor dem 7. Jahrhundert von allen arabischen Dialekten mitgemacht worden sein muss).

Sind also diese Argumente für den Gebrauch des Ausdruckes „Mittelarabisch" wenig überzeugend, könnten vielleicht andere herangezogen werden, z.B. dass die mittelarabischen Züge eine ältere Stufe vertreten als die modernen Dialekte, oder dass der Unterschied darin bestünde, dass die mittelarabischen Züge unabsichtlich in die Texte sich hineingeschlichen hätten. Weder das eine noch das andere ist näher untersucht worden.

Wollen wir uns aber doch nicht mit „dialektalen Zügen" begnügen, fragt es sich, ob „mittelarabisch" eine glücklich gewählte Bezeichnung ist. Unter „mittel-" versteht man etwas was zwischen zwei anderen liegt. Aber was liegt an den beiden Seiten des Mittelarabischen? Es kann nicht klassisches Arabisch einerseits und Dialekt andereseits sein, denn Mittelarabisch ist ja Dialekt.

Verf. sagt (S. 44) mit einem Zitat von Blau, Mittelarabisch sei „a missing link" zwischen klassischem Arabisch und modernen arabischen Dialekten. Das Schwergewicht müsste dann auf „modernen" liegen, aber dann bleibt noch übrig, einen Unterschied zwischen modernen und mittelarabischen Dialekten zu zeigen, der dann auch mit dem Unterschied zwischen klassischem Arabisch und Mittelarabisch einigermassen vergleichbar sein sollte, wenn man von einer Mittelstufe reden wollte. Die Ausdrücke „Mittelarabisch" und „missing link" geben den Eindruck, die modernen Dialekte sollten über das Mittelarabische von dem klassischen Arabisch stammen. Fücks These, das klassische

Arabisch sollte in der Eroberungszeit durch den Kontakt mit anderen Sprachen mehr analytischen Charakters seinen synthetischen Charakter verloren haben, was die Entstehung der modernen Dialekte veranlasst haben sollte — eine These, die Verf. ohne weitere Diskussion wiedergibt — ist nicht unbestritten geblieben (Wehr, a.a.O. 179 f., Rosenthal a.a.O. 309 f., Lewin a.a.O. 133). Es bleiben also kaum mehr als die beiden: klassisches Arabisch und arabische Dialekte. Beide können verschiedentlich eingeteilt werden, aber zwischen ihnen gibt es nichts — dafür gibt es Texte, welche beide enthalten.

Ehe ich auf die Einzelheiten im sprachlichen Abschnitt eingehe, möchte ich zu S. 39, wo *al-ǧâhilîya* mit „the age of ignorance" wiedergegeben wird, eine Bemerkung machen: Auch wenn *ǧahl* als Gegensatz zu *ᶜilm* aufgefasst wird, handelt es sich um mangelnde Kenntnis von Gott und Muhammeds Botschaft, nicht um mangelnde Kenntnis im allgemeinen, wie der Zusammenstellung hier mit der Isolierung der Araber von der Aussenwelt zu entnehnen wäre (für eine neue Deutung des Begriffes *ǧâhilîya* als kollektiver Plural s. F. Rosenthal, *Knowledge triumphant,* Leiden 1970, 32 ff.). Was die behauptete Isolierung betrifft, möchte ich nur auf die regen Verbindungen verweisen, welche die Araber schon seit Jahrhunderten mit der Umwelt hatten, sei es politisch, wenn sie an dem Machtkampf zwischen Byzanz und dem Perserreich teilnahmen, sei es ökonomisch durch die Karawanenwege, welche die Halbinsel durchkreuzten, sei es religiös durch die Christen und die Juden, sei es kulturell durch die Einflüsse von Rom, Byzanz, Alexandria, Antiokia, Gondêšâpûr, welche Inschriften, Lehnwörter im Koran und in der alten Poesie und die Anfänge der islamischen Kultur und Wissenschaften hervorgebracht haben.

Der grammatische Abschnitt beginnt mit einem Kapitel über Orthographie und Phonetik. S. 53 begegnet die zweifelhafte Angabe, *wa-* „und" könnte mit *alif* für *â* geschreiben werden, was nur mit einem Beispiel gestützt wird. Normal wird *alif* nach *wâw* geschrieben, um anzugeben, dass es sich eben nicht um die Konjunktion handelt. Wahrscheinlicher ist, dass der Imperativ *taqaṭṭaᶜ*, der zwischen Imperativen mit *alif al-waṣla* steht (*wa-hdim, wa-bni*), auch *alif al-waṣla* bekommen hat (vgl. *ifraḥ* *wa-surra*, geschrieben اوحرواسر, J. Blau, *Grammar of Christian Arabic* 161 Fn. 87), umsomehr als es wahrscheinlich *wa-tqaṭṭa^c* (wie *wa-hdim* und *wa-bni*) ausgesprochen wurde, als der kurze Vokal in der offenen unbetonten Silbe ausfiel (Beispiele von Imperativen in dem V. Stamm mit prosthetischem *alif* in J. Blau, *Emergence* 70).

Ebenso befremdend wirkt die Behauptung (S. 60 Fn. 3), *-û-* oder *-u'-* könnte in dem IV. Stamm der Wurzel 'MN mit *alif* geschrieben werden. Wahrscheinlicher ist hier — nach dem II. Stamm *yusallimûna* (von *salâm*) — *yu'amminûhum* (von *amân*). In dem II. Stamm ist das Präfix unbetont, das *u*-Haltige nicht so hervortretend und auch nicht nötig, weil auch ohne *u* klar ist, welcher Stamm gemeint ist: *y^e'amm^{e}nûhum* mit *alif* nach dem Präfix. Erst am Ende der Fussnote wird angedeutet, dass der II. Stamm möglich sein könnte.

Die Übersicht über das Vorkommen bzw. Fehlen von *hamza*, auch in der Form von Tabellen, stellt etwas Neues dar, und für die öfter vorkommenden Wörter *ra'îs* und *Isrâ'îl* ist das Material gross genug, um Schlüsse zu erlauben (S. 73). Der folgende grosse Abschnitt über *ṯâ* und *ḏâl* gehört methodisch zu den besten Abschnitten des Buches und erlaubt dem Verf. gewisse Schlüsse zu ziehen, die mit einem grossen statistischen Material überzeugend gestützt werden (S. 87 ff.).

In dem Ausdruck *râs wa-salîṭan* (S. 104 Fn. 1) hat von den beiden Objekten nur das letzte die Akkusativendung. Wird der Ausdruck hier nicht als ein einziger Begriff, ein Kompositum, aufgefasst? Es gibt auch Ausdrücke mit Hauptwort und Attribut, von denen nur letzteres im Akk. steht: *kâna ǧabbâr qawîyan* (S. 164 ohne weiteren Kommentar; vgl. al-Hamdânî, *K. al-Ǧauharatain*, Uppsala 1968, 32 b *kâna lahu qidr ṣaġîran*, Kopistenfehler), und Präpositionsausdrücke im Akk., wie *ba^{c}da ayyâman*, wohl als Kompositum im adverbiellen Akk. aufgefasst, wie nach *lastu* das ganze *bi-ḫâriǧ* als Prädikat aufgefasst wird und im Akk. steht: *lastu bi-ḫâriǧan* (S. 166), oder wie noch in Version I 6:19 *ṣâ^{c}an min daqîq faṭîran* (S. 248; vgl. al-Hamdânî, *K. al-Ǧauharatain* 60 b *kâna . . . abyaḍ wa-ilâ t-taurîdan wa-^{c}alikan*).

S. 167 f. handeln über das innere Objekt, wenn es vor dem Verbum steht. Das *fa-*, das in einem Fall auf das innere Objekt folgt, ist eher mit dem *fa-* zu vergleichen, das nach dem vorangestellten direkten Objekt steht, wie z.B. Sura 74:3 *wa-rabbaka fa-kabbir*, oder das nach einem längeren Subjekt folgt: Hss. CE bzw. F 1:16 *wa Banû Qain ḫatan Mûsâ wa-/fa-ṣaᶜadû* (S. 240; für *fa-* und *wa-* nach vorangestellten Präpositionsausdrükken und Adverbien s. C. Brockelmann, *Grundriss* 2:442; ein Beispiel aus der modernen Literatur *la'yan wa-tabayyannâ* „mit Mühe sahen wir", Nâzik al-Malâ'ika, *Qarârat al-mauǧa*, Beirut 1971, 47).

Die Umschreibung des Genetivs wird nicht behandelt, aber ein Beispiel liefert Hs. G 1:15 *sâqiya min mâ'* statt *sâqiyat mâ'* in den übrigen Hss. (S. 240).

Das ein vorangestelltes Pronomen nicht nur ein Wort sondern den ganzen Satz vorgreifen kann (*ḍamîr as-ša'n*) wird S. 172 f. nicht berücksichtigt. So erklärt sich der scheinbare Gegensatz in Fn. 8 *huwa rûḥ ar-rabb* . . . : *huwa* bezieht sich nicht auf das femin. *rûḥ* sondern auf den ganzen Satz.

In der Aufstellung und Behandlung des Materials folgt Verf. J. Blaus *Grammar of Christian Arabic*, ausser in bezug auf *ḥaiṯu* als temporale Konjunktion (S. 183) — nach Blau (*Grammar* 509) sind Sätze mit *ḥaiṯu ḥâl*-Sätze. H. Reckendorf hat viele Beispiele von temporalem *ḥaiṯu* (*Syntaktische Verhältnisse* 14, 659 f., und *Arabische Syntax* 471), und *ilâ ḥaiṯu* „jusqu'à ce que" wird von S. Kussaim (Muséon 81/1968:14) zitiert aus einem ägyptischen christlichen Text nach einer Hs. aus dem 14. Jh.

Nach dem Lesen dieser Materialsammlung fragt man sich, ob Verf. nicht auch in dem morphologischen Abschnitt die Methode hätte benutzen können, die er für die Schreibungen mit bzw. ohne *hamza* und mit *tâ* und *dâl* bzw. *ṯâ* und *ḏâl* verwendet hat. Ein Ansatz ist da, wenn Verf. manchmal angibt, wie oft eine Erscheinung vorkommt, z.B. wie oft die äussere Pluralendung *-îna* statt des klassischen *-ûna* ist, oder Impf. P. *iû* statt *-ûna*, oder wie oft die Akkusativendung fehlt. Aber wir erfahren nicht, wie oft die äussere Pluralendung *-ûna* heisst, ob *-ûna* von *-îna* praktisch verdrängt worden ist, oder ob *-ûna* immer noch die Regel und *-îna* eine Ausnahme ist. Mit anderen Worten: man vermisst eine Analyse von dem Verhältniz zwischen klassischen und dialektalen Formen, die gezeigt hätte, wie stark die dialektale Prägung ist. Eine andere Frage wäre, welche von den sprachlichen Eigenheiten auf die Übersetzer zurückgehen, und welche die Kopisten beigesteuert haben. Auch eine Diskussion über das Verhältnis zwischen den sprachlichen Eigenheiten und der Provenienz der Hss. wäre vielleicht aufschlussreich gewesen. Selten sind Überwägungen, welche Erscheinungen dem Character des Textes als Übersetzung zuzuschreiben wären. Ein Problem, dass auch nicht angeschnitten wird, liegt darin, dass wir die klassische Norm, gegen welche die Abweichungen zu beurteilen sind, nur ungenügend kennen. Das Bild des klassischen Arabisch haben uns arabische und abendländische Grammatiker gezeichnet, hauptsächlich nach der Sprache des Korans und der alten Poesie, aber stimmt dieses Bild auch mit der Wirklichkeit der klassischen Prosatexte überein? — diese Texte selbst sind bischer grammatisch ungenügend ausgewertet worden (mit Ausnahme gewisser Einzelheiten, die das WKAS behandelt; Biespiele der mangelnden Übereinstimmung der Theorie mit der Wirklichkeit zeigt M. Ullmann, *Untersuchungen zur Rağazpoesie,* 1966, 78 Fn. 4, 227 ff.).

Sodann einige Bemerkungen zum lexikalischen Abschnitt, der auf S. 184 beginnt. S. 185 unten möchte ich eher *ğarîn* lesen als Nebenform zu *ğarîn* (Lane s. v.). *Abaidar* ist mir zweifelhaft — ein prosthetisches *alif* hat doch hier keine Funktion — ist nicht eher *andar* zu lesen, aus *edd*^{e}*râ* des syr. Textes (S. Fraenkel, *Aramäische Fremdwörter* 136)? Dieselbe Hs. 236 hat auch auf der anderen Stelle 6:11 *ğât* für Peš. *gat* und nicht *baidar*. Prosthetisches *alif,* das sonst nicht behandelt wird, möchte man aber in dem letzten Wort Hs. E 1:17 *iḤrâmâ* < *Ḥrâmâ* < *Ḥirâmâ* sehen.

S. 191 *safûr* stellt kaum Defektivschreibung eines *â* dar sondern die wirkliche Aussprache des *a* in der offenen unbetonten Silbe vor der langen betonten (Brockelmann, *Grundriss* 1:75 unten). Die Wurzeln SFR und ṢFR sind natürlich nicht verwandt (Vögel pfeifen nicht in Hörner).

S. 193 unten wird *ṣayyara* Hs. C 6:19,20 = *ṣabba* in den übringen Hss. der Version I „ausgiessen" erwähnt aber nicht *ṣarrafa,* wie Verf. in Vers. II Hs. 236 6:20 liest (Hs. *ḍrb*): denominiert vom Obj. *aṣ-ṣirf* „ungemischter Wein"? oder Synonym zu *ṣabba* Hs. 493 (vgl. Dozy *ṣarrafa l-mâ'*)?

S. 194 *min al-ġad,* s. Wright, *Arabic grammar* 2:136D, ein anderes Beispiel at-Ṭabarî, *Annals*, Semitic study ser. 1, S. 2 Z. 2–3. *Ista^câna* und *istaġâṯa* mit *min* wurden schon S. 156 Fn. 59 behandelt mit einer längeren Begründung für die Wiedergabe von *min* mit „gegen". Diese ergibt sich aber zwanglos aus der eigentlichen Bedeutung „von — weg", üblich bei Verba mit der Bedeutung „helften", „retten" (IV. von *ista^câna: a^câna* mit *min; anǧâ*, Wright 2:129 f.; *anqaḏa* und *imtana^ca* mit *min*, Brockelmann, *Grundriss* 2:402; das bekannte *a^cûḏu billâh min*, dazu noch *ista^câḏa* und *ta^cawwaḏa*, beide mit *min*).

S. 195 Plur. *akhâf* auch im WKAS 1:407 und M. Ullmann, *Untersuchungen zur Raǧazpoesie* 115 (hapax legomenon).

S. 197 *alqâ* kommt (wie das synonyme *ṭaraḥa*, al-Hamdânî, *K. al-Ǧauharatain* 52 a etc.) auch in chemisch-technischen Vorschriften vor mit der Bedeutung „streuen", „giessen" (al-Hamdânî a.a.O., al-Kindî, *Kîmiyâ' al-^ciṭr*, 1948, Glossar 136, 153 f.). Auch ein anderer Ausdruck der Rezepte begegnet in diesem Text, u.zw. *^camada ilâ* in der Bedeutung „nehmen" (al-Hamdânî 53 b etc.) Vers. I 6:27, allerdings in dem lexikalischen Abschnitt nicht aufgenommen.

Von dem Text der arabischen Übersetzung der syrischen Richterbuches werden ab S. 214 Kapp. 1, 6, 11 und 21 von den Versionen I, II und III und der Propagandaedition aus dem Jahre 1671 herausgegeben. Vor allem die Edition der Version I nach 15 Hss. mit Mengen von Varianten muss grosse Anforderungen auf Genauigkeit und Ausdauer gestellt haben. Es ist dem Verf. gelungen, einen verlässlichen und gut lesbaren Text und Apparat herzustellen. Zweifelhaft ist mir nur die Methode (S. 227), Lakunen mit einer eigenen Übersetzung aus Peš. auszufüllen, die ja kaum zu etwas nützlich sein kann. Vorzuziehen sind die Punkte, die in der Vers. III benutzt worden sind (S. 230). Die *ihmâl-* Zeichen der Hss. sind nicht wiedergegeben.

In Vers. II Kap. 6:2 S. 274 ist der Vers mit dem Wort *buyûtan* (Fn. 4) ergänzt als Obj. von *wa-^camilû* ohne Stütze in den Hss. aber offensichtlich nach Verss. I und III und Peš. Aber *buyûtan* dort entspricht doch *aǧḥira* hier.

Der Stil des Verf. ist nicht so knapp wie man es in einer wissenschaftlichen Arbeit sehen möchte, sondern jede Seite strotzt von überflüssigen Ausdrücken, wie „of course", „as is well known", „it goes without saying", „as far as I can see/can judge/know/am concerned", und Verstärkungen, wie „absolutely", „completely", „undoubtedly", „definitely", „perfectly", „extremely".

Das Äussere des Buches macht einen sehr guten Eindruck. Die wenigen Druckfehler sind nicht derart, das sie das Verständnis erschweren. S. 153 Z. 2 soll in den leeren Klammern يُ stehen. Dem Koranzitat (2:61), das das Verwort S. XVI beendet, fehlt ʿalaikum — wie Verf. mitteilt, hat er es aus dem Volksmund und nicht direkt aus dem Koran. Gute Handschriftsreproduktionen schmücken S. XXXI–LVI. Der Text ist übersichtlich aufgestellt und die Fussnoten sind unten an jeder Seite zu finden. Gute Indizes beschliessen das Buch. Im 19. Jahrhundert war es üblich, dass Verfasser ihre Titel und sogar ihre Orden auf das Titelblatt setzten, aber wir müssen diesem Beispiel nicht folgen sondern schreiben im Index Landberg, Carlo, und Slane, Mac Guckin de, lieber als le comte de Landberg und baron de Slane, ebenso Spiro und Spitta ohne Bey. Ein Index der grammatischen Ausdrücke fehlt, wird aber durch das ausführliche Inhaltsverzeichnis am Anfang des Buches und die vielen Kreuzverweise ersetzt.

Wenn dieses Buch allerlei Fragen unbeantwortet lässt, liegt das auch daran, dass es, wie Verf. selbst hervorhebt, nur eine Vorstufe weiterer Arbeit mit den Texten zur arabischen Übersetzung des Buches der Richter ausmacht. Hoffentlich wird es nicht allzu lange dauern, ehe die weiteren Ergebnisse des Verf. auf diesem wenig gepflegten Gebiete vorliegen und wir den Text des arabischen Richterbuches und die damit verbundenen Untersuchungen vollständig vor uns haben.

Aarhus Chr. Toll.

Studia Iranica tome 1. 1972 - fascicule 1: Librairie Orientaliste Paul Geuthner, Paris. 162 pp., 17 plates. Subscription price (fasc. 1 and 2): France 48 F, abroad 51 F.

A new journal has come to light, the first one exclusively devoted to Iranian studies. The comité de rédaction consists of

J. Aubin and Ph. Gignoux in collaboration with C. Cahen, H. Corbin, Ch. de Fouchécour, G. Lazard, S. Melikian, J. de Menasce and M. Reut, names that guarantee quality! Fasc. 1 contains a distinguished selection of articles and "notes et chroniques". The titles of the works presented give a fine impression of the comprehensiveness and extent of the journal: F. Vallat, Deux inscriptions élamites de Darius 1er (DSf et DSz); Ph. Gignoux, La Construction de *ōrōn* en pehlevi; G. Lazard, Pahlavi/pahlavâni dans le Šâhnâme (with which should be compared Lazard's equally brilliant study *Pahlavi, Pârsi, Dari.* Les Langues de l'Iran d'Après Ibn al-Muqaffa. Iran and Islam, Edinburgh University Press 1971, pp. 361 ff.; B. W. Robinson, The Amery collection of Persian oil paintings; P. Vieille M. Hagcheno, Le bazar et le tournant économique des années 1954–1960; P. Centlivres, Noms, surnoms et termes d'adresse dans le nordafghan; P. Gentelle, Le blé en Afghanistan; C. M. Kieffer, Le multilinguisme des Ormurs de Baraki-Barak (Afghanistan), and under *notes et chroniques*- P. Lecoq, Remarques sur l'inscription de Sar-Mašhad; J. de Menasce, Dix ans d'études pehlevies: publication de textes; Ch. de Fouchécour, Premier congrès d'iranologie; Alai-Hosseini, Congrès Abul-Fazl Beyhaqi; M. Waez-Zadeh, Congrès Sheikh-e Tûsî, and I. Afshar, Communication au Premier Congrès National sur les études iraniennes, tenu à Téhéran en septembre 1970. Comptes rendus pp. 155–162 of the fasc.

Jes P. Asmussen.

Heikki Räisänen: The Idea of Divine Hardening. A Comparative Study of the Notion of Divine Hardening, Leading Astray and Inciting to Evil in the Bible and the Qur'ān. Publications of the Finnish Exegetical Society 25. Helsinki 1972. Pp. 108.

An important book, sound and clear in its conclusions. The author of *Das koranische Jesusbild. Ein Beitrag zur Theologie des Korans* from 1971 has given another most valuable "Beitrag". It is a thorough study of the Qur'ān (pp. 13 ff.), the Old Testament (pp. 45 ff.), later Jewish literature (pp. 67 ff.), and the New Testament (pp. 79 ff.) as regards the vital problem of divine hardening. Preceding the final conclusion (pp. 96 ff.) are the conclusions given after each section, a most recommendable procedure here beautifully carried through. Above all attention should be called to the author's treatment of the Qumrān texts, especially the significance -as regards this topic- of the fact that it is possible to distinguish different layers of tradition in those texts. The author has in a convincing way delivered the "history" of the idea of divine hardening by emphasizing that the talk of God's "negative" acts is everywhere in one way or another connected with the *social experience* of the individual or the community (p. 96). His wide bibliography (pp. 100–106) shows that he knows what he is talking about!

Jes P. Asmussen.

Kenneth Cragg: The Mind of the Qur'ān. Chapters in Reflection. George Allen Unwin Ltd., London 1973. Pp. 209, £ 4.25.

This excellent book is meant as a sequel to the author's *The Event of the Qur'ān* (1971) where the basic question was: What happened in the Qur'ān? Now the inquiry is: How has it been received? Or: What might it mean to be Quranically minded in the contemporary world? In the 11 chapters of the book such, i.e., central Islamic themes are dealt with as: the ḥifẓ of the Qur'ān, dhikr, muḥkamāt, mutashābihāt (on which the passage in the *Fihrist* might throw some light, cf. Hans Heinrich Schaeder, Iranische Beiträge I, Halle 1930, p. 9 (207)), laʿalla ("the great *perhaps* of the Qur'ān"), ẓulm, nifāq, maraḍ, istighfār, shirk, āyāt or the sign of Allāh, fanā'. At the end of the book there is a good index including Quranic passages quoted in the text (pp. 198–209).

Jes P. Asmussen.

Harald Löschner: Die dogmatischen Grundlagen des šīʿitischen Rechts. Eine Untersuchung zur modernen imāmitischen Rechtsquellenlehre. Erlanger juristische Abhandlungen Band 9. Carl Heymanns Verlag KG. Köln – Berlin – Bon – München 1971. Pp. 240.

Dr. Löschner hat über etwas geschrieben, was nicht oft in der Fachliteratur behandelt wird. Umso fröhlicher ist es, dass er ein lehrreiches und wohlkomponiertes Werk hervorgebracht hat, das zweifelsohne lange eine Autorität bleiben wird. Das Buch besteht aus 6 Kapiteln: 1. *Die Prinzipien der Rechtserkenntnis* (*uṣūl al-fiqh*) (mit drei Unterabteilungen: Fiqh, Begriffsbestimmungen; Uṣūl al-fiqh; Inhalt der uṣūl al-fiqh nach šīʿitischer Auffassung), 2. *Der Koran* (mit vier Unterabteilungen: Geschichte des Korans; Überlick über den rechtlichen Inhalt des Korans; Die normative Kraft des Koranwortlautes; Derogation (nask) im Koran), 3. *Die Sunna* (mit ebenfalls vier Unterabteilungen: Der juristische Begriff „Sunna"; Der ḥadīt; Die Traditionen und der aus ihnen resultierende Gewissheitsgrad; Die „Publizität" (šuhra), 4. *Der Konsens* (*ijmāʿ*) (mit fünf Unterabtailungen: Bedingungen für die Entwicklung der šīʿitischen Konsenslehre; Überblick über sunnitische Auffassungen vom Konsens; Šīʿitische Stellungnahme zu den Argumenten der sunnitischen Konsenstheorie; Der imāmitische Konsens; Arten des imāmitischen Konsenses), 5. *Die Vernuft* (*ʿaql*) (mit fünf Sektionen: Orientalistisches Schrifttum zur „Vernuft" als islamische, insbesondere šīʿitische Rechtsquelle; Šīʿitische Stellungnahmen zur „Vernuft" seit Šaik (Mufīd; Zwischenergebnis; Moderne šīʿitische Literatur zur „Vernunft"; Ergebnis) und 6. *Die Handelnsprinzipien* (*uṣul ʿamalīya*) (mit vier Unterabteilungen: Unklarheit der systematischen Einordnung; Generelle Anwendung der Handelnsprinzipien; Das „Begleitungsprinzip"; Das Prinzip des Freiseins). Vorne im Buche eine ausführliche Bibliographie (pp. 11–12) und als Anhang: Arabisch-deutsches Glossar. Ein wichtiges und sehr nützliches Werk.

Jes P. Asmussen.

Karl Jahn: Die Geschichte der Kinder Israels des Rašīd ad-Dīn. Einleitung, Übersetzung, Kommentar und 82 Texttafeln. 114 Seiten, 4°, brosch., S. 450.–, ca. DM 75.–. Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften. Philosophisch-hist. Klasse. Denkschriften. 114. Band. Veröffentlichungen der iranischen Kommission, herausgegeben von Manfred Mayrhofer, Band II. Wien 1973.

Mit bewundernswerter Kraft und Tüchtigkeit setzt Professor Karl Jahn mit diesem glänzenden Werk seine Bearbeitung der

Geschichte des Rašid ad-Din fort, nachdem er schon in vorzüglichen Übersetzungen die Geschichte der Franken (Leiden 1951) und die Indiens (The Hague 1965), die Geschichte der Oguzen (Wien 1969) und die Chinageschichte (Wien 1971) vorgelegt hat. Seiner vorliegenden kritischen mit Erläuterungen versehenen Übersetzung liegt die älteste noch aus Rašīd ad-Dīns Leibzeiten (1317/18) stammende persische Handschrift des Topkapı Sarayi, Hazine 1654 (Fol. 272r–294v) zugrunde. Zu textkritischen Zwecken hat der Verfasser an persischen Handschriften noch das ebenfalls im Topkapı Sarayi befindliche Ms. aus der Bibliothek Sultan Aḥmed III., 2953 (15. Jahrhundert), und die für Šāhruḫ um 1433 angefertigte Abschrift des British Museums (Rieu I, Add. 7628) herangezogen. Die arabische Urfassung wird in Karl Jahns Musteredition durch das berühmte Fragment aus dem Besitz der Royal Asiatic Society (A 27, aus dem Jahre 1314/15 vertreten.

Auch für den Kunsthistoriker ist dieses Werk durch seine Miniaturen (16 auf den Tafeln) von grösstem Wert.

Jes P. Asmussen.

Georg Morgenstierne: Irano-Dardica. (Beiträge zur Iranistik. Herausgegeben von Georges Redard. Band 5). Dr. Ludwig Reichert Verlag, Wiesbaden 1973. Pp. 388.

Any student of things Iranian will be most grateful to the Dr. Ludwig Reichert Verlag in Wiesbaden for bringing out this masterpiece. It is a collection of some of Professor Morgenstierne's fundamental contributions to Iranian, Indian, and Indo-Aryan studies. Some of the reprints have been supplied with additions, either in the form of notes within brackets, or as addenda, so in the case of *Das Wort für "Sichel" in neuindischen und neuiranischen Sprachen, "mushroom" and "toadstool" in Indo-Iranian, An ancient Indo-Iranian word for "dragon", Feminine nouns in -a in Western Iranian dialects, Iranian feminines in či, A Vedic word in some modern Hindu Kush languages?,* and *Genealogical traditions among the Kati Kafirs.* Three articles have *not been published* *before*, viz. Final *-a* and *-ā* in Iranian (p. 108–109), Additional notes on Waṇetsi (p. 207–223), and Die Stellung der Kafirsprachen (p. 327–343).

Jes P. Asmussen.

Der Hakim von Nischapur Omar Chajjám und seine Rubaijat: Nach alten und neuesten persischen Handschriftenfunden von Manuel Sommer. Guido Pressler Verlag, Wiesbaden 1974. 148 pp. und mehrere Illustrationen.

Noch ein Omar, aber bestimmt nicht der Geringste, der das Licht der Welt gesehen hat. Im Gegenteil liegt hier etwas Neues vor. Diese Übersetzung bezeichnet nämlich einen Bruch mit dem eingebürgerten Dogma, dass nur fünffüssige Jamben in vier Zeilen eine getreue Wiedergabe des Originals ermöglichen.In einem Artikel (Über Mängel gängiger Übersetzungsmethoden), der beim Verlag zu haben ist, zeigt der Verfasser, wieviel wesentliche Dinge durch diese Methode in Wegfall geraten. Im grossen und ganzen muss dieser neue Versuch als geglückt betrachtet werden. Die Einführung, die mitgeteilten Quellen und die benutzte Literatur zeigen ganz deutlich, dass der Verfasser mit dem Chajjam-Problem sehr vertraut ist. Auch das Hervorheben des Religiösen in der Interpretation des Dichters ist in diesem Zusammenhang zu unterstreichen. Jedoch hätte der Übersetzer auch mit Nutzen Arthur Christensens Habilitationsschrift: Omar Khajjâms Rubâijât — En litterær-historisk Undersøgelse [København 1903], die auch russisch und französisch vorliegt, lesen können.

Jes P. Asmussen.

Ibn al-Faqīh al-Hamaḏānī: Abrégé du livre des Pays. Traduit de l'arabe par Henri Massé † Institut Français de Damas 1973. Pp. 440.

Wenn ein grosser Gelehrte wie Henri Massé eine Aufgabe übernommen hat, wird das Beste geleistet. Das ist auch in diesem Fall zugetroffen. Der Text ist sehr wichtig für das Verständnis der alten islamischen Geographie (die arabische Halbinsel, Ägypten, Syrien, Rūm, Iraq, Iran, Armenien usw.) und des alten Weltbildes und zugleich eine Fundgrube kulturhistorisch — im weitesten Sinne — wichtiger Traditionen. Der arabische Text findet sich im 5. Band der von J. De Goeje herausgegebenen Bibliotheca geographorum arabicorum [Leiden 1885]. Noch ein Vorteil dieser Arbeit liegt darin, dass Professor Ch. Pellat mit grosser Sorgfalt alle Zweifelsfälle und Übersetzungsmöglichkeiten untersucht hat und dabei noch dazu das berühmte, von Henri Massé nicht einbezogene *Mašhad Manuskript* hat verwenden können. Der sehr umfangreiche Index Général macht das ganze Werk überaus brauchbar und übersichtlich.

Jes P. Asmussen.

Albert von Le Coq: Die buddhistische Spätantike in Mittelasien. Ergebnisse der Kgl. Preussischen Turfan Expeditionen. I. Die Plastik: öS 1.750,– (ca. DM 250,–). 29 Seiten und 45 Tafeln, mehrere in Farben. 1973. II. Die manichäischen Miniaturen: öS 1.130,– (ca. DM 162,–). 63 Seiten und Tafeln A – 1–8 b. 1973. V. Neue Bildwerke: öS 1.850,– (ca. DM 264,–). 33 Seiten und Tafeln A–F und 1–26 (viele in Farben). 1975. Akademische Druck- und Verlagsanstalt, Graz/Österrich.

Diese drei technisch vollkommenen Bände sind unveränderte Nachdrucke der 1922, 1923 und 1926 bei Dietrich Reimer und Ernst Vohsen in Berlin erschienenen Ausgabe. Eine genauere Besprechung dieser Klassiker der Orientalistik (religionsgeschichtlich, kunst- und sprachgeschichtlich, topographisch, archäologisch) ist deshalb unnotwendig, aber notwendig ist es, der Akademischen Druck- und Verlagsanstalt in Graz einen aufrichtigen Dank auszusprechten für diese überaus schöne und sorgfältige Arbeit, ein vornehmes Beispiel der Buchdruckerkunst, wenn sie das Beste leistet.

Natürlich ist die Forschung inzwischen weitergekommen, aber jedoch ist die Bedeutung dieser Werke wegen des *besonderen* Inhalts in keiner Weise überholt. Sie werden immer unentbehrliche Instrumente der Forschung bleiben. Besonders wichtig — und es ist wohl in diesem Zusammenhang nicht ganz überflüssig, darauf aufmerksam zu machan — sind die Bemerkungen A. von le Coqs (Band II) über die „Manichäer als Vermittler buddhistischer Dinge“ (vgl. *Jes P. Asmussen,* Der Manichäismus als Vermittler literarischen Gutes, Temenos Vol. 2, Helsinki 1966, pp. 5 ff.), über „Mani und die schönen Künste“, über „Die Schrift des Mani“, die „Arten der Bücher“, „Schreibmaterialien und Buchschmuck“, „Einbände“, „Technik der Miniaturmalerei“ und die „Bedeutung der manichäischen Miniaturen für die Kunstgeschichte“.

Das Büchlein *M* 801 („dieses jeden Buchliebhaber entzückende Fundstück ist ein gutes Beispiel der liebevollen Sorgfalt, mit der die manichäischen Kalligraphen ihre Kunst in den Dienst der Religion stellten“, Band II, p. 39–40), von welchem einige Zeilen in Umschrift und z.T. Übersetzung angeführt werden, hat *W. Henning* später in extenso herausgegeben (Ein manichäisches Bet- und Beichtbuch, APAW 1936, Nr. 10). Bibliographisch jetzt auch *Emel Esin,* Antecedents and Development of Buddhist and Manichean Turkish Art in Eastern Turkestan and Kansu (The Handbook of Turkish Culture: Supplement to Volume III section of the history of art), Istanbul 1967, mit weiteren Hinweisen (A. von Gabain, L. Hambis usw.).

Jes P. Asmussen.

Georg Morgenstierne: Indo-Iranian Frontier Languages Vol. IV. The Kalasha Language. Texts and Translations — Vocabulary and Grammar — Appendix. Instituttet for Sammenlignende Kulturforskning, Serie B: Skrifter LVIII. Universitetsforlaget, Oslo — Bergen — Tromsö 1973. Pp. 254 and 8 illustrations.

This most admirable piece of work contains 25 Kalasha texts (tales, songs, and prayers connected with various ceremonies) collected by Georg Morgenstierne in Chitral 1929 and, as for Texts 18–25, others, especially Professor Halfdan Siiger (Chitral 1968), a thorough vocabulary, a list of names of clans, personal names, names of months, mythological names and geographical names, a bibliography, and, in addition, Notes on Kalasha (reprint from NTS XX, 1965, p. 183–238) and Publications by Georg Morgenstierne 1903–1972, compiled by Knut Kristiansen and Inge Ross.

Jes P. Asmussen.

Armas Salonen: Vögel und Vogelfang im alten Mesopotamien (mit 95 Tafeln). Annales Academiæ Scientiarum Fennicæ Ser. B, Tom. 180. Helsinki 1973. Pp. 374. 150,– FM.

In schneller Folge innerhalb der Jahre 1951–1972 hat Armas Salonen in bewundernswerter Weise seine schönen lexicographischen Studien über Landfahrzeuge, Hippologie, Türen, Möbel, Hausgeräte, Agrikultur, Fussbekleidung, Fischerei und Ziegeleien im alten Mesopotamien vorgelegt. Mit der neuen Arbeit hat er ausserordentlich sorgfältig — wie gewöhnlich — die Ornithologie einbezogen. Das Werk zerfällt in vier Teile: I Vogler, II Vogelfanggeräte, III Vögel (hier die archaischen Zeichen für MUŠEN und die mit MUŠEN zusammengestellten Zeichen) und IV Termini (wie „Flügel schlagen", „nisten", „Vögel fangen", „brüten", „mit Netz fangen", „zwitschern" usw.). Der eminente Wert dieser Arbeit für die Sumerologen und Assyriologen versteht sich von selbst, aber sie hat auch eine viel weitere Bedeutung, und zwar für die Erforschung der altorientalischen Avifauna und eo ipso der antiken Avifauna. Denn die Etymologie der einzelnen Vogelnamen und die literarischen Belege geben uns so viele sprechende Züge im Benehmensmuster vieler Arten, dass eine ziemlich genaue Identifikation in vielen Fällen möglich ist. Wenn dieses Material aber mit dem zusammengestellt wird, was man über Vogelnamen und das Benehmen der Vögel z.B. in Vergil's *Georgica* und Columella's *De re rustica* lesen kann, ist ein Vergleichsmaterial von nicht geringer Bedeutung vorhanden.

Jes P. Asmussen.

„Das Buch der kostbaren Perle" von Severus ibn al Muqaffa'. Einleitung und arabischer Text (Kapitel 1–5). Von Paul Maiberger. Akademie der Wissenschaften und der Literatur. Veröffentlichungen der Orientalischen Kommission Band XXVIII. Franz Steiner Verlag GMBH. Wiesbaden 1972. XVII — 150 Seiten und arabischer Text (54 Seiten).

„Das Buch der kostbaren Perle — Darlegung des Glaubens bezüglich der Religion anhand dessen was der Mund der Propheten und der reinen und starken Apostel und der Väter und Lehrer und der seligen Patriarchen gesprochen hat über die Menschwerdung des Herrn der Herrlichkeit und seine Himmelfahrt und die Sendung des Parakleten durch ihn", wie der vollständige Titel lautet, ist laut der Beiruter Hs ar. 574 und der Kairener Hss ar. 341 und 373 ein Werk des besonders durch seine Patriarchengeschichte bekannt gewordenen koptischen Schriftstellers *Severus ibn al-Muqaffa'*, „der in der 2. Hälfte des 10. Jh.s eine reiche literarische Tätigkeit entfaltete, wobei er sich bemerkenswerterweise als erster Autor von Rang und Namen nicht mehr des Koptischen, sondern des Arabischen bediente, und damit zum eigentlichen Begründer der christlich-arabischen Literatur bei den Kopten geworden ist" (p. 2). Die Verfasserbestimmung wurde schon von *G. Graf* gemacht (Orientalia christiana periodica 3, 1937) und wird durch Dr. Maibergers Arbeit völlig gesichert (p. 57–63). Die hier vorliegende sehr schöne und lehrreiche Einleitung bezieht sich auf die 15 Kapitel des *gesamten* arabischen Textes, von welchem hier zunächst nur die ersten 5 Kapitel als Specimen vorgestellt werden. Schon die „Probe" aber zeigt ganz überseugend, dass die Arbeit in den besten Händen ist. Man erwartet vertrauensvoll die Vollausgabe. In seiner Einleitung berichtet der Verfasser über die Textgestalt und literarische Fragen (z.B. Entstehungsort, Verfasserschaft, die „Kostbare Perle" in der späteren Literatur) und gibt eine sehr ausführliche Inhaltangabe aller 15 Kapitel. Sehr wichtig sind die gründlichen Register: Verzeichnis der Väterzitate, Namensregister der Irrlehrer (Apollinaristen, Arianer, Manichäer, Marcion, Nestorius usw.) und Index Biblicus. Besonders die sorgfältige Anführung der Bibelzitate ist von grosser Bedeutung, da sie weitgehend in die Erforschung der alten Versionen (Vetus Syra, Vetus Armena, Vetus Latina) hereingestellt werden können. Dr. Maiberger hat aber nicht nur der Patristik, der Kirchen- und Dogmengeschichte und der Textgeschichte gute Dienste getan, sondern auch der semitischen Philologie. In dem kurzen, aber strahlenden Kapitel *Die sprachliche Gestalt des Textes* (pp. 45 ff.) zeigt er, dass die von *Joshua Blau* (A Grammar of Christian Arabic, based mainly on South-Palestinian Texts from the First Millenium, SCCO Vol. 267, 276, 279; Subsidia Tomi 27–29, Löwen 1966/67) in südpalästinensischen Texten beobachteten mittelarabischen Erscheinungen in gleicher Weise auch für seinen noch ins 10. Jh. gehörenden ägyptischarabischen Text zutreffen.

Jes P. Asmussen.

Niels Steensgaard: Carracks, Caravans and Companies. The structural crisis in the European—Asian trade in the early 17th century. Copenhagen 1973. Reprinted as 'The Asian Trade Revolution of the Seventeenth Century'. Chicago 1975.

Through the thesis in hand, Niels Steensgaard carries on a tradition distinct among the greater Danish historians, namely the tradition of taking up, in the thesis, aspects of international trade in the early modern period. Dr. Steensgaard's predecessors have thus been Erik Arup, Astrid Friis, Aksel E. Christensen and Kristof Glamann.[1] Of these he has been in contact with Dr. Glamann, with whom he has discussed a number of specific problems, and with the late Dr. Astrid Friis, his debt to whom he also mentions. It was she, "who first introduced me to the study of the history of international trade, and who taught me that historical subjects should be studied, not in the safe hinterland of established categories, but in the unpleasant regions where one may have to revise one's ideas on being confronted with the sources" (p. 8). That Dr. Steensgaard in fact has attempted to live up to this is brought to evidence by this huge book, in which he often risks his skin by putting forth thought-provoking general hypotheses based upon his extremely wide studies of international sources.

The present work is the result of a decade's toil, and naturally the subject, as well as the way of presenting the problems, have undergone transformation, attention gradually being focused on problems of greater generality. Thus the author in question

[1] E. Arup, *Studier i engelsk og tysk Handelshistorie. En Undersøgelse af Kommissionshandelens Praksis og Theori i engelsk og tysk Handelsliv 1350–1850*, København, 1907.

A. Friis, *Alderman Cockayne's Project and the Cloth Trade. The Commercial Policy of England in its Main Aspects 1603–1625*, København-London, 1927.

A. E. Christensen, *Dutch Trade to the Baltic around 1600. Studies in the Sound Toll Register and Dutch Shipping Records*, København-Haag, 1941.

K. Glamann, *Dutch-Asiatic Trade 1620–1740*, København-Haag, 1958.

presented, in his first published periodical article of 1965, a point survey of freight costs in the English East India trade in the first half of the 17th Century.[2] Only two years later, he had already completed an extensive article, wherein he submitted a comparative analysis of the institutional distinctiveness of the Levant trade of Venice, France, England and Holland. In this analysis, the efficiency of the consular institutions of the above mentioned states is compared.[3] Another change of level of analysis is reflected in the articles from 1970, where the theme is partly a general analysis of Europe's trade with Asia, solely illustrated by the number of ships sent out decade by decade,[4] partly a thorough discussion of the entire controversy on the so called crisis of the 17th Century.[5]

Finally *Carracks, Caravans and Companies* is a presentation of a piece of work, which unites the general with the more specific level of analysis. On the basis of his detailed investigations of the case study on the fate of the Portuguese customs house Ormuz, he arrives at a series of hypotheses and a conceptual framework, the general validity of which it is impossible to judge on the basis of the present showing. Further research into other periods and groups of subjects might very well prove however, that these results will bear fruit there too.

But what, more specifically, are the problems that the author looks into?

The paradox which has leapt to his eye and set him going with this particular piece of work is: that roughly a hundred years passed, after the Portuguese had discovered the sea-route to Asia (Bartholomeus Diazes rounding of the Cape of Good Hope in 1487 and Vasco da Gama's travel to India 1497–98), till this discovery had any serious consequences for traditional caravan trade through the Middle East. Throughout the 17th Century the

[2] N. Steensgaard, "Freight Costs in the English East India Trade 1601–1657", *Scandinavian Economic History Review* vol. XIII, København, 1965.

[3] N. Steensgaard, "Consuls and Nations in the Levant from 1570 to 1650", *Scandinavian Economic History Review* vol. XV, København, 1967.

[4] N. Steensgaard, "European Shipping to Asia 1497–1700", *Scandinavian Economic History Review* vol. XVIII, København, 1970.

[5] N. Steensgaard, "Det syttende århundredes krise", *Historisk Tidsskrift* ser. 12, vol. IV, København 1969–1970.

pedlars continued to bring a wide assortment of goods to the Levant ports from the whole of Asia, entirely unaffected by the fleet of Portuguese carracks, which also brought Asian goods to Europe, but via the route south of Africa. No significant changes in the pattern were made till the first decades of the 17th Century, when the North-West European Companies for trade in Asia appeared on the scene. In 1600 and 1602 respectively, the English East India Company and the Dutch Vereenigde Oost-Indische Compagnie were founded, and all at once the most important Asian commodities, pepper and spices, disappeared from the caravan routes, being sailed directly to Europe via the Cape route instead.

In the course of 10–20 years the Companies succeeded in triumphing over the caravan trade, something Portugal had been unable to do during the preceeding century. Naturally scholars have been aware of this fact for a long time, but as yet no one has attempted to uncover the causes. The answer to the "wherefore", is what Dr. Steensgaard has taken upon himself to find.

In his opinion the answer must be sought on a global basis, in a political and economic context. "The downfall of the caravan trade, the defeat of the Portuguese and the triumph of the Companies was an episode in the historical process, during which the Middle East and the Mediterranean region relinquished the economic leadership in favour of the Atlantic regions. It was part of the clash between the Catholic Iberian powers and the Protestant Channel powers, and it was part of the confrontation between older and newer entrepreneurial forms — a step towards the development of modern economy." (p. 10).

Niels Steensgaard has come to this acknowledgement, by going twice through extensive material of printed and unprinted sources, which he has collected in different parts of the whole of Europe.

First of all he has carried out a traditional *chronological* interpretation of the actual chain of events. In this connexion he seeks to clarify, whether the actions and aims of the actors can explain the fall of Ormuz in 1622. The investigation, however, proves this to be impossible. The aims in no way whatsoever complied with the actual chain of events.

Instead the author has turned to a *comparative* interpretation of the same relations. The level of abstraction is high here, but the outcome bears fruit, in that the institutional variables are shown to be important explanatory elements in clarifying the clash between the traditional trade structure, consisting of local caravans and Portuguese carracks, on the one hand, and the new structure, the Companies from North-West Europe, on the other.

Having employed both approaches, Niels Steensgaard believes to have proved the existence of a *structural crisis* in the beginning of the 17th Century, a crisis in which the Companies were bound, irrespective of the insight and intentions of the participators, to triumph over the pedlars and the carracks. The structural crisis is defined as "a confrontation of fundamentally different institutional complexes" (p. 12). Elements in the institutions of decisive importance in this connexion, were relations to the market and protection costs.

These concepts bring us back to the author's historiographical position — this time in relation to a number of foreign scholars, whose findings he has put to use.

Thus he has taken over the differentiation between the empirical market and the entirely different market of economic theory, which K. Polanyi has emphasized, primarily on the basis of studies on the situation in Asia.[6] Furthermore Niels Steensgaard is indebted to P. W. Klein's comparison of the differences in configuration of the Dutch and Asian markets, where Klein points out the absolute advantages of the former, transparency of the market making prediction possible.[7] The positive sides of the European trade sites were made possible by the concentration of buyers and sellers in one place. With the rise of such a market structure, the rational calculating entrepreneuers began to appear. The opposite is the case with regard to Asia's peddling markets, which J. C. van Leur has described[8]: there were many smaller markets

[6] K. Polanyi et al. (eds.), *Trade and Market in the Early Empires. Economies in History and Theory*, Glencoe Illinois, 1957.

[7] P. W. Klein, *De Trippen in de XVII^{e} eeuw. Een studie over het ondernemersgedrag op de Hollandse staapelmarkt.* Assen, 1965.

[8] J. C. van Leur, *Indonesian Trade and Society. Essays in Asian Social and Economic History*, Haag, 1955.

in Asia, markets which served the merchants who travelled from place to place with a few camels loaded with goods. These markets lacked transparency, and as a result price formation became exceedingly unstable.

Regarding the protection costs, Dr. Steensgaard first and foremost builds on the work of F. C. Lane, who points out that protection was not always a free good,[9] and that the travelling merchants therefore were prepared to pay for this protection (e. g. for the roads in a certain area to be kept free of robbers). Thus protection was a good, which was bought and sold like any other, and therefore the practising of organized violence was an important source of income, especially for the princes — and at the same time a major expenditure for the pedlars. In this way some of the profit from the trading was redistributed.

Let us now turn our attention to the contents of the actual thesis, which falls in two equally large parts: the first part containing the comparative analysis, the second part the traditional presentation of historical events.

In his discussion of *the peddling trade structure*, Niels Steensgaard is in a tight corner, due to the lack of immediately relevant sources, which forces him to employ the indirect statements made by Western sources. Only the journal of one single pedlar is known, namely that of the Armenian Hovhannes, and it covers a period as late as 1682–93 at that. Still, the author succeeds in giving a picture of the highly developed trade patterns peopled by individual entrepreneurs.

The pedlars' expenditures with regard to transport alone were very small compared with those of the Companies. Thus a camel could transport a load of 200 kg pepper from the Levant to Goa and back for roughly 25 piastres, whereas the cost by a Company ship was 40–50 piastres.

On the other hand, the pedlars were inconvenienced by virtually unpredictable protection costs, which often exceeded transport costs. Moreover lack of transparency of the markets, which were characterized by violent price fluctuations and easy substitution,

[9] F. C. Lane, *Venice and History. The Collected Papers of Frederic C. Lane*, Baltimore, 1966.

further impeded their ability to compete. The absence of middlemen, who by virtue of stocks would have subdued the rise and fall in prices, strained the situation even more.

As an illustration of the above, we have the example of an English merchant, who comes to Aleppo in December of 1634 to deal in silk (48 ff). In his preserved letter-book, we hear that wars in the area caused the supplying of Aleppo with silk to be very uncertain. In the late summer it got about, that rich caravans were on their way. At the same time rumours said, that two ships from Europe also were underway. The situation was painful: if the ships were to arrive first, it would be an advantage to have provided oneself with silk beforehand (on the ships' arrival demand would increase and thereby prices too) — if, on the other hand, the camels won the race, it would be wiser to postpone the purchases till then. The tension was relieved by the appearance of the caravans first in Aleppo, wherefore supplies were plentiful and prices low, and the Englishman bought large quantities of silk, confident that prices would rise on the arrival of the ships. Meanwhile it turned out that they, when they finally showed up in Aleppo in December of 1635, found the silk market much too overheated, and refusing to buy, turned their backs and sailed away again. An infallible boom had turned into a slump.

Save for full transparency, the Aleppo market was, as described above, almost a pure empirical example of the economic theory's free market. There was a rich supply of European goods and money, and a demand for Asian commodities; there were many small scale sellers and buyers, where no one person dominated, and thus controlled the market; and finally prices were formed right where demand and supply met.

But it should be emphasized once more, that it was the innate institutional variables, the market and the protection costs, which gave the peddling market its poor transparency and thereby the pedlars their lack of competitiveness.

In the passage on the protective institutions, or *the redistributive enterprises* as Dr. Steensgaard names them, he takes a look at the three institutions which demanded duty in return for protection. The redistributive enterprises are defined as political institutions "using organized violence in order to "produce" and "sell" a special kind of service, i.e. protection" (p. 60). In short, the enterprises comprised publicans and thieves in the Persian and Osmannian Empires as well as in Portugal's Estado da India. Niels Steensgaard does not wish to maintain a formal distinction between publicans and thieves, as protection costs paid to both categories were altogether unpredictable, and as both, threatening with the use of violence, forced on the merchants unnecessarily abundant and dear protection, which was furthermore often ineffective. In this way some of the profit made through trading was redistributed.

Especially the functional description of the Portuguese Crown's tax and trade organisation Estado da India builds on a thorough and untraditional analysis. Dr. Steensgaard shows, how Estado da India had been based on institutional corruption since its foundation, for wages were modest and only paid for a three year term of office. The system actually fostered people like Verres. "Estado da India was a dynamic system, but the innovations were kept within the pattern of redistribution, and the profit was consumed in a seigneurial way of life or reinvested in redistributive enterprises, not in productive or productivity-increasing enterprises. The Portuguese were tax gatherers and Estado da India was a redistributive institution." (p. 86). The mere profit from the frequently mentioned royal monopoly trade in pepper could never have kept the entire Portuguese apparatus going in Asia; the necessary capital was acquired through the levying of taxes. In return for these, Estado da India yielded protection to the tradesmen.

What concerns this forced protection, Estado da India constituted a traditional redistributive structure, which exploited as well as protected the flow of commodities through the Middle East — first and foremost at the customs house in the trading centre of Ormuz, which controlled the entrance to the Persian Gulf.

Regarding the different types of markets, the question is whether the advance of the redistributive structure modified the already existing peddling markets.

In this connexion, the author looks into the silk trade of the

Persian Crown and into the Portuguese Crown's pepper trade, and arrives at the conclusion, that the traditional markets did not change character. The commercial activities performed by the King and the Shah differed not qualitatively but quantitatively from those of the pedlars. In no way did the redistributive enterprises seek to take advantage of opportunities, whereby they could have gained control of the market; they behaved in a way like a kind of superpedlar.

In this way the author carries on a concealed polemic, e.g. against the traditional view, that the Persian silk export was monopolized by the Shah. At the same time, he shows us that in analysing the distant trade through the Middle East, it is necessary to take into consideration a factor, often regarded as non-economic, namely the state power, if the economic course is to be explained. This recognition can be regarded as an important contribution to the improvement of the theoretical basis of economic history.

Herewith Dr. Steensgaard has concluded his treatment of the old trade structures and proceeds to the new type of structure, i. e. *the North-West European trading Companies,* which in the course of the first few years of the 17th Century succeeded in triumphing over the carracks and the caravans. According to the thesis, the reason for this happening is to be found in the superiority of the Companies' institutional innovations.

The Dutch company VOC and the English EIC have already held the attention of many scholars, and Niels Steensgaard therefore restricts himself to the investigation of the companies' institutional innovations and their relations to the market. Despite many points of similarity between EIC and VOC, problems of generalization arise due to important differences between the two.

EIC is the company which best fits into the author's thesis, because it traded exclusively with the aim of maximizing the commercial profit. The English company paid no respect to the political interests of its motherland, and the use of forcible means was regarded solely as a defensive measure — not as a source of income. Force was employed for the protection of the Company's ships, in preference to buying protection from others. The internalisation of protection costs was performed both by

EIC and by VOC, and it meant that necessary protection was acquired at cost price, and that all elements of tribute were avoided. Thus protection costs became not only smaller, but also more predictable, both facts being regarded by the author as decisive reasons for the triumph of the companies.

The commercial tendency was not quite so pronounced in the Dutch company, for VOC was linked very closely with the Dutch state and the latter's foreign policy. Already in 1602, when all the small voorkompagnieën were united to form VOC, one of the objects was to create an effective instrument in the struggle against Spain-Portugal. VOC could therefore be said to be somewhere between business and redistributive enterprise; for the use of organized violence was employed several times: to drive away the Portuguese, to retain the occupation of the Indonesian Spice Islands, and lastly to impose the levying of tax and tribute. Yet another point of similarity between VOC and the older redistributive structure was, that the former's profit was ploughed back to the company, which did not distribute regular dividends till 1625, instead of being invested directly in productive activities. On the other hand VOC differed decisively from Estado da India, in that the company's running book-keeping made it possible to evaluate, whether it paid to keep up a given route. This rational contemplating of the market, was quite unknown in the redistributive enterprises.

If we turn our attention to the other important factor with regard to competition, namely the companies' relation to the market, the institutional innovations become even more marked. For VOC and EIC allowed their investments on the buyers' market in Asia, to be influenced by the sellers' market in Europe, furthermore attempting to take advantage of their quasi-monopoly to gain control of the markets both places.

Despite a series of obstacles (monopolistic competition, technical problems of transport etc.), which impeded long-term trade policy, the companies succeeded in reducing the number of unknowns in their calculations. This enabled them to act quite freely, so long as the sales prices were lower than what was required by the marginal rate of substitution. EIC and VOC made use of this relative freedom in their long-term trade and price policies, the main goal of which was the attainment of stability, a goal thus differing very much from that of the two old structures, aiming at the maximizing of short-term profit.

The above mentioned institutional innovations led the companies to a cheaper, more rational application of their resources, than had been the case earlier. Thus the companies were able to offer a fall in consumer prices in Europe, despite rising prices in Asia — and still make a decent profit.

But do the empirical sources meet with all these abstract qualitative reflections? How large were the amounts conveyed south of Africa, and when did the redirection begin?

As mentioned earlier, the author opposes the general view held on the importance of the Portuguese Crown's trade. He claims that the role of the carracks, in the 16th Century, has been over-estimated and that their significance in the exchange of goods between Asia and Europe was minimal. Figures shown in Table 12 (p. 168) are an estimation of the size of the European import of Asian commodities around 1600. The total import was 6–7 million pounds; of these only 2 million pounds were sailed via the Cape route, whilst 4–5 million pounds came by caravan from the Middle East. Of 5 million pounds of pepper for instance, only 1–2 were transported south of Africa, and there was no silk on this route at all.

In the rough estimate of the companies' quantities of goods, Niels Steensgaard, in want of more precise sources, is compelled to take up the number of European ships, which returned from Asia in the period 1581–1630. 1581–99 the average number was 3.3 ships per year, but in 1600 this continuity was broken, for 1600–30 11.1 ships per year returned. With a capacity of barely 500 tons per ship, this fleet could transport exactly the 4–5 million pounds of commodities, which hitherto had been brought by the caravan routes. And as the author believes it improbable, that Europe should have doubled its import from Asia all at once, he assumes instead, that a redirecting of goods must have taken place. This assumption is in accordance with the fact, that the only disputed article, which was back on the caravan routes in the beginning of the 1620's, was raw silk from Persia. Besides the most important spices (cloves and nutmeg), also pepper and indigo were sent to Europe by sea at this time. Still, the author has by way of this argumentation only pointed out a congruence in time, there is no proof of causal relations.

Fernand Braudel[10] and many others along with him believed that a violent decline in Mediterranean trade took place in the beginning of the 17th Century. This view is not shared by Niels Steensgaard, who by means of an analysis of the state of the market in the most important towns of trade in the Levant (Aleppo and Alexandria), shows that transit trade did not fail, but on the contrary expanded in the period 1600–30. Only the articles were no longer pepper and spices, which were sailed via the Cape route now, but commodities produced in the Middle East — first and foremost raw silk and cotton.

The redirecting of goods south of Africa obviously posed no threat toward the Levant towns. But for the Portuguese organization Estado da India, on the other hand, it was serious. This is best illustrated by the fate of the town of *Ormuz*, which was unable to survive the structural crisis, in other words the transition from the old to the new trade structure.

The island of Ormuz, situated in the narrowest part of the entrance to the Persian Gulf, can not be said to be favoured by nature. The heat is stifling and drinking water is hard to find on that dusty, bare rocky island. Figueroa, a Spanish diplomat who visited Ormuz in 1619, mentions, that no rain had fallen for two whole years at that time.

Yet Ormuz became, in the course of a couple of centuries, one of the centres of world trade, because of its favourable position. It lay right where many of the most popular caravan routes met, and where these crossed the most important sea-routes in Asia. The Portuguese had sought to capture the town as early as 1507, but they did not succeed till 1543. Thereafter it was they who controlled Ormuz and the transit trade, assisted by a garrison comprising less than 500 men as well as a fleet. As a result Estado da India was able to levy a tax of about 12% (for Jews, Armenians and Muslims, however, 3% more); in the 1590's the provenue

[10] F. Braudel, *La Méditerranée et le monde méditerranéen à l'époque de Philippe II*, Paris, 1966.

was roughly 200,000 xerafims yearly, which is equivalent to no less than 6,650 kg pure silver. Holders of posts such as captain and royal factor in Ormuz were also regarded as being among the most lucrative in the entire Portuguese Empire.

Towards the end of the 16th Century however, the merchants' complaints of the conditions in Ormuz increased. Due to the institutional corruption, the taxes and bribes paid no longer balanced off with the protection yielded in return. Therefore it became more profitable for the merchants to transport their commodities via other routes. This trend of affairs was fatal for Ormuz, whose existence depended wholly on redistribution, so when the companies began to compete, the flow of goods through the customs house almost dwindled completely. The fate of the town was sealed, and the 1st May 1622 it fell into the hands of the Persians, who simply tore it down and moved it to Gombroon on the mainland.

The outline above, shows how the learned historian of today perceives, and seeks to explain events in the early 17th Century. But how did it all appear in the eyes of contemporaries?

In the second half of his book, Niels Steensgaard has abandoned the abstract level of analysis, turning instead to a traditional historical investigation, based on what the actors themselves looked upon as decisive. Methodologically, the purpose of the work is to compare the aims of the persons involved, with the actual course of events following; it thus being possible to see, whether individual intentions can explain the march of history.

The decision-making approach is carried through in the form of an awe-inspiring and detailed account of the diplomatic games, which garnished the problems connected with trade. The result of the investigation is, that the actors had practically no understanding of what was happening around them. Their attention was held by private interests and partial objectives, which were often fulfilled as a result of strenuous efforts. But viewed in perspective "the actors on the diplomatic and military scene were only players in a drama they themselves were unable to shape. They were the prisoners of a structural confrontation the outcome of which they could not control." (209 ff). In particular, it is underlined, that "the final decisions were improvised and parenthetical" (p. 210), i.e. they were ill-prepared or made at random, because even the best informed actors were unaware of the basic interests at stake.

The time factor also, as a result of long distances and slow communications, contributed to the confusion. As a rule, three years would pass before replies to letters sent to Asia were received in Europe and vice versa. Consequently the picture the decision-makers had of the outside world was grotesque. Their psychological milieu barely resembled their operational milieu.

The entire book's antithetical disposition, in the form of two completely different approaches, causes the second part somewhat to resemble a satire on the traditional writing of history. But on the other hand, this makes it possible to present a colourful account, peopled by a fantastic gallery of characters, going from the Persian Shah Abbas to the English adventurous brothers Anthony and Robert Sherley, and last but not least an abundance of agents, missionaries and merchants.

If we proceed to turn to matters *after the fall of Ormuz*, it is striking, how Portuguese trade in the Middle East began to flourish after 1622, but now instead by way of the Osmannian town of Basra in the innermost of the Persian Gulf. Taken as a whole though, merchants of all nationalities were better off, now that the parasite Ormuz was dead. The pedlars' position in relation to the new gigantic companies was splendid: in a kind of symbiosis, where each structure retained its characteristics, they continued to dwell side by side in Asia, mutual trade-exchange taking place. It was, however, mainly the concern of the Companies to supply Europe — silk being an exception.

EIC and VOC never succeeded, despite persistent efforts, in gaining control over the Persian export of raw silk. Even when VOC, at some time in the 1630's, attempted to buy up all Persian silk, no matter what the price, it had to be admitted, that only half of all the silk going into Holland was procured by the company. With regard to this commodity, the companies obviously could not compete; but unfortunately Niels Steensgaard gives no explanation of this deviation from an otherwise set pattern, dominated by the companies.

The above can probably be explained by the fact, that he is greatly inspired by van Leur.[11] Meanwhile Dr. Meilink-Roelofsz, among others, has criticized him (and thereby Niels Steensgaard) on one important point concerning the description of the Asian market. She criticizes van Leur for over-estimating its character of a peddling market, and she proves concurrently that the Asians besides the peddling trade were engaged in a voluminous bulk commodity trade.[12] Even though some of the discrepancy between van Leur and Meilink-Roelofsz can be traced back to different points of departure with regard to investigated areas in Asia, there can be no doubt, that Dr. Steensgaard ought more explicitly to have revised van Leur's insufficient concept "pedlar" and the unclarified term "the early Asian trade".

Another point of criticism should be brought forth in this context. Despite the author's contrary claims, the consumer prices of Asian wares in Europe were actually not much more stable after 1600, than they had been before 1600. Neither his diagram (p. 423), which shows the variation in pepper prices in Augsburg, Leipzig, Vienna and Antwerp 1581–1630, nor the price series worked out by other scholars, support Niels Steensgaard on this point. This is perhaps because he avoids taking up the strength of the monopolistic competiton, which the companies carried on in Europe; the major objective of both EIC and VOC not being to supply their own home markets, but to re-export as many Asian goods as possible to other European countries at high prices. Especially in this area competiton was often ruthless, and as a result the transparency of the market, as well as the prices, varied.

In the final evaluation of Dr. Steensgaard's results, it should be kept in mind, that he restricts the area of research already from the start, by focusing on the influence, which the institutional variables had upon the struggle between the different types of

[11] J. C. van Leur, *op. cit.*

[12] M. A. P. Meilink-Roelofsz, *Asian Trade and European Influence in the Indonesian Archipelago between 1500 and about 1630*, Haag, 1962.

trade structures. Consequently, only information concerning protection costs and the importance of the market's structure can be obtained — no other factors are illuminated. Therefore only one of two conclusions is possible: either the institutional variables were decisive, else they were not. One could have wished, that they had not been regarded as the final causes; but that the author instead had attempted to uncover the underlying causes, thereby possibly being able to point out a chain of crucial socio-economic relations, which had determined the institutions' features (structure of society, economic basis, technology etc.).

One ought also to be aware, that the author only takes up certain problems from the very wide area delimited in the earlier cited passage on p. 10. But at the same time, he meritoriously submits a series of problem formulations for others to make use of.

Basic problems are dealt with throughout the book. Here for example, as in many other works, the very advanced program of the Dutch General Governor in Batavia, Jan Pieterszoon Coen, dating from 1619, is related (407 ff). According to this, Dutch trade in Asia should be made to function through a permanently circulating capital in Asia, "the Indian capital", which was not in itself supposed to return to Europe; only part of the profit made in the trade between the many factories in Asia, was to be removed from circulation and sent to Europe. These contemplations over the non-personal capital, whose sole object is to multiply and give profit, are central parts of the soul of capitalism — and they contrast sharply with the feudal period, where the contributor most probably would have withdrawn capital as well as profit, at one time, investing both in land instead.

In this example as in many others throughout the book, it is essential that the reader is actively engaged in the matter at hand, if just a fairly moderate profit is to be attained. Dr. Steensgaard is apt, in his account, to leave unexplicit whom he is actually polemizing against; which results are really new; the definitions, from which he makes his departure etc.

Thus for him it is probably essential, that the book, to some extent, is regarded as an empirically based contribution to the controversy on the transition from a feudal to a capitalistic structure of society.[13] In contrast to orthodox Marxist theorists, he points out, that considerable revenue from primary and secondary producing sectors was transfered to a purely exploiting sector, as a result of the latter's possession of means of power in the 16th and 17th Centuries — and not as a result of possession of means of production. Here we are in the midst of a stimulating theory: one which erases the traditional distinction between political and economic factors, and which might well prove to be valid in other contexts as well.

The few objections that have been raised, hopefully do not displace the impression of a book, whose author, despite difficulties in the shape of fragmentary, polyglot and diffuse sources, raises and answers many fundamental questions. As a whole the book turns away from the traditional, detailed studies performed without outlook, and calls instead for investigations — which are broader in scope both with regard to time and place, which put to use theories and concepts from the other social sciences — which can be placed in a larger context. Thus it is unavoidable that Niels Steensgaard, in the course of the book, breaks with a series of theories accepted up till now. For the reader who is capable of retaining a broad view in the course of his devotion to the matter, this story about the carracks, caravans and companies is consequently surprising as well as thought-provoking — besides being extremely exciting, as a result of its picturesque and dramatic details.

Erik Gøbel.

Heinz Halm: Die Ausbreitung der šāfiʿitischen Rechtsschule von den Anfängen bis zum 8./14. Jahrhundert (Beihefte zum Tübinger Atlas des Vorderen Orients, Reihe B, Nr. 4, Dr. Ludwig Reichert Verlag, Wiesbaden 1974, 340 p.).

The spread of the Šāfiʿī school

As a supplement to certain of the maps in the "Tübinger Atlas des Vorderen Orients", *Heinz Halm* has published a collection of

[13] N. Steensgaard, "Fra feudalisme til kapitalisme", *Studier i historisk metode* vol. VIII (Marxism och historieforskning. Föredrag från Nordiska fackkonferensen för historisk metodlära i Godby, Åland, 8–10 maj 1972), Oslo, 1973.

material, an inventory of the sources for a study of the diffusion and significance of the Šāfiʿī school of law, from its beginnings to the 13th–14th century AD.

The author has chosen one of the maḏāhib for his study, in order to make an exposition, by way of example, of the spread and development of islamic fiḳh. The choice of the Šāfiʿī school is due to its importance in the regions which the Atlas is intended to cover and to the fact that the source material is more favourable for the analysis of the history of the Sāfiʿites than for the study of the maḏhab of Abū Ḥanīfa, which would have been the alternative. Contributary causes for the choice the author has no doubt found in the significance of the Šāfiʿī maḏhab in Egypt under the Ayyūbides and Mamlūks and in the connection between the Šāfiʿī school of law and Ašʿarite theology.

Mr. Halm carries the account of the school in Iran and Irak forward till the Mongol invasion in the 13th century, while its history in Syria-Palestine, Egypt, Hejaz and Yemen is treated up to the end of the 14th century. Thus the Šāfiʿism in East Africa and its spread over the Indian Ocean, being of a later date, are beyond the scope of the work.

The author's main source is Tāǧ-ad-dīn ʿAbd-al-Wahhāb b. ʿAlī as-Subkī's aṭ-Ṭabaḳāt aš-šafiʿīya al-kubrā (and as to Yemen, al-Ǧaʿdī's Ṭabakāt fuḳahā' al-Yaman), and the informations there have been supplemented by an exhaustive inventory of other material from other works of ṭabaḳāt, and of local history, and from relevant biographic, bibliographic and annalistic literature. He not only presents the material, but subjects the sources and their material to a critical analysis, points out its deficiencies, various tendencies etc., and relates in this connection previous investigations and their results.

The book begins with some introductory paragraphs, discussing the source problems, the beginnings of the Šāfiʿī maḏhab and the itineraries of its diffusion, the offices and honorary posts occupied by leading fuḳahā (ra'īs al-maḏhab, ra'īs al-ʿulamā', ra'īs al-balad, ḳāḍī, ḳāḍī l-ḳuḍāt, ḫaṭīb, mudarris etc.), and, finally, the relations between the Ašʿarite kalām and this maḏhab.

After these introductory chapters the disposition of the book follows geographical principles, the regions are treated separately, from the eastern parts of the islamic territory (Ḫorāsān, Ḫwārazm etc.), via Mesopotamia and Syria to Egypt and Arabia. Yemen is the last region which the author deals with at some length. The scanty notices of Šāfiʿism in al-Maġrib terminate the exposition. The author treats the places in every region in alphabetical order, except for certain important cities, i.e. the great centres for the study of theology and jurisprudence which are dealt with separately. For the smaller places and districts in Irak (where the old Sassanidic division of the districts still played a role) he has chosen a different disposition, and likewise for Upper Egypt. The space which the different places have got in the exposition is due to the sparseness or abundance of source material. as-Subkī, for instance, treats generally only the great centres, as Nīšāpūr, Marw, Bagdad, Damascus, Cairo, in his work. As for the less important places, the author presents the available notices, and as for the grand centres he gives us comprehensive accounts, disposed, as a rule, as follows:

1. First he discusses the beginnings of the Šāfiʿī madhab in the district or the place in question, and gives a critical analysis of the statements in the sources. Many a muḥaddit has listened to aš-Šāfiʿī or to his disciples without himself being a Šāfiʿī faḳīh. The compilators of the Ṭabaḳāt were of course intersted in attributing as many and as early scholars as possible to their own school of law. In this connection the author points out a reliable indication of when the Šāfiʿī school has taken root somewhere: It is when the Muḫtasar of Ismāʿīl b. Yaḥyā al-Muzanī is used in the teaching and study of fiḳh.

The author accounts for the itinerary of the madhab to the district, the filiations of masters and disciples from the early Šāfiʿī centres in Egypt, where the madhab had its origin, and Bagdad, are demonstrated — also with schematic tables.

2. Then he gives a survey of the Šāfiʿī fuḳahā' connected with the place. Particularly interesting are the exposés over the families or "dynasties" of Šāfiʿī scholars and jurisprudents. Offices and charges (ḳāḍī, mudarris, ḫaṭīb) tended to become hereditary beneficiaries from father to son, or son-in-law. Genealogical lists illustrate the exposition.

3. The author gives catalogues of ḳuḍāt who have officiated there, catalogues by no means limited to ḳuḍāt belonging to the Šāfiʿī school. He has, as far as the source material has made it possible, tried to attain completeness (with the exception of the small localities of Upper Egypt, where he refers to al-Udfuwī's aṭ-Ṭāliʿ as-saʿīd). To these catalogues he has often added lists of other functionaries, ḫuṭabā', mudarrisūn etc.

4. Then follows often an account of the different local madrasa-institutions, their foundation, the time during which they functioned, their teachers. Here too, the account is not limited to the academies or schools of the Šāfiʿī maḏhab.

5. The author treats also the question when the Ašʿarite theology established itself there, and its connections with the local adherents of the Šāfiʿī maḏhab, this being often a difficult question as the main source, as-Subkī, has an evident pro-Ašʿarite tendency.

6. The accounts of the antagonism, disputes and riots between different maḏāhib occupy a certain space in the exposé, riots caused by the rivalry for the official charges ḫaṭīb, ḳāḍī). In the eastern countries these disputes have not seldom led to street fighting and bloodshed between the adherents of aš-Šāfiʿī and Abū Ḥanīfa (sometimes with the šīʿites involved in the disputes). The riots get sometimes a special accentuation by the fact that the leading persons of the two schools belonged to or were related to different Arab tribes. In Egypt more peaceful relations prevailed between Šāfiʿites and Mālikites, they even collaborated. It occurred that famous jurisprudents were teaching both according to the Šāfiʿī and the Mālikī maḏhab. It was in fact under the Mamlūk sultans the custom originated to have four ḳuḍāt in the more important cities, representing the different maḏāhib.

Many interesting features in the cultural and educational development of Islam become apparent in Mr Halm's treatise. We get for instance more material to illustrate the development of the madrasa-institution and its spread from East to West, and we can consider the immense importance of a donor and patron like Niẓām-al-mulk for the Šāfiʿī maḏhab and for the islamic theology in general. 14 "Niẓāmīya" academies are mentioned in the book, and nine of them have their name from the great vezier.

We can often see what a decisive role just the political leaders have had for the dominance of one madhab or another.

The author also demonstrates how the consolidation and spread of the madhab are due to the activity of certain especially prominent scholars and teachers. As the material is arranged geographically in the book, such a person is often treated in several different passages — the learned in the Islamic world was an ambulatory person who visited many places and teachers as a student, and later functioned as teacher and jurisconsult in different places and districts during his career.

The reading of the book demands certain abilities, especially a rather profound knowledge not only in islamic fiḳh, its terminology and contents, but in islamic theology and in the early history of the islamic peoples as well, a knowledge which is taken for granted. For those who are interested in these fields, the book will certainly prove to be, with its four comprehensive indices, a valuable aid in the study of the history of islamic jurisprudence, theology and education. Mr. Halm has collected and systematized an immense material for the profit of these studies.

Jan Hjärpe.

Ligeti, Louis [Hrsg.]: Researches in Altaic Languages. Papers read at the 14th Meeting of the Permanent International Altaistic Conference held in Szeged, August 22–28, 1971. Bibliotheca Orientalis Hungarica XX. Akadémiai Kiadó, Budapest 1975.

Die ständige Altaistenkonferenz — die „PIAC“ — ist mit ihren jährlichen, immer zahlreicher besuchten Sitzungen zu einem hervorragenden Forum wissenschaftlichen Meinungsaustausches auf dem Gesamtgebiet der Altaistik geworden. Der vorliegende Sammelband, der 36 Vorträge von der 1971 in Szeged abgehaltenen 14. Sitzung enthält, zeugt sowohl von dieser wichtigen Rolle der PIAC als auch überhaupt von einer beachtlichen Vitalisierung der altaistischen Forschung in den letzten Jahren.

Allerdings ist „Altaistik“ in diesem Zusammenhang als ein weiter und recht unpräziser Sammelbegriff zu verstehen. Einige Beiträge betreffen lediglich eine der altaischen Einzelgruppen.

Turkologische Beiträge liefern Sir Gerard Clauson („The foreign elements in early Turkish" [wobei „Turkish" = Turkic]), Ė. J. Fazylov („Turkic languages in the works of oriental philologists [11th–18th cc.]), L. Hřebíček („The phonemic structure of the first syllable in several Turkic languages"), I. Laude-Cirtautas („Uzbek female folk healers"), E. Lot-Falck („Ütügän chez les Jakut"), J. Lotz („The Turkic vowel system and phonological theory"), P. Mijatev („Gegenseitige Beziehungen und fremde Einflüsse auf die Sprache der Türken in Bulgarien"), B. Scherner („Probleme arabischer und neupersischer Lehnwörter im Tatarischen"), A. S. Tveritinova („Lexical material as a source of studying agricultural traditions of the Ottoman empire"), N. Yüce („Einige auffällige Gerundialformen im Türkischer und P. Zieme („Ein uigurischer Text über die Wirtschaft manichäischer Klöster im uigurischen Reich"). Mongolistische Aufsätze liegen von M.-L. Beffa & R. Hamayon („Le nom verbal en mongol") J. A. Boyle („Some additional notes on the Mongolian names in the History of the Nation of the Archers"), L. Lőrincz („Ein historisches Lied in der Geheimen Geschichte der Mongolen") und L. Manaljaw („Two translations of the Secret History of the Mongols in the Ulanbator state library") vor.

In anderen Beiträgen werden zwar verschiedene Aspekte der gegenseitigen Beziehungen zwischen den altaischen Einzelgruppen und Einzelsprachen behandelt, jedoch mit mehr oder weniger deutlicher Vorsicht in bezug auf die genetischen Verhältnisse, insbesondere die Urverwandtschaftsfrage. Hierher gehören die Aufsätze von E. Hovdhaugen („The Mongolian suffix *-lig* and its Turkic origin"), S. Kenesbaew & Sch. Sarybaew („Kasachisch-mongolische lexikalische Vergleiche in der Verwandtschaftsterminologie und in den Namen der Körperteile"), K. M. Musaev („On some plant names in the Altaic languages"), E. A. Novgoroda („Ethnocultural relations of the tribes of the Mongol Altai [Mongol-Altaic *Tergen*]"), A. Róna-Tas („The Altaic theory and the history of a Middle Mongolian loan word in Chuvash"), C. D. Sanzheyev (A Mongolistic reconstruction of Turkisms"), N. P. Shastina („Mongol and Turkic ethnonyms in the Secret History of the Mongols"), A. Trétiakoff („Comparaison des lois de succession des voyelles en turc et en mongol") und H.-P.

Vietze („Rückläufige Wörterbücher und ihre Bedeutung für die altaistische Forschung").

„Über die Wandlungen der Ostgrenze der awarischen Machtsphäre" ist der Titel des Aufsatzes von S. Scadeczky-Kardoss.

Mehr oder weniger direkt mit der „altaischen Theorie" befassen sich die restlichen zehn Beiträge. N. A. Baskakov behandelt Personalendungen („On the common origin of the categories of person and personal possession in the Altaic languages"), T. A. Bertagaev diskutiert semantische Beziehungen einiger Einzelwörter („On some common semantic indices of root elements in the Altaic languages"), N. Z. Gadžieva stellt recht allgemeine Überlegungen über Syntax und Morphologie an („The role of Altaic languages in the reconstruction of the Turkic syntactic archetype"), E. P. Hamp führt eine generativistisch angelegte „feature"-Analyse der altaischen Nasale und Liquidae durch („The Altaic non-obstruents"), L. Ligeti kritisiert G. Clausons bekannte (antialtaistische) Lexikostatistik („La théorie altaique et la lexico-statistique"), T. Tekin bringt neue türkische (aber für die altaische Theorie belangvolle) Beispiele für „Zetazismus" und „Sigmatismus" („Further evidence for 'zetacism' and 'sigmatism'") und V. I. Tsintsius behandelt Konsonantenkorrespondenzen der altaischen Sprachen („On the Pre-Altaic system of consonants"). Zwei Beiträge beziehen — wie es scheint, ohne Zögern — auch das Japanische in eine altaische Sprachfamilie mit ein: die Aufsätze von R. A. Miller („Japanese-Altaic evidence and the Proto-Turkic 'zetacism-sigmatism'") und von Sh. Murayama („Altaische Komponente der japanischen Sprache"). D. Sinor schließlich erweitert den Rahmen in anderer Richtung und bringt eine Reihe uralisch-tungusischer Wortgleichungen („Uralo-Tunguz lexical correspondences").

Die sehr unterschiedlichen Einstellungen zur genetischen Frage, die in diesem Band zum Vorschein kommen, sollen hier weder bewertet noch im einzelnen referiert werden. Der Fächer der Meinungen reicht von restloser Überzeugung bis zu offener Skepsis. In einigen Fällen werden im Grunde genommen nur alte Argumente wiederholt, bisweilen — wie im Falle der syntaktischen „Rekonstruktion" — ist die Diskussion viel zu wenig konkret, aber einige Beiträge zeigen wiederum durch ein verfeinertes methodisches Vorgehen ,dass es auch auf diesen schwierigen Gebiet möglich ist (wie es im instruktiven Beitrag von A. Róna-Tas heisst) „to proceed from the known to the unknown, going ahead step-by-step". Jede Theorie, und sei sie noch so gesund, hat Kritik nötig; die vorsichtige, undogmatische, gegen voreilige Schlüsse warnende, alte Axiome immer wieder in Frage stellende und auf einwandfreie komparatistische Methoden bestehende Haltung einiger Fachgenossen sollte nicht als Destruktionstrieb betrachtet, sondern als notwendiges Korrektiv, als Bewährungsprobe und also ingesamt als positives Inzitament eingeschätzt werden. In einigen Beiträgen ist diese Erkenntnis deutlich zu spüren; es sei hier nur auf L. Ligetis anerkennende Charakteristik des — inzwischen leider verstorbenen — grossen Skeptikers G. Clauson hingewiesen: „/. . ./ adversaire et en même temps promoteur éminent de la théorie altaïque" (S. 115).

Ein ähnlicher Wert kann gewiss auch denjenigen Beiträgen beigemessen werden, die nicht direkt komparatistisch orientiert sind, aber dennoch Gemeinsamkeiten und Unterschiede von irgendeinem generellen Gesichtspunkt aus diskutieren. Sehr interessant sind z.B. die voraussetzungslosen Strukturvergleiche einer früher nicht üblichen Art, wie sie von L. Hřebíček und A. Trétiakoff angestellt werden. Die Lehnwortstudien, die scheinbar nur eine Einzelsprache betreffen — etwa B. Scherners Aufsatz über das Tatarische —, dienen selbstverständlich auch dadurch einem weiteren Zweck, dass sie Kriterien zur Unterscheidnung des für die genetische Frage relevanten bzw. irrelevanten Materials sichern. Es ist auch zu begrüssen, dass rein sprachtheoretische Diskussionen anhand von Material aus altaischen Sprachen im Rahmen der PIAC-Sitzungen und der PIAC-Publikationen geführt werden können. Der einzige Beitrag dieser Art im vorliegenden Sammelband ist der Aufsatz von J. Lotz, der sich der in letzter Zeit immer häufiger auftretenden Kritik am strukturalistischen Phonembegriff anschliesst und verschiedene „physical" bzw. „psychological" Analysen als Basis for eine Strukturierung des türkeitürkischen Vokalsystems vergleicht.

Lars Johanson.

Giuseppe Tucci: Die Religionen Tibets. P. 1–291 in TUCCI and HEISSIG, „Die Religionen Tibets und der Mongolei", vol. 20 of Die Religionen der Menschheit, Stuttgart (Kohlhammer) 1970.

The collection „Die Religionen der Menschheit", edited by C. M. Schröder, has in the course of a few years become a standard work of reference and a valuable source of insight and information for historians of religion. For Tibetologists it is extremely encouraging that a separate volume has been devoted to Tibetan (and Mongolian) religion; the originality and importance of Tibetan religion within the religious experience of mankind as a whole is thus implicitly acknowledged. Tibetologists are not a numerous group; and by others, Tibetan studies have tended to be considered a minor discipline subordinate to Buddhology, Sinology, Indology, etc. It is time that the independence, originality, and rich variety of Tibetan civilization be fully and openly recognized. Noone is better qualified to substantiate this claim than Professor Giuseppe Tucci, the undisputed nestor of Western Tibetology.

The present volume is beyond doubt the most comprehensive, and in many ways most valuable, study of Tibetan religion to have appeared — or which is likely to appear for many years to come. The author's competence and unrivalled mastery of Indo-Tibetan studies is too well known to require further mention; when a book, therefore, appears which is described by the author as „Versuch einer Rechenschaftsablegung über die Ergebnisse langjähriger Beschäftigung mit dem tibetischen Buddhismus" (p. 9), it goes without saying that it represents a landmark in Tibetan studies.

This being said, it must be added that the book is not really suitable as an *introduction* to Tibetan religion. Apart from the period (c. 650–1050 A.D.) during which Buddhism in successive stages established itself in Tibet, there is no sustained attempt (beyond a chronological table, p. 276–81) to trace the *historical development* of Tibetan religion on the doctrinal, literary, or political plane, with which the reader must familiarize himself elsewhere. On the whole, the author presents the religion of Tibet as fully developed in our own day (and as he himself has studied it in Tibet). Nor is there more than fleeting reference to those basic beliefs and doctrines which Tibetans share with other Buddhists. The book is a testament, the summary of the results of a life-time of travel and study; it is an entirely original work, a broad review of Tibetan religion, and as such is based on the author's own observations, evaluations, and extensive familiarity with Tibetan religious literature.

Thus there is little scope for lengthy quotations from Tibetan texts; and perhaps it might be mentioned that although considerations of space fully explain this, it is nevertheless regrettable that the author has not been able to incorporate certain passages *in extenso* to which he refers, the texts in question frequently being of difficult access. One might also have wished that the Tibetan Bibliography (p. 282–85), which comprises 163 titles, had been more informative; only the titles, and in a few cases, the name of the author, are given. It is, in fact, difficult to see which principles the author has followed when organising the Bibliography. Thus from the *gZi-brǰid* (see D. L. Snellgrove, *The Nine Ways of Bon. Excerpts from gZi-brjid edited and translated by . . .*, London Oriental Series vol. 18, London 1967) chpts. 10, 18, 21, 22, 25, and 48 are listed separately as Nos. 160, 119, 29, 30, 33, and 120 respectively by Tucci, while the entire work is apparently listed thrice: Nos. 6, 123, and 131. A systematic arrangement of the Tibetan sources, with full description of each text, would have added to the usefulness of the work.

The first two chapters deal with the First (p. 13–29) and Second (p. 30–42) Propagation of Buddhism in Tibet. The importance of the study of the *rJogs-pa čhen-po* ("Great Perfection") for a fuller understanding of the formation of the various lamaist schools, particularly the *rÑiṅ-ma-pa* and the post-dynastic *Bon-po*, has been increasingly recognized in recent years; thus Snellgrove, *Nine Ways* p. 15, suggests that "fundamental to this interesting problem is a comparative study of the tantras and the *rDzogs-chen* ('Great Perfection') literature of the two oldest 'Tibetan Buddhist' groups" — words which are fully endorsed by Tucci (p. 19), who likewise very rightly observes (p. 217) that the *Bar-do* rituals of the Bonpo and the Nyingmapa appear to be „vom gleichen Prototyp abgeleitet".

The following chapter („Allgemeine Charakteristik des Lamaismus", p. 43–61) deals briefly, among other topics, with the formation of the later lamaist schools. On one point, however, I cannot agree with the author, viz. when he states (p. 43) that „Am Ausgang des 15. Jahrhunderts . . . hat der Lamaismus seine endgültige Gestalt gewonnen, sein Lehrgebäude und Ritual unabänderlich festgelegt". This may be true, on the whole, of ritual; it is less true in the field of doctrine where in the 19th cent. the *ris-med* ("Non-partial") movement, radiating from Derge in Eastern Tibet and represented by figure like Koṅ-sprul Blo-gros mtha'-yas (1813–99), represents, through its grandiose syncretistic effort, the final stage in the development of Tibetan religious thought. See *Kongtrul's Encyclopaedia of Indo-Tibetan Culture,* Śatapiṭaka Series vol. 80, New Delhi 1970, "Introduction" by E. Gene Smith, p. 1–87.

Chap. IV (p. 62–126), „Die Lehren der bedeutendsten Schulen", is perhaps the most interesting and important part of the book. Here the erudition of the author, and above all, his profound familiarity with Tibetan tantric literature, presents the reader with a penetrating and authoritative introduction to the basic presuppositions of Tibetan Buddhism. Many technical terms are elucidated, and new and valuable insights offered in a field which the author is, I believe, the first to treat in both a comprehensive and systematic way. Certain schools are dealt with in detail: the *J̌o-naṅ-pa* (p. 84–87), the *bKa'-brgyud-pa* (p. 87–88), the *rÑiṅ-ma-pa* (p. 94–106), and the *gČod* (p. 106–12).

Chaps. V („Mönchtum, Klosterleben, religiöser Kalender und Feste", p. 127–81) and VI („Die Volksreligion", p. 182–234), likewise provide a most comprehensive and informative survey of the respective subjects. The interesting illustrations (pen-drawings) increase the value of these sections.

The final chapter (Chap. VII, p. 235–75) is entitled „Die Bon-Religion". The extreme complexity of the so-called Bon-religion is of course well-known, and the author is, I think, justified in concentrating on those elements which are essentially non-Buddhist, although I disagree with his assumption (p. 235) that later, lamaistic Bonpo tradition represents a direct continuation of pre-Buddhist *bon* (see my article "Aspects of the Origin of the Buddhist Tradition in Tibet", *Numen* 19 (1972), p. 22–40). One might perhaps have wished that the lamaist, monastic Bonpo tradition had been dealt with from a doctrinal point of view along with the other schools in Chap. IV, but it is quite probable that the necessary material (above all, the Bonpo tantras) was not at the author's disposal at the time of writing. As it stands, the chapter is nevertheless an extremely useful survey of Bon. In particular, much space is devoted to descriptions of various cosmogonies to be found in Bonpo texts (p. 237–39, 242–44, 259–60). One error must however be corrected: *sgo-bži mjod-lṅa* is not "vier Tore . . . und . . . fünf Schätze", but "The Four Portals with the Treasury as the Fifth", cf. Snellgrove, *Nine Ways* p. 16.

A few printing errors may be corrected: p. 54 *bSod nams hla ma* for °*bla-ma*; p. 268 *Draṅ pa nam mk'a'* for *Dran*°; p. 285 No. 123 *gZi brjd* for °*brjid.*

In the Introduction to his work, Tucci points out (p. 7) the three basic difficulties which confronted him at the outset. The first was the sheer enormity of the task of giving a comprehensive survey of Tibetan religion. No single person or even group of persons can achieve familiarity with the entire corpus of Tibetan religious literature, and for a long time to come, the study of this literature is likely to raise more questions than it solves. Secondly, the author emphasizes the necessity of understanding the theoretical basis of lamaism, „denn diese bedingen, wie immer im Buddhismus, die konkrete religiöse Erfahrung". A purely "phenomenological" approach would never achieve satisfactory results. Finally, a formidable obstacle was presented by the difficulty of translating the technical terminology of Tibetan Buddhism. The extent to which the translator, or — as in this case — the mediator, should *interpret* Tibetan words and ideas in terms of a Western conceptual system is always a difficult question; the reader who is interested in a fuller discussion of this problem is referred to R. A. Stein, *Vie et chants de 'Brug-pa kun-legs le yogin*, Paris 1972, p. 29–36. Here it will be sufficient to say that the present volume fully demonstrates that these three problems have been, to a very considerable extent, given a satisfactory solution by Professor Tucci.

Per Kværne.

G. Tucci: Transhimalaya (Archaeologia Mundi), Geneva 1973 (Nagel). 239 p., including 33 ill. in colour, 177 in black and white.

Following his general survey of Tibetan culture (*Tibet: Land of Snows*, London 1967) and his comprehensive study of Tibetan religion (*Die Religionen Tibets*, in: Tucci and Heissig „Die Religionen Tibets und der Mongolei", Stuttgart 1970), Professor G. Tucci has once more published a work summarizing a lifetime of research, this time dealing with the archaeology of Tibet.

Archaeology in the strict sense of the word, i.e. systematic excavations, have, for historical and political reasons, to all intents and purposes been impossible in Tibet, a rare exception being the excavations conducted by P. Aufschnaiter in the vicinity of Lhasa (see his "Prehistoric Sites Discovered in the Inhabited Regions of Tibet", *East and West*, VII (1956), p. 74). Although Chinese archaeologists have presumably been free to conduct archaeological excavations following the events of 1959, Tucci observes (p. 14) that in fact such excavations have apparently so far not been undertaken; at least no results have been published.

These facts accordingly condition the scope and methodology of the present work. As Jean Macadé, Professor of Archaeology at the University of Bordeaux remarks in his Preface (p. 9), "this volume cannot seek . . . to review the problems, the methods and the results of a scientifically conducted exploration of the country's past. The aim must therefore be the more modest one of drawing up a provisional inventory of the visible remains and the works of art which have survived the centuries, setting out a preliminary basis for discussion, and outlining a programme of work for the future". — Keeping this extended definition of archaeology in mind, it must be admitted that it would be difficult to find a more competent author to deal with the subject than Tucci; as Marcadé remarks, he is "undoubtedly the greatest living expert in his field and has himself discovered, during his travels in Tibet, much of the material at present available".[1]

[1] Even so, the dust-jacket is more than a little inaccurate when it states that Tucci has been "visiting the country almost every year" (!). It is surprising that the publishers have not preferred to avoid such absurdities, since no Western scholar has been permitted to visit the country since 1950.

While this of course is true, it must be pointed out that much of the material — including photographic material — published in the present volume has previously been published in more elaborate form. In particular, mention must be made of *Indo-Tibetica*, published in 7 vols. by Reale Academia d'Italia, Studi e documenti, Rome 1932–41 (dealing chiefly with Western and South-Central Tibet); *Tibetan Painted Scrolls*, 3 vols., Rome 1949 (dealing with the art of the thangkas, but also with murals and statues in the temples of the West-Tibetan province of Tsang (gCaṅ), vol. I, p. 171–208); *The Tombs of the Tibetan Kings*, Serie Orientale Roma, vol. I, Rome 1950 (dealing with the tombs of various Tibetan kings of the royal dynasty, situated in the Yarlung valley in Central Tibet); and finally, *Preliminary Report on Two Scientific Expeditions in Nepal*, Serie Orientale Roma, vol. X, Rome 1956 (in which, inter alia, material from the Tibetan-speaking areas of Northern Nepal is published). — However, a summary and evaluation of this enormous mass of material is highly welcome, both for the layman and the specialist.

In accordance, then, with the definition of archaeology given above, Tucci deals with the following subjects:

1. Metal objects (mainly various amulets) and megalithic structures, chiefly from the prehistoric (pre-Buddhist) period (p. 33–61). In the absence of systematic excavations, it is not — with a few exceptions — possible to date these sites and objects with any degree of accuracy, nor can one, in most cases, determine their use and symbolism. It is interesting to note the presence, among the metal objects used as talismans by the present population, of a number of Nestorian crosses (pl. 29), indicating the presence of Nestorian Christians in Tibet, presumably Mongolians during the Yüan period (p. 39).

2. Royal tombs, architecture (military and civil), temples and stūpas from the period of the introduction and consolidation of Buddhism, i.e. from the 7th to the 11th centuries (p. 61–137). In connection with the inscriptions carved on pillars erected on tombs, at temples, and in commemoration of treatises during this period, the author points to the need of a systematic study of Tibetan epigraphy. — In his discussion (p. 61–63) of the royal tombs in the Yarlung valley (which the author himself had the

opportunity to inspect in 1948), somewhat surprisingly, reference is not made to the most recent study of this subject, viz. Chap. 16, "The Tombs of the Tibetan Kings", p. 380–97 in E. Haarh, *The Yar-kluṅs Dynasty*, Copenhagen 1969, where a reconstruction of the tombs is attempted, chiefly on the basis of an analysis of the later literary tradition. The opinion of an expert like Tucci regarding this reconstruction would have been most valuable.

3. A survey of the influence exerted by the various neighbouring cultures (Kashmir, Kulu, the Gangetic Plain, Nepal, Bengal, China, Central Asia) on the development of Tibetan art (i.e. painting and sculpture), and the gradual formation of a native Tibetan artistic style (p. 137–199). The subject has been treated in great detail in *Tibetan Painted Scrolls*. Tucci reminds us (p. 200) that "In this study the central point to remember is that Tibet is not an island cut off from the rest of the world but a meeting place of different cultures, an area in which India, the Himalayan regions, China, Iran, and Central Asia all exert their various influences". We are thus reminded of the cosmopolitan nature of Tibetan civilization of which in all probability only archaeological remains will be left for future generations of scholars to study in its homeland, (then, ironically, a more comprehensive "Archaeology of Tibet" will perhaps be written!), but which still exhibits considerable vitality in exile and in certain parts of the Himalayan region.

The number of printing errors is commendably small, but with greater care it should have been possible to avoid errors like the following:

p. 38. 1.4 from bottom: Plate 67, read: Plate 27
p. 52. 1.1: Mrs. A. W. Macdonald, read: Mr. A. W. M°
p. 209, 2nd col.: "Ming dynasty (1368–1644)" should be transferred to the 3rd column (i.e. from "Iran" to "China").

There is some confusion regarding the illustrations, presumably due to insufficient communication between the author and the publishers. Thus plates 157 and 158 do not, as stated on p. 177, line 11, show Jain statues (plate 157 shows statues of Rāma, Viṣṇu, and Buddha). Presumably there is confusion with the Jain statue, likewise preserved at Zhithok, which is shown in

Tibetan Painted Scrolls, vol. 1, p. 172, fig. 2. Nor do the plates 147, 151–153, in fact show statues from Zhithok, as implied on p. 177, cf. the comments to the individual illustrations on p. 229–30: pl. 147 is from Kojarnāth, 151 from Sakya, 152 from Kongardsong (Goṅ-dkar-rjoṅ), and 153 from Sakya. The confusion is increased when we read, on p. 179, that pl. 147 is from Samye!

In spite of these inaccuracies, there is every reason to thank the publishers (Nagel) for having produced a beautiful book, and to commend them for having resisted the temptation to retouch the many photos taken by the author's assistants in the course of his expeditions — the somewhat inferior quality of some of these photos is fully explained by the extremely difficult conditions in which they were taken.

Per Kværne.

H. E. Richardson: Ch'ing Dynasty Inscriptions at Lhasa. Serie Orientale Roma XLVII, Rome 1974. 98 pp. + 1 map.

Hugh E. Richardson first visited Lhasa in 1936 where he lived until 1950, first as the representative of Great Britain and later, from 1947 to 1950, as that of India. In a long series of scholarly books and articles his vast first-hand knowledge of Tibetan history and culture, combined with philological and historical erudition, has been placed at the disposal of other Tibetologist as well as the general public. Certainly no European knows pre-1950 Lhasa as intimately as Mr. Richardson, and the present volume is to a considerable extent the outcome of on-the-spot observations.

All known inscriptions from the period of the Ch'ing (Manchu) dynasty at Lhasa, totalling 19, are discussed: their location, appearance, date, contents, and historical background. Those which have Tibetan versions are translated and the Tibetan text published. Although the Chinese versions of most of the inscriptions have been preserved in Chinese sources (cf. M. Jametel, *L'épigraphie chinoise au Tibet*, Paris 1880), several inscriptions are described for the first time in the present volume.

For convenience, the inscriptions may be grouped as follows:

a) Two Imperial Edicts, inscribed in Chinese, Manchu, Mongolian, and Tibetan: that of 1721 (the "Dzungar Edict", p. 5–16), and that of 1792 (the "Gorkha Edict", p. 39–47). The Tibetan version of the latter has previously been translated by Sir Charles Bell, *Tibet Past and Present*, London 1924. The present translation, however, represents a considerable improvement. To this group also belongs the long edict, dating from 1808, concerning the selection of the 9th Dalai Lama, also in four languages (p. 64–88, previously translated from the Tibetan by L. A. Waddell in JRAS, 1910).

b) Inscriptions concerning the founding of chapels, either bilingual (*Grva-bži* in 1761, p. 22–27; *Kun-bde-gliṅ* in 1794, p. 61–63), or in Chinese only (*Ge-sar* Chapel on the *Bar-ma-ri* in 1793, p. 61–63); or concerning administrative measures (the "Smallpox Edict" of 1794, bilingual; Tibetan text published and translated by H. E. Richardson in *Journal of Oriental Studies*, University of Hong Kong, vol. VI, 1–2 (1961–64), p. 115–122, translation of Chinese text by Professor R. A. Stein, ibid., p. 123–124).

c) Eight short inscriptions of a private nature dating from the years 1720–1728 and inscribed on different parts of the rock at the eastern end of the Potala hill by Chinese troops, commemorating their exploits in Tibet etc. Only short summaries are given (p. 16–22). To this group belongs a similar but longer inscription commemorating the victory over the Gorkhas (1793) (p. 48–53), of which an English abstract is given on the basis of Chinese sources by Professor L. Petech (p. 91–95).

d) Two inscriptions in Chinese, the text of which has not been recorded (p. 52, p. 64), and the "Tablet of the Double Devotion" commemorating the two Ambans killed by the Tibetans in 1751 (in Chinese and Manchu, p. 54–55).

The present work is an important contribution in the field of Tibetan epigraphy. For the Chinese versions of the inscriptions, the author, not being a Sinologist, has benefited from the help of Professors Stein and Petech, whose contributions to the present volume are considerable. One might, however, have wished for a parallel edition of the Chinese and the Tibetan texts wherever possible, all the more so as the Tibetan versions are translated from Manchu or Chinese originals. A definitive study of these inscriptions will therefore necessitate a full-scale collaboration between a Tibetologist and a Sinologist (the Manchu and Mongolian versions do not seem to have been recorded).

Nevertheless the present volume provides a detailed and authoritative presentation of important sources for the history of Tibet in the 18th century, a century the fateful events of which — resulting in the establishing of Chinese suzerainty — were to play such an important part in shaping the tragic destiny of Tibet.

Per Kværne.

Franz Kielhorn: *Kleine Schriften mit einer Auswahl der epigraphischen Aufsätze,* herausgegeben von Wilhelm Rau. Teil 1–2. (Glasenapp-Stiftung, Band 3: 1–2). Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner Verlag GmbH, 1969. 8°, pp. XXIV, 1–616 + 617–1105. Together clothbound DM 92.–.

In his will, Helmuth von Glasenapp (1891–1963) allotted a considerable sum of money to the *Deutsche Morgenländische Gesellschaft* for the purpose of establishing a fund to promote Indology (see ZDMG 114, 1964, p. 2 and p. 9). It has been used for subsidizing the publication of a series (*Veröffentlichungen der*) *Glasenapp Stiftung,* the second volume of which contains a bibliography of Helmuth von Glasenapp himself by Zoltán Károlyi (1968). With the exception of the most recent volumes, Vol. 8 (*Indologen-Tagung* 1971, 1973) and Vol. 9 (H.-W. Köhler, *Śrad-dhā in der vedischen und altbuddhistischen Literatur,* 1973) that I shall review separately in *Studia Orientalia,* the publications that have appeared in this series consist of photomechanically reprinted collections of *Kleine Schriften* by leading Indologists. In the following I shall briefly introduce these volumes of collected papers that have appeared so far, with the exception of the first ones (Bd. 1:1–2, 1967) dedicated to Hermann Oldenberg and already reviewed in *Studia Orientalia* 40:5, 1970.

It may be said once and for all, that these publications are an indispensable aid for Indologists. In comparison to their bulk and their high level of book prices in the Western countries these volumes can be considered to be relatively moderately priced, bringing them within the reach not only of libraries but also of private scholars with limited resources. This is undoubtedly something for which we must be grateful to the publishers and the Glasenapp-Stiftung.

Franz Kielhorn's (1840–1908) papers have been aptly characterized by the editor, Wilhelm Rau: „Seine Arbeiten zur altindischen Grammatik, Chronologie und Epigraphik waren bei ihrem Erscheinen bahnbrechend, haben seither an Bedeutung nicht verloren und sind ein bleibendes Beispiel für den Wert methodischer Sorgfalt bei der Bewältigung historisch-philologischer Probleme“ (p. V). The *Epigraphia Indica* and the *Indian Antiquary*, in which they have mainly appeared, have long been accessible only in a few libraries. The 62 volumes with three index volumes of the IA (1872–1933) are, however, being reprinted at the moment, so that also Kielhorn's editions of Indian inscriptions can be consulted more widely in the future. These had to be omitted from the present collection for consideration of costs; only a few specimens and such inscriptions that have interest for the history of Indian literature have been included. Perhaps it will nevertheless be possible in the future to publish a third volume containing these contributions which cover over eight pages in the bibliography. Professor Rau has supplemented the Kielhorn bibliography by Jacob Wackernagel (1908), mainly by adding notes on the reprint editions and giving side numbers referring to the pages of the present publications. One misses, however, references to obituaries and other reviews of his life work. But the user of the book is easily in the position to amend this by using the literature cited in another book by Rau, namely *Bilder Hundert Deutscher Indologen*, Wiesbaden 1965, p. V.n.2, where also is found a photograph of Kielhorn on page 37. At the end of the second volume Rau also gives five indices on 21 pages, which considerably help the utilization of these papers — as Rau remarks in his preface, they are often not understood by mere reading.

Asko Parpola.

Hermann Jacobi: *Kleine Schriften*, herausgegeben von Bernhard Kölver. Teil 1–2. (Glasenapp-Stiftung, Band 4: 1–2). Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner Verlag GmbH, 1970. 8°, pp. XXII, 1–546 + 547–1156. Together clothbound DM 98,00.

Bernhard Kölver's bibliography of Hermann Jacobi's (1850–1937) works is based on that by Willibald Kirfel published in 1920. He has, however, completely rearranged it and added almost fifty titles that have appeared since 1920, including the obituaries of Jacobi, Festschrifte, and collections of papers; five new titles even date before 1920, but these are only English and French translations of Jacobi's papers published originally in German, the one with importance being J. J. Meyer's English version of his Mahārāṣṭrī reader, and a small book (26 p.) *On Jainism* published in the obscure place of Sholapur in 1914. Kölver has also indicated reprints[1], and distinguished independent publications, reviews and encyclopedia articles by setting bold face letters *B*, *R* and *L* in the left margin, while the right margin has the page numbers of the present volumes[2]. Excluded from this collection of papers are Jacobi's *Schriften zur indischen Poetik und Ästhetik* edited by Hans Losch (Darmstadt 1969) as well as his papers containing Jaina text editions and translation, which, Kölver hopes, will once be published as a separate volume. The extent of Jacobi's work is shown by the fact that even with these considerable omissions it was not possible to include all the rest of his *Kleine Schriften*. The contents of the two volumes are, nevertheless, fairly representative of his production, centering upon Prakrit, Jainism, Metrics, Poetics, Epics, Philosophy and Chronology.

Asko Parpola.

Paul Thieme: *Kleine Schriften*. Teil 1–2. (Glasenapp-Stiftung, Band 5: 1–2). Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner

---

[1] Which have recently been making many of Jacobi's still important books available again.

[2] The bibliography is arranged according to subjects, and titles belonging under several headings have been cited several times, but only once without parentheses.

Verlag GmbH, 1971. 8°, pp. XV, 1–412 + 413–815. Together clothbound DM 72,00.

George Buddruss, who has not put his name on the title page but signed the brief „Vorwort des Herausgebers", has (with the assistance of Oskar von Hinüber, Wilhelm Rau and Paul Thieme himself) prepared a bibliography of Paul Thieme (born in 1905), made a selection of his writings to be reprinted here, and provided a word index and an index locorum to them. The addenda (p. 789–94) and corrigenda (p. 795–8) apparently stem from Thieme. A few of Thieme's papers have been reprinted among contributions by other scholars in two volumes of the series *Wege der Forschung* published in Darmstadt (Bd. 165 = *Indogermanische Dichtersprache,* hrsg. von R. Schmitt, 1968, and Bd. 169 = *Zarathustra,* hrsg. von B. Schlerath, 1970). The first more extensive collection of his papers certainly fulfils a long-felt need to see them conveniently brought together. Taking into regard that these two volumes together are some 300 pages shorter than those reviewed above, one wonders why it has been necessary to leave out so many short papers or even the short ones among the monographs. In the preface it is claimed that „in der hier vorgelegten Sammlung sind die Studien zum Veda und zum Vyākaraṇa, sofern sie nicht in Buchform oder als längere, im Buchhandlung erhältliche Abhandlungen erschienen sind, vollständig nachgedruckt": yet one misses some longer reviews in these fields that have been in the centre of Thieme's studies, as they were in Louis Renou's (for Thieme's views of the controversies between himself and Renou, cf. p. 722 ff.). We hope that when a supplementary volume is published containing Thieme's future contributions, it will also include his more important earlier works left out here.

Asko Parpola.

Wilhelm Geiger: *Kleine Schriften zur Indologie und Buddhismuskunde,* herausgegeben von Heinz Bechert. (Glasenapp-Stiftung, Band 6). Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner Verlag GmbH, 1973. 8°, pp. XXXIII, 707. Clothbound DM 72,00.

The volume dedicated to Wilhelm Geiger (1856–1943) differs from the others in this series in that it is considerably shorter and contains, for the sake of convenience, a separate table of contents according to subject in addition to the complete bibliography of Wilhelm Geiger. The latter follows a chronological order, but lists the reviews after the independent publications; it pays full attention also to Geiger's „Redaktionelle Tätigkeit", „Fest- und Gedenkschriften für Wilhelm Geiger", and „Biographien und biographische Notizen über W. Geiger" „Bibliographien der Werke W. Geigers" and „Nicht veröffentlichte Vorträge Geigers". The reprinted papers have also been marked with an asterisk in the bibliography; they cover only a small part of his production but comprise his most important Indological papers, which concentrate on Buddhism and Pāli as well as the chronicles,history, culture, and languages of Ceylon. Geiger has also made notable contributions in the Iranian field — his *Ostiranische Kultur im Altertum* (1882) being the counterpart of Zimmer's *Altindisches Leben* — and one can only agree with the editor when he says: „Es wäre wünschenswert, wenn auch seine kleineren Schriften zur Iranistik noch nachgedruckt werden könnten". Professor Bechert has also taken the trouble of providing "Corrigenda" (p. 645–9) and "Addenda" (p. 650–6) chiefly on the basis of Geiger's own hand copies kept in the library of the South Asia Institute of the University of Heidelberg in addition to three indices: a word index, an index of names and subjects, and an index locorum (p. 659–707), prepared with the help of several assistants.

Asko Parpola.

Heinrich Lüders: *Kleine Schriften,* herausgegeben von Oskar von Hinüber. (Glasenapp-Stiftung, Band 7). Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner Verlag GmbH, 1973. 8°, pp. XIV, 561, 6 tables. Clothbound DM 58,00.

This volume supplements the well-known collection of Heinrich Lüders' (1869–1943) papers that was published under the title *Philologica Indica* in 1940 in Göttingen. In addition to important articles on various aspects of the Indian literature and cultural history which appeared after *Philologica Indica* went into press, it comprises Lüders' older contributions in the field of Indian epigraphy. The bibliography, which aims at completeness, is partially based on an unpublished one by W. Siegling submitted for the *Jahrbuch der Preussischen Akademie der Wissenschaften von* 1943 that never came out. Besides page numbers on the right referring to the present volume it also has asterisks indicating the papers available in *Philologica Indica*, a work also in need of reprinting. Various (selective) indices fill eleven pages at the end.

Our thanks are due to the editors, the names of Helmuth von Glasenapp, and the publishers for these very useful volumes. We express our sincere hope that other similar publications will follow.

Asko Parpola.

M. B. Emeneau: Toda songs. Clarendon Press: Oxford University Press, 1971, Octavo, xlviii, 1004 pages, 5 plates. Price: £ 11.

In this veritable landmark in Indology, Professor Emeneau presents the main bulk of the field material collected by him in 1935–8 in the Nilgiri mountains of South India from the small but highly interesting tribe of the Todas, numbering according to the 1961 *Census of India* only 765 persons. The texts it contains form the basis on which rest the numerous important papers on the Todas that have appeared from his pen in the meanwhile. The introduction (p. xiii–xlvii) avoids repeating what has already been said in these earlier papers, listed in the bibliography at the beginning of the introduction: they are obligatory reading for the user of the present book. Many of these papers are conveniently accessible in: M. B. Emeneau, *Dravidian linguistics, ethnology and folktales: Collected papers*, Annamalainagar 1967 (The Annamalai University, Linguistics Department Publications no. 8), which is not mentioned, perhaps because the papers have unfortunately not been photomechanically reprinted, but reset with some misprints. The chief bulk of the volume under review consists of the Toda text and English translation of 260 songs (15 of them duplicate versions), with individual introductions (p. 1–742). Explicative notes, which are needed to make the songs intelligible to non-Toda readers, form a separate section

(p. 743–830). The rest of the book consists of a concordance of the song-units (p. 831–961) and indexes of proper names (p. 962–1004).

This extensive and extremely carefully prepared new material is important particularly in three regards: for Dravidian linguistics, for the ethnographic description of this peculiar tribe, and for the study of the oral poetry in general.

The Toda language had been described and recorded so insufficiently before Emeneau's field work, that his teacher Edward Sapir suggested it "as a Dravidian language that badly needed study" (p. vii), thus giving the impulse to Emeneau's research that has kept him busy for many decades. In the present book, Emeneau does not discuss the subject at all, but the bibliography at the beginning quotes his paper "Toda, a Dravidian language", *Transactions of the Philological Society* 1957, p. 15–66, which remains the principal source on the Toda language. In this paper, Emeneau limits himself chiefly to phonology and to defining the relation of Toda to the other Dravidian languages. Phonetically the Toda language is very difficult, a fact that largely accounts for the inadequacy of the earlier studies. The tasks of recording and analysing the texts have obviously been very arduous, especially when one takes into regard that the work was done without the help of the tape recorder. Emeneau has done similar field work on Kota, Koḍagu, Kolami and Brahui, and has also seen to it that he publishes "as much as possible and as well as possible" (p. vii). Certainly it is not out of place to compare his work with that of Georg Morgenstierne, who in similar conditions, during the decade preceding Emeneau's field work, collected large amounts of materials on the unknown languages of the NW frontier of India, and still vigorously carries on their publication. Some 1500 Toda etyma have been worked into the *Dravidian Etymological Dictionary* (Oxford 1961) and its supplements (Oxford 1968, and JAOS 92, 1972) by T. Burrow and M. B. Emeneau, which source also provides the phonetic correspondences for Toda, now further elaborated in Kamil Zvelebil's *Comparative Dravidian phonology* (The Hague 1970). A comprehensive grammar and dictionary of the Toda language are still wanting.

The peculiar culture of the Todas figures prominently in anthropological handbooks, with its polyandry and buffalo-cult, manifested particularly by the (formerly) sacrifices of buffaloes at funerals and at such central cult places as the dairies. This is largely due to the excellent description of *The Todas* which W. H. R. Rivers published as early as 1906 in London. It is no wonder that this book occupies the first place in Emeneau's short bibliography, where he characterizes it with the words "indispensable; still only to be supplemented rather than superseded" (p. xiii). It may be added that Rivers' work, which comprises nearly 800 pages and numerous tables and figures, has been made available through a reprint in 1967, and that Emeneau's book contains a number of restatements and additions to it, quite apart from its principal contribution, the Toda songs that accompany all their important activities, and form an essential part of their culture. Rivers' account contained only two short specimens of "funeral laments" (p. 384–9); their comparison with Emeneau's recordings show clearly what an accomplishment the latter are. At the head of the bibliography section, Emeneau cites Paul Hockings' mimeographed work, *The Nilgiri Hills: a bibliography for historians, geographers and anthropologists* (Berkeley 1962), as containing the most complete bibliography on the Todas. We can now add S. Agesthialingom and S. Sakthivel, *A bibliography for the study of Nilagiri hill tribes*, which is to appear as no. 32 in the Publications of the Linguistics Department of the Annamalai University, and will comprise over 400 titles.[1]

In a short review it is impossible to give a precise idea of what the Toda songs are like. Just a few lines out of these many hundred pages will have to suffice to convey some kind of impression; they have been taken at random from the beginning of the "song about funeral places" (no. 2):

1. *poḷyxi·s̱yaḷf kö·ṛ fï·snwïṛ / pïlkwï·ṛϑo·ṟ pi·štyxas̱ pïḍϑ o·ṭynwïṛ i· fo·ca·ṇ //*
2. *pïnboḷy kö·r fï ·snwïṛ / öw xwï·ṛ o·ḷm kö·ṭk fï·snwïṛ i· fo·ca·ṇ //*
3. *mas̱nupoṭy kö·r fï·snwïṛ / o·ḷ fïḍϑnwïṛ i· fo·ca·ṇ //*

[1] Many nice photographs of the Todas have been published in V. de Golish, P. Rambach & F. Hébert-Stevens, *L'Inde inexplorée: Expédition Tortue 1950–52*, which I know from its Swedish edition *Okänt Indien*, Malmö 1955.

1. If they have a funeral at Ki·syaḷf (male funeral place of the To·r̠o·ṛ clan), / when the people of To·r̠o·r clan weep, falling (with heads together), at Pi·štyxas̠ (the stone where the sacred buffalo is killed), how beautiful it is! //
2. If they have a funeral at Pïnboḷy (subsidiary male funeral place of To·r̠o·ṛ and Kö·r̠o·ṛ clans), / when all the Todas go to the funeral, how beautiful it is! //
3. If they have a funeral at Mas̠nupoṭy (subsidiary female funeral place of the To·r̠o·ṛ clan), / when the men fall down (in running down the steep slope to catch buffaloes), how beautiful it is! //

The following classification of the songs adopted by Emeneau illustrates the subject range; the numbers that follow indicate the number of songs of each category in the corpus:

1.	Places	2
2.	Legends and myths	5
3.	Munds[2] and mund ceremonies	24
4.	Songs about the dead (Rivers' "Funeral laments")	90
5.	Ceremony of piercing the ears; wedding ceremony	3
6.	Marriage affairs, the lover-concubine institution, casual love affairs	28
7.	Miscellaneous subjects of tribal life	20
8.	Songs dreamed	12
9.	Things, seasons, and other external features of the Nilgiris	16
10.	Kotas, Badagas, the plains	7
11.	The Christian Todas and the missionaries	13
12.	Westerners, including Emeneau	19
13.	Appendix: Songs that wholly or partially are not Toda, either in words or in tunes	6

As may be seen from such items as group 12, these songs are largely contemporaneous compositions (1935–8). There are also older songs, but Emeneau, who in the introduction gives a very detailed analysis of the singers and composers, points out that no song of a famous composer who died only a year or two before his fieldwork chanced to get into his corpus (p. xxi). This shows how "the art of song flourished, even to an extent that was

[2] The word *mund*, an adaptation of the etymologically related Badaga word, is used in English (cf. also Ootacamund) for the Toda word /mod̠/ 'an exogamous patrilineal clan', especially when used in its meaning 'locus of tribal activity, including village with dairy, dairy apart from village, funeral place, and even village which has no dairy' (Emeneau, p. xxx). The corresponding Tamil word is man̠r̠u/man̠r̠am 'raised platform under a tree for village meetings, junction of four roads or streets, hall of assembly, court of justice, golden hall of Chidambaram, etc.' (DED 3913).

deplored by the headmen, who complained that there was no thought of anything but dancing at funeral ceremonies and the accompanying dance-songs. It was an auspicious time for the collecting of song texts . . ." (p. xiv).

Instead of the varieties recorded by Emeneau — the shouted songs (*koṉ*) that accompany the dance at funerals and at various of the clan and mund rituals, the songs with two kinds of melodies (*po·ṭ* and *nöw*), and the women's work-songs (*ti·m*) which all have the same verbal technique — there existed originally, according to the best available informant, only *po·ṭ* sung by men and *ti·m* sung by women. Emeneau analyzes this longer account of the development of songs, and deals also with the question of laments and prayers as the possible ultimate source of the songs. I shall, however, quote only the words concluding this chapter of the introduction: "So little is known so far about the folksongs of South India that we cannot even tell where to look for parallels to the technique. Negatively, it can be said that *prima facie* the songs of the Kotas, the Badagas, and the Koḍagus provide no parallels" (p. xx). Passing over the other aspects of this verbal technique analysed by Emeneau in his earlier papers on "the externals of the art (1937), its sociological interpretation (1958), and linguistic interpretation of its style and semantics (1966)" briefly summarized in the introduction, attention may be drawn to the chief new contribution of the present book, the concordance of song-units, which records, with translations, explanations and text places, the recurring formulaic expressions of the Toda songs. Some of these static formulae, which undoubtedly make the most important aid for an oral composition, are, Emeneau assures us, "obscure even to the Todas themselves, as were some of the Homeric formulas to the Homeric composers." (p. xv). He does not mention the important study of *Tamil heroic poetry* by K. Kailasapathy (Oxford 1968), which probably appeared too late to be referred to in the present book. It contains, among other things, a chapter on "the technique of oral verse making" (p. 135–186), including also a discussion of the formulae of the Old Tamil poetry.

In the very first paragraph of the preface Emeneau emphatically states: "No music was collected, since I am not a musicologist and since, moreover, in the 1930s, when the fieldwork was done, recording apparatus had not reached the convenient form it now has. Research on the music of the Todas is still a desideratum" (p. vii). This is all the more urgent, as the traditional culture of the Todas "has since been pushed off centre and is probably undergoing much change" (p. xiv). Incidentally, with regard to the Toda music I would like to quote the following statement, made by such a prominent scholar as Arnold Bake ("The Practice of Sāmaveda", *Proceedings of the Seventh All-India Oriental Conference*, Baroda 1935, p. 151 f.): though I personally agree with the criticism expressed by V. M. Apte ("Sound-records of Sāmagānas", *Bulletin of the Deccan College Research Institute* 4, 1942–3, p. 304–5).

"It was when we were discussing Sāmaveda, especially the way in which the Nambudiris practise it, that H. H. Appan Tampuran mentioned the fact to me, that he had been struck by the similarity of the music of the Todas he had heard at Ootacamand, and the way in which the Nambudiris sing their Sāmaveda. There is a good deal of truth in this statement, as I was able to ascertain. One can put for instance the first Sāman of the Grāmageyagāna, "agnāi āyāhi" and an ordinary song of Toda men side by side. The similarity is striking as far as the compass goes, that is to say, half a tone to a tone. Still more striking it would be, if one could play a sacrificial tune of the Todas next to the Sāmaveda of the Nambudiris, but the Todas were unwilling to have their holy chants recorded. There is no necessity that this should mean any indication of relationship of the Todas and the Nambudiris, which has been hinted at on other grounds. To my mind this similarity in structure only indicates that the Nambudiri way of chanting Sāmaveda, whether originally Jaiminīya or dating from an older school, goes back to a stratum of civilisation very much older than that of which the śāstras speak, with its compass of six notes."[3]

Thus even the Toda songs, not to speak of many other valuable ancient and rapidly perishing traditions in India,[4] urgently call for more fieldwork in the near future. Emeneau's work on the Todas has set a model for such undertakings.

Asko Parpola.

[3] For the present status of the study of Nambudiri Sāmaveda (recordings, etc.), see A. Parpola, *The literature and study of the Jaiminīya Sāmaveda in retrospect and prospect*, Helsinki 1973 (Studia Orientalia 43:6).

[4] With regard to manuscripts that still exist in private libraries, cf. the introduction to *op. cit.* (n. 3), stressing the acute need for their collecting.

Rückläufiges Wörterbuch des Altindischen. — Reverse index of Old Indian. Ausgearbeitet von Wolfgang Schwarz. Durchgesehen und ergänzt von Oskar E. Pfeiffer. Mit einem Vorwort von Manfred Mayrhofer. Lieferung 1: a – °chada-. Wiesbaden: Otto Harrassowitz, 1974. ISBN 3 447 01616 7. VIII, 208 p. DM 64,00.

The first fascicle of this very important work, which already for some time has been announced in the catalogues of the publisher, fulfills all reasonable expectations. Such a working tool has for quite some time been one of the greatest desiderata of Sanskrit studies. A reverse dictionary is indispensable not only in studies concerning word formation and reconstructing the text of fragmentary manuscripts and inscriptions, but also in more general researches of religious and cultural history, since it registers the compounds where important keywords occur as last members.

We owe the present work mainly to the instigation and financial organization of Manfred Mayrhofer and to two scholars who for many years have devoted themselves to the realization of the task. The project was started in 1960, when W. Schwarz began to card-index and arrange into the reverse alphabetical order the vocabulary contained in O. Böhtlingk's *Sanskrit-Wörterbuch in kürzerer Fassung*, the pw (1879–1889), and R. Schmidt's *Nachträge* thereto (1928), as well as the Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit Dictionary by F. Edgerton (1953). The Sanskrit dictionaries by M. Monier Williams 2 ed. (1899) and V. S. Apte (rev. ed. 1957) have been consulted only *carptim*, since a complete collation would have delayed the publication and yielded relatively meagre additions. R. Schmitt and D. Weber have card-indexed L. Renou's lexicographic contributions published in the Journal *Vāk* I–V, A. Sharma's *Beiträge zur vedischen Lexicographie* (1959/60), the first eight volumes of *Sanskrittexte aus den Turfanfunden*, ten monographs and text editions of Vedic ritual literature by W. Caland, and E. Waldschmidt's works on two Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit texts. These collections, too, marked by appropriate symbols indicating the source that figure in the final output, were put in the proper alphabetical order by Schwarz, who completed his task in 1968. All this work has been done manually, which is understandable as the computer-techniques which could have saved much labour had not yet become so generally available in the early 1960's when the work started. Taking this into account, the selection of sources can only be approved of as most reasonable though a number of indexes that could have been included can be enumerated.

After the completion of the press-copy it was considered whether or not to include the material contained in the Index ab ultimo (Vol. V, part II, Hoshiarpur 1965) of the *Vedic Word Concordance* published under the editorship of Vishva Bandhu that had appeared in the meanwhile. Because of differences in general plan and in details, especially accentuation which it was decided to add afterwards into the present work, this Index (which is available for the user) has not been taken into consideration. (It was found out that the accents are in discrepancy in about 20 % of the cases. It would have been useful if such differences had been marked with special signs: perhaps they can be listed or even analysed later in an appendix or a separate publication). Instead, O. E. Pfeiffer has been revising the work since 1970, separating the verbs from the rest of the material, and adding accents, dashes, etc. while checking the proofs against the original sources. At this stage he included, at the suggestion of B. Schlerath, the reconstructed Old Indo-Aryan words not attested in Sanskrit texts from R. L. Turner's *Comparative Dictionary of the Indo-Aryan Languages* (1966), which was indeed a very valuable addition. The final result makes an impression of a careful work, the proofs having been read also by M. Mayrhofer and R. Schmitt.

I should like to draw the reader's attention to two schemes that have some relation to the present one. A *Dictionary of Sanskrit on historical principles* is being prepared under the general editorship of A. M. Ghatage at the Deccan College Post-Graduate and Research Institute, Poona. A specimen fascicle comprising 54 quarto pages was issued in 1973 and sent to interested scholars for the purpose of getting their advice and remarks both in general and with regard to special problems. The first 19 pages comprise an introduction detailing the plan of the dictionary, 8 pages list abbreviations of Sanskrit texts to be cited, and pp. 29–54 contain representative specimen entries. This colossal work will, of course, contain new words not in the present reverse dictionary; it would be useful if the editors made a separate list of these words.

Eric Grinstead of the Scandinavian Institute of Asian Studies, Copenhagen, assisted by S. Bergholdt and P. R. Subramanian, has been preparing a compound index and a reverse disctionary of Tamil on the basis of the *Tamil Lexicon* published by the University of Madras. This work has been with the help of computer and is nearing completion. It will make the most important Dravidian language similarly more accessible for study, and thus forms an important complement to the present reverse index. Even for Sanskrit studies it will be of great interest on account of the numerous Sanskrit loan words in Tamil.

There is much reason to be thankful to the authors of all these undertakings. We look forward to the appearance of the remaining fascicles of the present work, which in all likelihood will follow shortly, and of the other works mentioned above. They are certain to enhance Indian studies greatly.

Asko Parpola.

William Peiris: The Western Contribution to Buddhism. Delhi 1973, Motilal Banarsidass. XXVIII + 287 pages, 48 portrait plates. Price Rs. 40,–.

There is a preface by the author and a short foreword by H. Saddhatissa of the London Buddhist Vihāra.

The book has a survey of the subject in ten geographical chapters (Britain, Germany, France, Denmark, Holland, Italy, Sweden, Latvia (!), Russia, America) with adjacent biographical sketches and — technically not outstanding — plates of some of the persons mentioned.

The author is living as a journalist in Sri Lanka, but has good connections all over the world. He has shown much diligence, but emphasizes rightly (p. XII): "this is by no means a scholarly work". As a matter of fact, scientific expertise should not be expected. Whereas book titles in English, Sanskrit and Pāli are fairly correct, those in German or French are very poor, and there are other gross errors. In the very long and generally good description of the Critical Pāli Dictionary we read: "The dictionary is edited by Prof. L. L. Hammerich . . . Volume II appeared in 1960". The truth is that Mr. Hammerich occupied the much more humble position of chairman of the administrative committee, and that only the first fascicle of Vol. II appeared in 1960.

There is no need to give more than this striking example.

There is also no doubt that the survey of Pāli studies in the single countries is deficient. Much better is the description of the development of Buddhism in the different European and American countries, and most interesting are often the biographies of the individual scholars and adepts of Buddhism (even if sometimes the number of Buddhists may be very restricted). Occasionally the extracts of biographical sketches are cut in a rather unlucky way; thus the pages devoted to Herman Oldenberg (called "Oldenburg" the whole way through) bring a concluding quotation calling him "incompetent as an interpreter of Buddhism". But the author has taken great pains to find reliable sources of information and often gives lengthy quotations which it is a pleasure to read. A good example is the very full explanation of Pāli studies in Denmark, based on the reliable information given by Mrs. Else Pauly — and only vitiated by errors in details where the author has misunderstood his source!

Another fine example is the astonishing history of Karlis Tennisons, Buddhist Archbishop of Latvia, based on the obituary in the Mahā Bodhi of June 1962. Born in a wealthy family in Latvia in 1873 (said to have professed Buddhism for generations), he travelled to Transbaikalia in 1892 and was ordained a Buddhist monk there in 1893.

It is rather hazy what he undertook during the following decades. Apparently he made extensive journeys in Asia, and somehow he took part in the first world war, at the end of which he was made Lord Abbot of the Tibetan Buddhist Cathedral of Petrograd/Leningrad. But then he returned to his home country. In 1923 he was made *Saṅgharāja* of the three Baltic republics with the official title of Buddhist Archbishop of Latvia (!). After the second world war, when the Soviet occupied Latvia and intensified the religious persecutions, he went again to Transbaikalia and thence to China. When the Communists defeated Chiang kai-shek, Karlis took refuge in Thailand. But when the Soviet began to press the Thai Government to extradite him, they shrank from doing so, but did not like to resist the Soviet. So on a night they took him and his faithful follower, the High Priest and Vicar for Esthonia, Friedrich Lustig, put them on a van, and drove it across the border to Burma, leaving it in the jungle. Here they were taken care of by the Burmese authorities, especially by U Chan Htoon, president of the Supreme Court, chairman of the Buddhist Society, owner — on behalf of his family — of the famous Shwe Dagon pagoda in Rangoon. In a chapel house of this pagoda U Chan Htoon gave the refugees a home.

There I visited them, on the recommendation of a Danish employee of the SAS, in November 1961. Before the golden wall of the chapel I was sitting on a low stool, the Most Holy Karlis was sitting on a sort of throne, with Brother Lusting standing at his side. They talked English to me, but Esthonian together. Karlis was extremely old, a very tall man, completely bald, with a long white beard. The yellow garment of a Buddhist monk left one shoulder bare, his white skin was freckled by the tropical sun. I answered his interested questions on the Critical Pāli Dictionary, and — assisted by Brother Lustig — he blessed me and the wholesome work. All the time eight magnificent black Siamese cats were circling around him and upon him.

I am sure that many of the biographical sketches in the book, written by Mr. William Peiris, might be supplemented by people with special knowledge. But in the present shape, full of facts, full of faults, it is a most readable book.

L. L. Hammerich.

Thomas, David D.: Chrau Grammar, University of Hawaii Press 1971, x 258 p., Oceanic Linguistics Special Publication No. 7.

Chrau is a Mon-Khmer language spoken in South Vietnam east of Saigon. Thomas did field work there 1959–60 and also worked on the language with a single informant 1962–69. In 1967 he received his Ph. D. on a thesis which forms the basis for the present work. The result is an excellent reference book written according to a clear and well-planned arrangement. It is among the best available descriptions of any Mon-Khmer language, and is interesting also for its theoretical approach.

Although mainly conceived along tagmemic lines the grammar avails itself of the transformational approach in order to account for certain basic patterns, called Clause Batteries. It is the reviewer's distinct feeling that useful information is provided in this manner and in a rather economical way. Since however the author has failed to provide the necessary translations of many key entries, it is not always possible to reap the full benefits from the treatment. It is to be hoped that these interesting ideas will be explained more fully elsewhere. Søren Egerod.

Kirsten Yumiko Taguchi: An annotated Catalogue of Ainu Material. Scandinavian Institute of Asian Studies Monograph Series No. 20. 136 pp. Studentlitteratur, Lund 1974. $ 7:60.

The American Indians once represented many cultures and many nations. Since they stood in the way of westward expansion, they were exterminated or subdued. Those who were subdued were permitted to continue their own way of life on Indian Reservations, which are little islands of an alien culture surrounded by an ocean of America. Poverty, hunger, ignorance and — worst of all — loss of self respect are the marks of most of the American Indian reservations. The Hawaiians offer another example. Their islands interested the Americans for economic and military reasons. Over a period of about three generations the Hawaiians lost their language and their culture, except for the artificial fragments that are still featured in the tourist hotels of Waikiki. There are other areas in the world that one could turn to for parallel situations. The Maoris of New Zealand, for example, are on the verge of losing their language completely. The Ainu of Hokkaido offer another example of what happens when a minority group abandons its language and culture only to become marginal people[1].

Hence a work on Ainu represents a fairly noteworthy event,

[1] For a more detailed discussion, cf. my "A Bird's-Eye View of Greenlandic and the other Dying Languages" (to appear in *Inter Nord*).

especially when published outside Japan. However, the title of this book might lead the reader to expect more material than is actually included in the publication. Turning to page 1, one is confronted with the longer title which reflects the content much better: *An annotated Catalogue of Ainu Material in the East Asian Institute of Aarhus University.* I do not understand the reason behind the shortened, and, in this case, misleading title.

Indeed, in this monograph only the collection of books, tapes, pictures, and the other material on Ainu that has been established in the East Asian Institute of Aarhus University since 1969 is briefly described, with Mrs Taguchi — a scholar of Japanese in the University of Copenhagen — collecting the greater part of the material herself during her trips to Hokkaido in 1969 and 1970.

The book includes an Introduction (12–25) which discusses in brief "Population and Distribution", "Origins", "Early Descriptions", "John Batchelor", "Archaeology and Ethnography", "Kyōsuke Kindaichi", "Mashio Chiri", "Recent Studies"[2] (followed by Notes). A second chapter provides the "List of Informants" (26–36), i.e. a list of the speakers on the tapes (many of the informants are no longer alive), followed by chapter 3 listing the "Tape Recordings" (37–49). Chapter 4 describes the "Maps" (50–52). Chapter 5 the "Books" (53–88)[3], mostly in Japanese, supplemented by chapter 6 "Miscellaneous" (89–92), including smaller pamphlets, excerpts, etc., and chapter 7 (Japanese) "Periodicals" (93–99); chapters 8 and 9, "Pictures" (100–107) and "Ethnographica" (108–114), follow (with the ethnographic material kept at the Department of Ethnography, Moesgaard). The book closes with the Appendices: "Books in the East Asian Institute in Copenhagen" (117–118), "Ethnographica in the National Museum, Copenhagen" (119–123), "Index of [44] Ainu Words" (124), "Alphabetical List of Informants" (125), "Name Index" (126–133), "Number Index" (134–136).

---

[2] No mention is made of Sakuzaemon Kodama's observation of enamel pearls or nodules (*Schmelztropfen* in German) on the root of Ainu teeth; about 40% of the Ainu are said to have this peculiarity.

[3] Bronisław Piłsudski: Materials for the Study of the Ainu Language and Folklore. Cracow 1912 (Reprint: New York 1970) is missing!

Today, the Ainu — once occupying extensive areas in northern Japan and living on the southern tip of the Kamchatka peninsula, on the southern Kuriles, and on Sakhalin — "have dwindled in number, and those left have been forced towards the center of their culture, Hokkaido, where, trapped and defenseless against the stronger Japanese culture, they have been dying out slowly and steadily. Today, there is only a small outcast group left, neither quite Ainu, nor quite Japanese, eking out a meagre existence in scattered villages in Hokkaido" (12). By the way, we are informed that "It was a quite common belief among the Japanese that the Ainu were not human, but a mixture of dog and man" (18) — a prejudice marking the life of the Ainu scholar Mashio Chiri who was of Ainu origin. It may not be out of place, therefore, to inform the Japanese that in Alaska a Japanese is called *yugiŋaliŋoq*, "similar to an Eskimo".

As for the possible origin of the Ainu people, Mrs Taguchi summarizes the theories put forward as follows: "Many European travellers and scholars seem to agree that the evidence points towards a Caucasian origin; Russian ainologists agree on Australoid origin; Basil Hall Chamberlain pointed towards China; and certain prominent scholars, such as Dr. Kyōsuke Kindaichi, contend that the Ainu are related to the North American Indians. . . . The theories can be divided into two categories: (1) 'Northern origin'; (2) 'Southern origin'. Both build their arguments on physical as well as cultural features, and it seems impossible to decide which is the more convincing" (13).

In the Acknowledgements we are told that "Professor Jens Holt of the Linguistic Institute, Aarhus University, . . . took upon himself the responsibility of sponsoring the project in the first place" (10). It is therefore quite astonishing that neither under "Origin", nor in the chapters "Books" and "Miscellaneous", is the book by Pierre Naert — a Frenchman in Lund, Sweden — mentioned: *La situation linguistique de l'aïnou*, I. *Aïnou et indo-européen*. Lund 1958 (= Lunds Univ. Årsskrift, N.F., Avd. 1, 53: 4). This book initiated a great discussion for several years following its publication.

To fill the time gap preceding the period covered by Mrs Taguchi, the following bibliographical addenda reflecting that period, may be helpful. This list does not pretend to be exhaustive,[4] but it is assumed that most of the items listed can be found in the University Library, Aarhus University):

Karl Bouda: »Ainu und Kaschinawa, sprachliche Beziehungen eine[r] paläoeurasischen Sprache auf Sachalin zu einer Panosprache in Nordperu«, Fontes Lingvae Vasconvm Stvdia et Docvmenta (Pamplona) 8, 199–125 (1971). [With references to earlier works].

Georges Dumézil: Review of Naert (1958). Studia Linguistica XII, 52–55 (1958).

Ivar Lindquist: Indo-European Features in the Ainu Language (with reference to the thesis of Pierre Naert). Lund 1960.

Pierre Naert: « Le vocabulaire aïnou de la Pérouse collationé sur le vif ». Orbis X, 320–355 (1961).

Pierre Naert: « La situation linguistique de l'aïnou, I:2 Aïnou et indoeuropéen 2. Nouvelles étymologies ». Orbis X, 394–410 (1961).

Pierre Naert: « La plus ancienne source européenne connue sur la langue aïnou ». Orbis XI, 116–130 (1962).

Pierre Naert: « Contacts lexicaux aïnou-gilyak ». Orbis XI, 199–229 (1962).

Pierre Naert: « La situation linguistique de l'aïnou, I:3 Aïnou et indoeuropéen 3. Nouvelles étymologies 2 ». Orbis XI, 230–232 (1962).

Pierre Naert: « Généralités sur la parenté linguistique et sur l'indoeuropéanité de l'aïnou ». Orbis XI, 514–517 (1962).

Olivier Guy Tailleur: Review of Naert (1958). Kratylos 5, 78–82 (1960).

Olivier Guy Tailleur: « Sur une explication de l'aïnou par l'indo-européen ». Zeitschrift für vergleichende Sprachforschung 77, 1–30 (1961).

Oliver Guy Tailleur: « Remarques à des étymologies aïnoues ». Orbis XI, 243–250 (1962).

Olivier Guy Tailleur: « Remarques à des étymologies aïnoues ». Lingua 12, 389–410 (1963).

[4] I am indebted to Professor Karl Bouda (Erlangen) for his help in compiling this list.

Moritaka Takahashi: "Some Remarks on the Ainu = Indo-European Theory". Orbis XI, 518 (1962).
Moritaka Takahashi: "Boats in Far-East". Orbis XII, 206–207 (1963).
Albert-Joris Van Windekens: « La thèse de Pierre Naert et l'origine indo-européenne de trois mots aïnou ». Studia Linguistica XIV, 114–128 (1960).
Albert-Joris Van Windekens: « Contacts linguistiques aïnou-tokhariens », Anthropos 55, 753–764 (1960).
Albert-Joris Van Windekens: « Études sur l'étymologie et le vocabulaire de l'aïnou ». Orbis X, 411–423 (1961).
Albert-Joris Van Windekens: « Nouvelles études sur l'étymologie et le vocabulaire de l'aïnou ». Orbis XI, 234–242 (1962).
Albert-Joris Van Windekens: « Réponse aux « Remarques a des étymologies aïnoues » de M. Tailleur ». Orbis XI, 251–255 (1962).
Albert-Joris Van Windekens: « Aïn *an* = skr. *andhá-* et aïn. *anchikara* = skr. *andhakára-* ». Orbis XI, 522–523 (1962).
Albert-Joris Van Windekens: « L'indo-européanité de l'aïnou: nouvelles contributions I ». Orbis XII, 253–257 (1963).

As for today's "state of the art", the statement may be risked that Naert's "Indoeuropean origin of the ainu language" has not found as much acceptance as the "Paleoeurasian" definition; cf. O. G. Tailleur: « L'aïnou, langue paléoeurasienne ». Slaviska och baltiska studier (Lund) 8, 267–285 (1966). I should, however, like to state that this addition is not meant to be a criticism of Mrs Taguchi's work, but merely to be a supplement to it. The Catalogue is based on a collection which is useful, but which cannot be meant to be absolute and final.

W. W. Schuhmacher.

Clopton, Robert W. & Ou Tsuin-chen, John Dewey: Lectures in China, 1919–1920. The University Press of Hawaii. 1973. Honolulu, 337 p.

Sinologists with an interest in the twentieth century intellectual history of China will find it just as useful as may Dewey-fans to have this selection of lectures made readily available in one neat volume. The 32 lectures which were translated from Chinese, the original notes having been lost, are classified under two headings, "Social and Political Philosophy" and "Philosophy and Education". Additional series which have also been translated are listed in an appendix, some annotated. These may be had from the Reprography Department of the Hawaiian University Library. There is a general consensus that Dewey's pragmatism made a great impact on the contemporary scene of intellectual debates and crosscurrent movements, whether explicitly or implicitly ideological. Quite a few outstanding scholars and educationalists have themselves testified to this, above all Hu Shih, T'ao Hsing-chih, Chiang Monlin, Ts'ai Yüan-p'ei. Chen Ho-ch'in who in the early fifties attacked Dewey for his pernicious influence and played a major role in the campaign of denunciation, may also be grouped with this elite.

The scope of Dewey's influence has been assessed by Chow Tse-tsung in his study of the May Fourth Movement and J. B. Grieder in his work on Hu Shih and the Chinese Renaissance. Also deserving attention is P. A. Kuhn's unpretentious but interesting thesis on T'ao Hsing-chih in Vol. 13 of the mimeographed series, Papers on China, edited by J. K. Fairbank. Apart from some attempts at a substantive analysis these studies have in common that their appraisal is mainly based on external evidence, such as sequence of events in time and the like. The lengthy introduction by the editors and translators of these lectures by Dewey adds nothing in this respect.

It should not be excessively forward to expect that they were prompted by a need for some reassessment of Dewey's influence in the light of novel information on the general socio-political setting of the time, as well as on the intellectual countercurrents, due to emerge later as the mainstream. Instead of an effort at this, the readers are left with generalizations like "there is no question that Dewey's philosophy represented the mainstream of Chinese thought during this period (from 1919 until 1927). Deviant thinkers are brushed aside with the statement "there were occasional critics of some of the more extreme tendencies advocated by some of Dewey's followers, but these were rarely heeded"

(25). The decline of his influence is attributed exclusively to the neo-Confucian trend of the New Culture movement. The possible effect even in this early period of the rising tide of Marxist thought is neither discussed nor raised as an important question. This in spite of the evidence produced by Kuhn that Marxists attacked Dewey's disciples already in the 1920's on the basis of the irreconcilable differences between their own and Deweyan views of society.

Clearly, there is a need for content analysis of Dewey's philosophy both as exposed in his lectures and as reflected in the thinking of his followers. An analytical approach of this type may throw additional light on the reasons for the eclipse of the entire school of reformists and the triumph of revolutionary forces in the theoretical "history debate" as well as in socially oriented programs of action. Some components in the intertwined complex of problems which merit further queries are, for instance, Dewey's influence on the thinking of secondary elites as distinguished from the central elite group mentioned above, the links between the various reform groups and the nationalist movement of the 1920's versus the links forged by revolutionary groups. To what extent did Dewey's philosophy divert the former from the future antagonistic mainstream? What bearing could this have had on the weakness of the initial reform movements? On the assumption held by Eisenstadt — that any political reformation, not revolution only, entails rejection or destruction of an existing cultural order, it is possible that Dewey's brand of pragmatism may have strengthened an ambivalent or wavering attitude among the reformists toward tradition and the relation of mores and values to the modernity which they were after all devoted to further.

The main service rendered by the editors of Dewey's lectures is, in short, that their endeavour has facilitated the study and debate of these and related problems in the intellectual and sociopolitical history of modern China.

Aadel Brun Tschudi.

Earle Ernst: The Kabuki Theatre. An East-West Center Book. The University Press of Hawaii, Honolulu. 1974. 296 pp. $ 4.95.

Too many of the books available so far about Oriental theatre at large have been written by scholars, whose subject is literature, which is quite natural, because theatre research as a university study is of a rather recent date.

There are many valuable books of this nature, but often such books suffer from lack of inside knowledge about the theatrical aspect and tend to put the emphasis on the literary or dramatic side of the problems. Further one will often encounter philological difficulties in translations of the source material. Without a specific knowledge about the function of the theatre, it may be difficult to select the proper translation of a certain character, e.g. in Japanese.

In theatre research one is trying to describe a theatre form analysing the artistic will, which is the background for the activity and to find the system and the conventions which rule the actual performance. The word system is the key word. Any theatrical performance is bound to a system and only when this is described clearly, has a Westerner a chance to penetrate into the essence of Oriental theatrical art.

Earle Ernst seems to be the first author to analyse the Kabuki Theatre in the way just described, and his book "The Kabuki Theatre" is till now the best available on the subject.

In the Japanese culture everything seems to be interconnected. In the introduction to the book one finds a short and clear description of the connection between No, Bunraku and Kabuki. On page 18 one reads the following: "The actor, the audience and the performance exist within the same psychologically undifferentiated world. The actor is therefore permitted to communicate with his audience directly, for both occupy the same world of aesthetic actuality". The quotation is given to show an example of the excellent style of Mr. Ernst.

The analysis of the Kabuki theatre starts with the development of the physical theatre showing clearly how the stage from being a copy of the Classical No stage is transformed into its present shape. One also learns that the Kabuki theatre introduced the revolving stage in 1758, well 200 years before this piece of machinery was "invented" by von Perfall-Lautenschläger in Munich in Germany.

The next aspect approached is the audience and its attitudes. As the audience is one third of a performance, its attitudes or conventions are as important for the system as the activity on the stage. "The audience does not go to the theatre to be moved by images made to resemble those occurring in actuality, but by images clearly distinguished from reality by the precision of their design". "The audience does not appreciate the performance of a play; it appreciates the moment". In other words the audience is aware of the fact that it is attending a play, and it will decide itself, when to pay attention. It is the moment and the moment alone which counts.

The Hanamichi is the unique feature of the Kabuki stage. It is a bridge, which runs from the rear of the auditorium in the king's side of the theatre on to the stage proper. The Hanamichi has many functions, the most important being an ability to activate the audience physically, as it must literally move to follow the activity on the bridge and the activity between the bridge and the stage proper.

Before going on with other important elements in the Kabuki theatre Mr. Ernst has a chapter termed "Elements of the performance", in which he describes many of the conventions, which must be known in order to be able to appreciate a Kabuki performance.

We learn about the idea that black is invisible, and that consequently one does not notice the work of the stagehands dressed in black. The service of the personal servant of the actor is made clear and so is the meaning of the kyogenkata, the joruri and gidayu. This chapter ends up with a very clear and enlightening explanation of the importance of the music; an especially difficult field. "The Kabuki stage is a decorated area, not a disguised one. Stage decoration serves the purpose of indicating place, rather than representing it, and of providing a background against which, rather than in which the actor plays".

This very exact definition combined with the fact that the Kabuki stage was originally an undecorated dancing floor gives in a nutshell the meaning of the stage.

The discussion of the stage includes all main factors and conventions necessary to understand the function and the chapter also deals with the question of properties.

The actor is logically given a separate chapter.

Mr. Ernst gives a very fine analysis of the relation to the Bunraku — and the No theatre in connection with the main mean of expression of the Kabuki actor — the dance, and the ultimate expression of the actor — the mie. The square form of the costume for the aragoto hero combined with the special type of decor without vanishing point explains the direct contact — nearly physical — which can be obtained in a Kabuki theatre; an effect, which Western theatre — so far without result — has been trying to achieve for nearly a century now. "In brief, the whole of his (the actors) technique of acting is directed outward toward the audience; he is not forced to compromise between relating himself both to the mise en scène and to the downstage plain. The result is that he is immediately expressive; his communication with the audience is not the indirect one of the representational theatre, but is realized in immediate contact". The plays and characters are the last pieces of the mosaic in the Kabuki system, which Mr. Ernst takes into consideration. "Throughout its history, the Kabuki theatre never made any attempt to change, direct, or influence the manners, morals, or thoughts of its audience; on the contrary, its audience was always given the kind of theatre fare it wanted". "The Kabuki repertoire does not pretend to be literature". Because of the essential nature of the Kabuki, the play cannot be judged apart from its performance in the theatre, and one characteristic of this performance, that of placing emphasis on the character rather than on the event, minimizes the melodramatic element of the play, for it allows the hero to exist, as he does in tragedy, in greater prominence than the mechanism of the play, to which he is attached".

This study of the Kabuki theatre can be strongly recommended for serious studies of this special form of theatrical activity. The book discussed here is a photographical reproduction of the original edition from 1956 by Oxford University Press, which has caused the one disadvantage that "The selected bibliography of works in Western languages" was not brought up to date. Many important books have appeared in recent years, and it might be relevant here to mention two works by William P. Malm: "Japanese Music and musical instruments" and "Nagauta — the heart of Kabuki music".

Mogens Hyllested.

The Allied Occupation of Japan, 1945–1952: An Annotated Bibliography of Western-Language Materials. By Robert E. Ward and Frank Joseph Shulman with the assistance of Masashi Nishihara and Mary Tobin Espey. Published by the American Library Association (A.L.A.), Chicago 1974. XX, 867 p. Distributed in Europe by EUROSPAN, Kershaw House, 3 Henrietta Street, London. £ 27.50 plus postage.

On both sides of the Pacific, the Allied occupation of Japan (2 September 1945 to 28 April 1952) was a unique experience. To the Japanese, because they had been fed on propaganda regarding their invincibility, and because their country had never before been occupied by a foreign power. To the Americans — who, aided by minor Commonwealth contingents, were in charge of the entire operation — because their policies evolved over six short years from stern retribution to efforts at winning over a democratized Japan as an ally in the cold war.

Compared to what foreign occupation has meant and still means to peoples elsewhere, the allied occupation of Japan was a civilized affair. The occupation authorities exacted no reparations — on the contrary, the U.S. distributed food on a grand scale. They erected no Berlin walls, and in general did not prevent foreign journalists from inspecting what they did. The ultimate control exerted by both the President and the Congress of the U.S. prevented the military authorities from running Japan as their private satrapy. A series of radical reform measures were introduced under pressure from the occupation authorities. Women were enfranchised, most tenants got landowning rights, labor unions were legalized, school teaching secularized, and the sovereignty of the people squarely laid down in the new constitution. In the latter, Prime Minister Shidehara and General MacArthur (Supreme Commander for the Allied Powers, or *SCAP*) also agreed to include a disarmament clause (Art. IX) whose wording was to cause so much trouble later.

Compared to the spate of publications about the Pacific War, books about the occupation are still relatively few in number. One reason for this has been the inadequate bibliographic control of Western and Japanese writings about that period. The present work has remedied this deficiency as regards Western language materials, and a companion volume in Japanese, *Nihon senryō bunken mokuroku,* published by the Japan Society for the Promotion of Science in 1972, has provided comparable bibliographical coverage for materials in Japanese.

"Ward and Shulman" is likely to become a household phrase among historians and sociologists working on postwar Japan. The compilers have provided almost nine hundred pages packed full of information. First, there is a review of pertinent bibliographies. Then, a survey of what can be found in newspapers and archives. Chapters on pre-surrender planning in the U.S. and elsewhere follow. Then, the authors survey available writings concerning Yalta and other wartime conferences, and the establishment, training and aims of the SCAP authorities. From page 112 they provide a meticulous listing of publications about the U.S. impact on Japanese society: General policies, including important material from obscure military printing offices, policy statements hidden away in yellowing handouts from press conferences, and hitherto fairly inaccessible directives from SCAP to the Japanese government. Following these general materials, are listed materials dealing with international aspects of the occupation, developments within the SCAP organization, the war crimes trials and purges, restructuring of the Japanese constitutional and administrative patterns, and U.S. assistance in rebuilding the Japanese economy, including the complicated issues of dealing with the *zaibatsu* assets, and the land reform. Page 611 begins with an equally fascinating survey of activities to tear down the ideological framework of xenophobia, virulent nationalism, and distorted history which under the name of *kokutai* had been the mainstay of the wartime propaganda of the Japanese government, and whose elements had formed part of school teaching in Japan for a decade or more. Most of this material deals with educational reform, the abolition of political censorship, and the efforts of SCAP to encourage labor, youth, small farmers, and women, to make use of their newly-won rights. Chapters on the Peace Treaty, and on Japan's re-entry into the postwar world conclude the volume.

Virtually all entries are annotated, and whereas the subject coverage is for 1945–52, books, articles, and dissertations published through 1972 are included. There are author and periodical indexes, an indexed and classified listing of important SCAP personnel, and very useful organization charts of SCAP headquarters.

A very thorough review article by Professor John W. Dower in vol. XXXIV, No. 2 (Feb. 1975) of the *Journal of Asian Studies* lists (page 499) those few omissions which no work of this kind can avoid. They are, however, insignificant compared to the lasting contribution to scholarship which Ward and Shulman have provided. They deserve praise not only for their bibliographical exactitude, but also for their unbiased presentation: friends and foes of what SCAP did all have their say in this volume. There is no longer any excuse for failing to include postwar Japan in standard college and university courses in sociology and world history, and a reference work such as this one will be certain to serve many faculty members and students doing work on postwar Japan in good stead.

Carl Steenstrup.

R. L. Turner: A comparative dictionary of the Indo-Aryan languages, 1962–66; Indexes, 1969; Phonetic analysis, 1971.

Professor R. L. Turner's Nepali-English dictionary, 1931, which contains etymologies of the majority of the Nepali words, was a comparative Indo-Aryan dictionary in nuce. Now we have this dictionary which pays regard to the whole Indo-Aryan field and both to the Old, Middle and Modern period, an admirable work and excellent tool for everybody engaged in the study of these languages, especially useful to students of Modern Indo-Aryan, but also for those studying the older periods.

The articles are partly headed by Old Indo-Aryan words, as we know them from the texts, partly by reconstructions based on modern and/or middle period words. Two facts stand out as especially noteworthy. First, a number of reconstructions are close to known Old I.–A. words, but exhibit unexpected phonological differences, e.g. *pota-* "cloth", **potta-*. This seemingly violates an essential principle of genetic-comparative linguistics, the principle of exact sound correspondences. Nobody who has read the penetrating and exact researches by Turner on the sound-history of a number of Modern Indo-Aryan languages could believe that this is due to any mistake. It is quite evident that there are such cases where the word forms of later linguistic strata force the scholar to such reconstructions. The problem is how to account for them. The irregular sound changes are no doubt connected with the fact that Indo-Aryan already some millennia ago covered and particularly in the later period has covered an enormous geographical area with a great number of dialect differences (several of them unknown to us) and that numerous contiguous and substratum foreign languages have influenced it. Or in Turner's very clear words in the Introduction p. IX, "... the head-words under which the material is collected do not represent the vocabulary of a real and comparatively uniform language at all comparable with that of the actual Latin the history of which Meyer-Lübke followed into the modern Romance languages"; "... during the long history of this language as a literary medium in the form of Sanskrit a very large proportion of its vocabulary arose from internal development or came from external sources at a period when the various spoken languages derived from the Vedic speech had already greatly altered its phonetic form and grammatical structure"; and (p. X) "Owing to differences of dialect or of time at which many loanwords from Muṇḍa, Dravidian, or other languages came into Indo-Aryan, they appear in forms which cannot be referred to a single Indo-Aryan form". In many instances still another cause has been at work: the more or less close adaptation to the phonology of earlier phases, especially to Sanskrit, which amounts to saying that such words are, partly or wholely, loanwords. A well-known case is Sk. *eka-* "one" leading to Dardic *ē*, *ī* etc. (with the expected disappearance of intervocalic *-k-*), but also to Hindi etc. *ek* with irregular preservation of *k*, either simply a loanword from Sanskrit or resting on Middle I.–A. *ekka-*, which Turner plausibly explains as a "M. I.–A. loan from Sk. when single (intervocalic) *-k-* was no longer a sound of the language" (i.e., *-kk-* has been substituted for *-k-*).

The other remarkable feature of the work is the many word-groups termed "defective", expressing "almost any defect, whether physical, mental or moral" (Introduction p. X). They are even more contrary to the principle of sound-correspondence, which, as mentioned by Turner, probably has several reasons, among them borrowing from different non-Aryan languages, especially Muṇḍa, and conscious transformation. The words collected in each series are beyond any doubt interconnected, which appears from their meanings and the broadly similar phonological frame (mostly having the structure C(C)V(C)C), even if their relationship is not a genetic one. These "defective" and other expressive word-series, so characteristic of these languages, are a valuable and novel addition to the common genetic vocabulary which of course constitute the vast majority of the words treated. A number of non-expressive words form similar series, e.g. *mūta-* "basket, bundle" (variants *mūṭa-*, **muṭṭa-*, **mūṭha-*, **muṭṭha-*, **moṭa-*, **moṭṭa-*, **moṭha-*).

Here a few suggestions, especially with material from West Pahari, which I prefer to call Himachali (Him.).

catuṣka-, *catuṣkarṇa-* and other words beginning with *catuṣ-* "four". Since there is no aspiration in M. I.–A. nor N. I.–A. (e.g. Pa. *catukka-*, H. *cauk*) it seems better to reconstruct **caturka-* etc. after *caturtha-*, *caturdanta-* etc. or to count with influence from such words (which indeed the author may well have done without mentioning it; one cannot be expected to mention all possibilities in a work of this kind).

jyotsnā. Him. Satlaj (= Kotgarhi) *dzōt:h* f. "moon, moonlight" could hardly come from this (the result of *jyotsnā* here is *dzɒ̄:ṇ*). Possibly one should reconstruct **jyotsā* for *dzōt:h*.

**dohanīghaṭaka-*, N. *dunhyāro* "milkpail". This must go back to **dohanīdhāraka-* (Sk. *dhāraka-* m. "vessel").

**pituḥkula-*. Since there is no trace of *-l-* in the N. I.–A. words mentioned (Him. bhad. *pöku* "wife's father's home", bhal. *pɛuke*, P. *piuke* m.pl. "parents' family") the last part of the word must be the suffix *-kka-*. P. has the adjective *piukā* "belonging to a father". From Him. I got Kotgarhi (Ktg.) *peukɔ* m. "wife's father's house".

bhajyate, 2. *bhagga-*, where **bhanna-* is assumed for i.a. Southern Him. (Joshi) *bhānṇu* "to break". This is quite possible, but another possibility is that *-ñj-* has led to *-n(n)-* in Him., cp. Joshi *annaḷ* f. "añjali-greeting", Ktg. *sān:ʿ* "dusk" (Sk. *sandhyā*, M. I.–A. *sañjhā*), even if it must be admitted that Turner may be right in deriving the last word from *saṃdhā* (*sandhā*).

roka-[1] "light, splendour". This does not account for Him. kochi *rɔe*, ktg. *rɛ:* f. "fir tree" nor for Him. kului *rāi*, Kal. *rǎ*.

vakṣas-. Sh. *baṣ, bhāṣ* m. "lung" hardly belongs here, since it is related to Him. ktg. *bʿɔ̄š* m. "lung", which cannot come from *vakṣas-*.

vīdhra- "clear, clean; clear sky" is sufficient to account for Him. *bīj:ʿɔ* (with the regular change of *dr* to *j*) "clear (of the sky)". It is not necessary to derive this from *vīdhrya-* "relating to the clear sky", as Turner does. Turner is no doubt right in assuming **vīdhriya-* as base for Phal. *bīdri*, etc.; on the other hand *vīdhra* -is represented by Ku. *bido* "bright, sunny".

**śamyāyuga-* does not explain Him. ktg. *šəmɛī*, kochi *šəmɔīo* (thus, not *šamāīo*) "yoke (on plough)". The words, which are evidently derived from Sk. *śamyā* "yoke-pin", contain a well-known N. I.–A. suffix *-ăia-*. It should be noticed that the words got the meaning "yoke", because the original sense of *śamyā* "yoke-pin" came to be expressed by *šəmēṇṭh* m.pl. from **śamyā-kāṣṭha-* (Sk. *kāṣṭha-* "wood, piece of wood").

śvaśuraśālā. Correction of the Him. form and meaning: it should be *sərɛ:ḷ* "kinship, family of the father-in-law". It seems to be a loanword from P. *suryāl*. Better, but not altogether satisfactory, seems **śvaśurālaya-* (mentioned by Turner), only one would have to assume a change by metathesis **śvaśurāyala-*. From Him. kochi I got *dziuṇaiš* "livelihood", possibly from **jīvanāśraya-* through, with a similar metathesis, **jīvanāyaśra-* (but another and perhaps better possibility is **jīvanāyuṣ(y)a-*).

skandha-. Turner assumes **kandha-* for words like Him. *kān:ʿ* m. "shoulder". One might mention Sk. *kandhara-* "neck", especially taking OMth. *kāndhara* "shoulder" (mentioned by Turner sub *kandhara-*) into consideration, even if it must be admitted that *kandhara-* is known from much later sources than *skandha-*.

The indexes, giving all Middle I.–A. and Modern I.–A. words of the dictionary, have been very carefully compiled by Mrs.

Dorothy Rivers Turner, who has also helped her husband in preparing the Phonetic Analysis which contains all more important sounds and sound combinations of the head-words, listed alphabetically under each sound (-combination), a very valuable aid for all future research. Hans Hendriksen.

R. S. McGregor: The Language of Indrajit of Orchā. A Study of Early Braj Bhāṣā Prose. 276 pp. Cambridge 1968.

Acta Orientalia XXXVI, p. 478–486, brought a review of this work ("SL 478–486"). The reviewer also gives his opinion on some points in my review of the same book in Orientalia Suecana XVIII, 1969 ("NS 187–199"). The following is written to clear up some points of misunderstanding. (I shall not comment on — even less make use of — the peculiar kind of vocabulary introduced by the reviewer in AO, e.g. SL 485 1. 9, 1. 31 ff.).

NS 188, 1. 7 fr. bottom: I restore the interpunction of the MS. Consequently there is no foundation for what is said SL 482, notes 11 and 12 about »unrichtige Zeichensetzung«. — SL 484 1. 17 ff: the long and detailed exposition does not add anything substantially to my interpretation *kim bahunā uktena* "what is the use of much talking".

Comment on SL 484, 1. 5 fr. bottom, ff.: There is less probability of Indrajit using *taiṃ* as a locative than of the commentary being incongruent with the Sanskrit text. Since *taiṃ* as a locative would be unique (*āpadā paraiṃ taiṃ* is likely to be an ablative depending on *nāṃhī saṃtāpahiṃ pāuta*), my suggestion tries to eliminate the locative interpretation. For the discussion the reader is referred to NS 198, since the reviewer's quotation is incomplete.

Comment on SL 485, 1. 12 ff: The reviewer takes a perfect congruence between commentary and Sanskrit text for granted. This forces him to give this translation: *su cātaka kahā jaladhara kau āśraya thorau karatu hai* »wenig verrichtet der Behälter/der/ Wolke für diesen Cātaka-Vogel«. Rejoinder: there is more probability of such congruence being imperfect than of Indrajit using *su* as an oblique. And the interpretation of *jaladhara kau āśraya* as Behälter /der/ Wolke, »D.h. die Wolke als Behälter« (note 17), has vast linguistic implications and consequences, which should have been accounted for. Kellogg (695–700) does not mention any genitive of identity; it hardly exists in Sanskrit. (The fact that it does exist in Tibetan may be noted; it constitutes a subtle problem for the student of Tibetan translations from Sanskrit. Cfr. my Indo-tibetische Studien, Uppsala 1957, p. 106, n. 1).

I do not find it necessary to embark upon a discussion of the last controversial point brought up by the reviewer, SL 483, 1. 10 ff. The instances allegedly speaking against my suggestion do not prove anything, and the reviewer has not made any attempt to eliminate the crucial point, NS 195, 1. 23 ff. If this can be eliminated, I certainly will have to reconsider my interpretation.

Since it is obvious that my methodological standpoint has been difficult to grasp, I would like to add this as a comment on SL 480, 1. 17 ff. Our text is the first prose text in Braj. It is a commentary on a Sanskrit text. It may even be an adaptation of a Sanskrit commentary (NS 197, 1. 20). Therefore, the first thing to be done, should be to discern and discard everything that may be even faintly suspected to depend on a Sanskrit text or a Sanskrit pattern. Whether what remains is much or little is immaterial; what matters is that it is linguistically reliable.

Nils Simonsson.

BOOKS SENT TO THE EDITOR

Adamec, Ludwig W.: *Who's Who in Afghanistan.* Akad. Druck-u. Verl., Graz 1974, 1–4.

Alsdorf, Ludwig: *Kleine Schriften.* Vol. 10 in: Veröffentligungen der Glasenapp-Stiftung. Wiesbaden 1974. 760 pp. DM 88.–.

Andersson, Gunnar: *Hinduistisk livssyn.* No. 8 in: Skrifter. Religionshistoriska Institutionen, Uppsala 1971.

Baumer, Rachel van: *Aspects of Bengali History and Society.* Vol. 12 in: Asian Studies at Hawaii. Univ. Hawaii, Honolulu 1976. 246 pp. $ 7.50.

Bellamy, H.: *The noble Qualities of Character by Ibn Abi-d-Dunya.* Vol. 25 in: Bibliotheca Islamica. Steiner Verl., Wiesbaden 1975. DM 28.–.

Biesterfeldt, H. H.: *Galens Traktat 'Das die Kräfte der Seele den Mischungen des Körpers folgen'.* Vol. 40(4) in: AKM. Steiner Verl., Wiesbaden 1976. DM 58.–.

Blazques, I. M.: *Tartessos y los Origines de la Colonizacion Fenicia en Occidente.* Univ. Salamanca, Salamanca 1975. 447 pp.

Buss, Claude A.: *China: The People's Republic of China and Richard Nixon* in: The Portable University Series. Freeman & Co. Ltd., Reading 1974. 118 pp. £ 3.10.

Carlstedt, Gunnar: *Till Kulas Lov.* No 13 in: Skrifter. Religionshistoriska Institutionen, Uppsala 1974.

Carlstedt, Gunnar: *Studier i Kularnava-Tantra.* No 14 in: Skrifter. Religionshistoriska Institutionen, Uppsala 1974.

Chibbett, D. G., Hickman & Matsudeira: *A Descriptive Catalogue of the Pre-1868 Japanese Books, Manuscripts and Prints in the Library of the School of Oriental and African Studies.* No 4 in: London Oriental Bibliographies. SOAS, Univ. London, London 1975. 185 pp. £ 10.–.

Constantiniu, Fl. et al.: *Studii si Materiale de Istorie Medie,* Vol. 7.

Acad. de Stiinte soc. si pol. a republ. soc. Romania, Bucarest 1974. 425 pp.

Crollius, Ary A. Roest: *The Word in the experience of revelation in qur'an and Hindu Scriptures.* Vol. 8 in: Documente Missionalia. Univ. Greg. Edit., Rome 1974. 273 pp.

Cuisenier, J.: *Économie et parenté.* École Prat. Haut. Étud. Paris 1975. 140 F.

Deutsch, Eliot: *Studies in Comparative Aesthetics.* No. 2 in: Monographs of the Society for Asian & Comparative Philosophy. Univ. Hawaii, Honolulu 1975. 95 pp. $ 3.50.

Diem, H.: *Hochsprache und Dialekt im Arabischen.* Vol. 41(1) in: AKM. Steiner Verl., Wiesbaden 1975.

Dimberg, Ronald G.: *The Sage and Society.* No. 1 in: SAVP Monographs. Univ. Hawaii, Honolulu 1974. 175 pp. $ 4.75.

Dobson, W. A. C. H.: *A Dictionary of the Chinese Particles.* Univ. Toronto, Toronto 1974. $ 37.50.

Edel, Elmar, Edel, Kohl & Pusch: *Die Felsgräbernekropole der Qubbet el Hawa bei Assuan. II. Abt.* Vol. 55 in: Abhandlungen. Rhein-Westfähl. Akad. Wissensch, Düsseldorf 1976.

Eilers, W.: *Die Mundart von Schunsar.* Vol. 1 in: Westiranische Mundarten aus der Sammlung Wilhelm Eilers. Steiner Verl., Wiesbaden 1976.

Erdberg-Consten, Eleanor von: *Die Architektur Taiwans.* No. G 189 in: Geisteswissenschaften. Rhein-Westfähl. Akad. der Wissensch., Düsseldorf 1973. 71 pp. DM 18.20.

Gonda, J.: *A History of Indian Literature.* Vol. 1(1) in: Vedic Literature. Verl. Harrassowitz, Wiesbaden 1976. DM 168.–.

Gramlich, R.: *Islamwissenschaftliche Abhandlungen.* Steiner Verl., Wiesbaden 1975. DM 110.–.

Hasegawa, Seikan: *The Cave of Poison Grass, Essays on the Hannya Sutra.* No. 1 in: Companions of Zen Training. Great Ocean Publ., Virginia 1975. 182 pp. $ 10.–.

Heissig, Walther: *Materialien zur Sprache und Literatur der Mongolen von Afghanistan.* Vol. 2 in: Schriftliche Quellen in Mogoli. Rhein.-Westfäl. Akad. der Wissensch., Abhandl. b. Kl. Nr. 50, Düsseldorf 1974. 584 pp. DM 120.–.

Herrman, H.: *Ursprung und Funktion der Prophetie im alten Israel.* Westd. Verl., Wiesbaden 1976.

Herrmann, H.: *Symbolik der Religionen.* Vols 4, 8, 18, 19. Hiersemann Verl., Stuttgart 1975.

Hill, D. R.: Al-Jazarī: *The Book of Ingenious Devices.* Reidel Publ. Comp., Dordrecht 1973.

Hucker, Charles O.: *China's Imperial Past.* Stanford Univ., Stanford 1975. 474 pp. $ 17.50.

Ichimura, Shinichi (ed.): *The Economic Development of East and SE Asia.* Univ. Hawaii, Honolulu 1975. 393 pp. $ 10.00.

Ike, Nobutaka: *Japan – the New Superstate.* Freeman & Co. Ltd., Reading 1974. 121 pp. £ 3.40.

Jacobi, J.: *Grammatik des thumischen Neuaramäisch (Nordostsyrien).* Vol. 40(3) in: AKM. Steiner Verl., Wiesbaden 1975. DM 28.–.

Jaki, Stanley L.: *Science and Creation. From Eternal Cycles to an Oscillating Universe.* Scott. Acad., Edinburgh 1974. 367 pp. £ 4.50.

Janssen, J. J.: *Commodity Prices from the Ramessid Period.* Brill Publ., Leiden 1975. 180 Guilders.

Jensen, Erik: *The Iban and their Religion* in: Oxford Monographs in Social Anthropology. Oxford Univ., London 1975. 242 pp. £ 4.50.

Jettmar, K.: *Die Holztempel des oberen Kulutales.* Vol. 2 in: Beiträge zur Südasien-Forschung. Steiner Verl., Wiesbaden 1975. DM 28.–.

Jettmar, K., Schuyler & Klimburg: *Die Religionen des Hindukusch.* Vol. 4(1) in: Reihe Religionen der Menschheit. Kohlhammer Verl., Stuttgart 1975. 528 pp. DM 98.–.

Joshi, S. D. (ed.): *Patanjali's Vyākarana-Mahābhāṣya.* No. 9 in: Publications of the Centre of Advanced Study in Sanskrit, Class C. Univ. Poona, Poona 1974. 252 pp.

Joshi, S. D., & Roodbergen: *Patanjali's Vyākarana-Mahābhāṣya, Kārakāhnika.* No. 10 in: Publications of the Centre of Advanced Study in Sanskrit, Class C. Univ. Poona, Poona 1975. 302 pp.

Journal of the American Research Center in Egypt. Vol. 9. Augustin Incorp. Publ., New York 1974. 60 pp. $ 20.00.

Kakuk, Suzanne: *Recherches sur l'histoire de la langue osmanlie des XVIe et XVIe siècles.* Mouton & Co., The Hague 1973. 660 pp. 140 Fl.

Kaschewsky, R., Sagaster & Weiers: *Serta Tibeto-Mongolica.* Sem. f. Sprach- u. Kulturwissensch. Zentralasiens d. Univ. Bonn, Wiesbaden 1973. 379 pp.

Kato, Hidetoshi: *Japanese Research on Mass Communication: Selected Abstracts.* Univ. Hawaii, Honolulu 1974. 128 pp. $ 3.50.

Kerr, George H.: *Formosa: Licensed Revolution and the Home Rule Movement,* 1895–1945. Univ. Hawaii, Honolulu 1974. 265 pp. $ 12.50.

Knauth, Wolfgang & Nadjmabadi: *Das altiranische Fürstenideal von Xenophon bis Ferdousi.* Steiner Verl., Wiesbaden 1975. 235 pp. DM 38.–.

Kurodia, Yasumasa: *Reed Town, Japan.* Univ. Hawaii, Honolulu 1974. 283 pp. $ 12.00.

Kutscher, E. Y.: *Studies in Galilean Aramaic.* Bar-Ilan Univ., Jerusalem 1976. 114 pp.

Lebra, Takie Sugiyama: *Japanese Culture and Behavior.* Univ. Hawaii, Honolulu 1974. 459 pp. $ 5.95.

Lee, Peter H.: *Flowers of Fire.* Univ. Hawaii, Honolulu 1974. 484 pp. $ 12.00.

Lewicki, Tadeusz: *Études maghrébines et soudanaises.* Vol. 1 in: Editions scientifiques de Pologne. Acad. Pol. des Sci., Comité des Études orientales. Warzawa 1976. 94 pp.

Lind, Andrew W.: *Nanyang Perspective – Chinese Students in Multiracial Singapore.* Vol. 13 in: Asian Studies at Hawaii. Univ. Hawaii, Honolulu 1974. 292 pp. $ 6.00.

Löfgren, Oscar & Traini: *Catalogue of the Arabic Manuscripts in the Biblioteca Ambrosiana.* Vol. 1 in: Antico Fondo and Medio Fondo. Biblio. Ambros., Milano 1975. 253 pp.

Macomber, William F.: *A Catalogue of Ethiopian Manuscripts microfilmed for the Ethiopian Manuscript Microfilm Library,* Collegeville 1975. $ 8.50.

Mason, Herbert W. (ed.): *Humaniora Islamica.* Vol. 1. Mouton & Co., The Hague 1973. 284 pp. 44. – Guilders.

Miller, Roy A.: *The Footprints of Buddha. An Eight-Century Old Japanese Poetic Sequence.* Vol. 58 in: American Oriental Series. Am. Or. Soc., New Haven 1975. 185 pp.

Miquel, André: *La géographie humaine du monde musulman* *jusqu'au milieu du 11e siècle.* Vol. 37 in: Civilisations et Sociétés. École Prat. Haut. Étud., Paris 1975. 696 pp.

Mojumdar, Kanchanmoy: *Nepal and the Indian Nationalist Movement.* Mukhopadhyay, Calcutta 1975. 110 pp. 27 rupees.

Monumenta V & Indices. Les douces actes du Bouddha. Akad. Kiado, Budapest 1974. 514 pp. $ 6.00. Ind.: 178 pp. $ 17.00.

Monumenta VI. Histoire secrète des Mongols. Akad. Kiado, Budapest 1974. 202 pp. $ 8.00.

Moscotti, Albert D.: *British Policy and Nationalist Movement in Burma.* Vol. 11 in: Asian Studies at Hawaii. Univ. Hawaii, Honolulu 1974. 264 pp. $ 5.00.

Museum Notes. Vol. 19. The Am. Numism. Soc., New York 1974. 294 pp. $ 15.00.

Nguyen, Phu Phong: *Le syntagme verbal en vietnamien.* Mouton, The Hague 1976. 20 Guilders.

Nishiyama, Sen (ed.): *Expressing the Japanese Mind in English.* The Japan Found., Tokyo 1975. 194 pp. 925 Yen.

Okita, Saburo: *Japan in the World Economy.* The Japan Found., Tokyo 1975. 235 pp. $ 6.00.

Pal, P.: *Bronzes of Kashmir.* Akad. Druck- u. Verlag., Graz 1975. 255 pp.

Paproth, Hans-Joachim: I. Bärenjagdriten und Bärenfeste bei den tungusischen Völkern. Studien über das Bärenzeremoniell. Vol. 15 in: Skrifter. Uppsala Univ., Uppsala 1976. 366 p. (Inaug. disse.)

Petersen, Erling Ladewig: *Ali and Mu'awiya in Early Arabic Tradition.* (Repr. 1964 edit. suppl. bu 2 earlier papers) Vol. 18 in: Studies in History and Social Sciences. Odense Univ., Odense 1974. 264 pp. Dkr. 60.00.

Raymond, André: *Artisans et Commercants au Caïre au XVIIIe Siecle.* Vols 1–2. Inst. Franc. Damas, Damas 1973. 372 pp. & 910 pp.

Salonen, Erkki: *Neubabylonische Urkunden verschiedenen Inhalts I.* Vol. 188 in: Sarja, Serie B. Acad. Scient. Fenn., Helsinki 1975.

Sawyer, John F. A.: *A Modern Introduction to Biblical Hebrew.* Oriel Press Prod., London 1976. 216 pp. £ 4.00.

Scharpe, A.: *Kalidasa-Lexicon.* Vol. 1, part 2. Rijksuniv. Gent, Gent 1975. 276 pp. BF 1300.–.

Shihata, Ibrahim: *The Case for the Arab Oil Embargo.* No. 2 in: Monograph Series. Inst. Palestine Stud., Beirut 1975. 114 pp. $ 5.00.

Smith, Robert J.: *Ancestor Worship in Contemporary Japan.* Stanford Univ., Stanford 1974. 266 pp. $ 12.50.

Soden, Wolfram von: *Akkadisches Handwörterbuch.* Vol. 3(12). Verl. Harrassowitz. Wiesbaden 1974. 96 pp. DM 46.

Staal, Frits: *Exploring Mysticism.* California 1975. 230 pp.

Stein, Burton (ed.): *Essays on South India.* Vol. 15 in: Asian Studies at Hawaii. Univ. Hawaii, Honolulu 1976. 213 pp. $ 8.50.

Steinbach, R.: *Dat al-Himma.* Vol. 4 in: Freiburger Islamstudien. Steiner Verl., Wiesbaden 1975. DM 46.

Stevens, Robert D., Alavi & Bertocci: Rural Development in Bangladesh and Pakitan. Univ. Hawaii, Honolulu 1976. 399 pp.

Sublet, Jaqueline (ed.): *Ibn as-Suqa'i: Tali Kitab Wafayat al-A'Yan, 'Un fonctionnaire chrétien dans l'administration mamelouke'.* Inst. Franc. Damas, Damas 1975. 284 pp.

Tietze, Andreas: *Mustaf Ali's Description of Cairo* 1599. Österreich. Akad. der Wissensch., Wien 1975. 177 pp. 89 pl. ö.S.720.–.

Tiliander, Bror: *Christian and Hindu Terminology.* Vol. 12 in: Skrifter. Uppsala Univ., Uppsala 1974. 310 pp. Swcr 40.00. (Inaug. diss.).

Trenckner, V. (ed.): *A Critical Pali Dictionary.* Roy. Dan. Acad. Sci. Lett., Copenhagen 1973. Vol. 2(8): 345–92 pp.

Tyloch, Witold (ed.): Problemy literatur orientalnych. Polska Akad. NAUK, Warzawa-Krakow 1974. 347 pp. 90.00 zloty.

Weiers, Michael: *Schriftliche Quellen in Mógoli, 2. Teil: Bearbeitung der Texte.* Vol. 59 in: Abhandl. Rhein.-Westfäl. Akad. Wissensch., Wiesbaden 1975.

Wenk, Klaus: *Verzeichnis der orientalischen Handschriften in Deutschland.* Vol. 32 in: Laotische Handschriften. Steiner Verl., Wiesbaden 1975. 125 pp. DM 52.–.

Wolf, Arthur P. (ed.): *Religion and Ritual in Chinese Society.* Stanford Univ., Stanford 1974. 377 pp. $ 15.00.